



Fall 2018

# Sacred Heart University Scholar, Volume 2, Number 1

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.sacredheart.edu/shuscholar>



Part of the [Scholarship of Teaching and Learning Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

. "Sacred Heart University Scholar, Volume 2, Number 1." *Sacred Heart University Scholar*, vol. 2, no.1, 2018,  
<https://digitalcommons.sacredheart.edu/shuscholar/vol2/iss1/6>

This Full Issue is brought to you for free and open access by DigitalCommons@SHU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Sacred Heart University Scholar by an authorized editor of DigitalCommons@SHU. For more information, please contact [ferribyp@sacredheart.edu](mailto:ferribyp@sacredheart.edu), [lysobeyb@sacredheart.edu](mailto:lysobeyb@sacredheart.edu).

***Sacred Heart University Scholar***  
Volume 2, Number 1 (Fall 2018)

**Table of Contents**

**Hawthorne's "The Birthmark" as an Introduction to  
the Modern Debate of Eugenics**

Eve Papa

**Thinking Inclusion: Analysis of Grandin's Strategies for  
Including Students with Autism in the Classroom**

Julia Fama

**The Role of Institutions, Islamism, and Militaries in  
the Outcomes of the Arab Spring:**

**The Cases of Tunisia, Egypt, and Syria**

Olivia Delmonico

**A Partnership Between Nursing Faculty, Students, and  
Urban Community Centers to Provide Vision Screenings  
for Low-income Immigrant Women: An Experiential Case Study**

Rose C. O'Halloran, Kerry A. Milner, and Kim Foito

## Hawthorne's "The Birthmark" as an Introduction to the Modern Debate of Eugenics

Eve Papa<sup>1</sup>

*Abstract: This article will contribute to the current debate about eugenics through an analysis of Nathaniel Hawthorne's "The Birthmark." This will concern the story's theme and character development, as well the period in which it was written. Of particular interest will be main character's fixation on the correction of disability in the seemingly isolated world in which he lives. Also relevant is the research of Napier and Garland-Thomson and the literature on disabilities.*

"The Birthmark" by Nathaniel Hawthorne raises intricate questions about disability and its implications, ranging from how society defines disabilities to if and how it believes they should be corrected. Aylmer, the main character, views the birthmark of his wife, Georgiana, as a disability and becomes obsessed with its scientific removal in the name of reason.

Although there was no name for the scientific wiping out of what society deems to be inadequate when the literary piece was first published, today it is known as "eugenics." The Oxford English Dictionary (OED) defines the adjective "eugenic" as: "pertaining or adapted to the production of fine offspring, esp. in the human race." Hawthorne's work is well ahead of its time, as the modern questions of viewing disability as imperfection and of ridding society of this purported burden come into play through his work of fiction.

Eugenics can be seen in various different forms (both positive and negative) throughout history and all over the world, from Adolf Hitler's interest in creating an Aryan race to the modern science that allows the removal of genes for certain diseases from embryos. This genetic engineering to remove or create a certain type of human in society is a largely debated question, and Hawthorne perhaps, without even realizing it, started the conversation. According to the OED, the word's earliest roots can be traced back to 1883, which is approximately 40 years after the publication of Hawthorne's short story. Although the study of eugenics came after the publication, there is certainly room to explore how Aylmer's psychological fixation on the removal of a physical blemish speaks to the contemporary debate.

It is worth noting that Hawthorne scholars tend to focus on the study of the story as either a general literary work or an analysis of feminism and women's domestic rights—few, if any, examine disability. There has not yet been a focus on

---

<sup>1</sup> Contact: Eve Papa, Sacred Heart University Class of 2019, [papae116@mail.sacredheart.edu](mailto:papae116@mail.sacredheart.edu). Special thanks to my English professor and advisor, Dr. Cara Kilgallen.

Aylmer's character as more than just a mad scientist; he is a mad scientist attempting to play God. And in taking it upon himself to decide what features of his wife can stay and what must go, Aylmer takes a stance that argues for disability as being something negative and poisonous that must be wiped out of society. In writing such a character, Hawthorne has provided both the disability and eugenics debates with an important piece of literature. In examining the relationship between a couple and their views of a physical blemish, Hawthorne speaks to the big-picture question: should science view disability as a defect and be working towards removing it entirely? Or does disability contribute to society and provide diverse personalities and ideas?

"The Birthmark" involves the dispute as to whether Georgiana's birthmark helps or hurts her, as well as Aylmer's scientific obsession with removing it from her face as a driving force. The development of Aylmer as he shifts from acceptance of his wife's differences to hatred for her physical imperfection highlights the general foundation of eugenics. Aylmer's fixation is on his wife's birthmark, which resembles a small, red hand placed on her left cheek. Some view it as beauty, while others view it as a flaw. Hawthorne's writes:

Georgiana's lovers were wont to say that some fairy at her birth hour had laid her tiny hand upon the infant's cheek, and left this impress there in token of the magic endowments that were to give her such sway over all hearts.... Some fastidious persons – but they were exclusively of her own sex – affirmed that the bloody hand, as they chose to call it, quite destroyed the effect of Georgiana's beauty, and rendered her countenance even hideous. (Hawthorne 1022)

The people who surround Georgiana are torn on how to feel about her blemish. Some believe that it makes her who she is, but some believe she would be a better person without it. The hand holds a possibly equal version of both good and bad. The good is the uniqueness that the birthmark instills in her; it is the way in which she stands out as beautiful to the people around her who view her as a positive kind of different. The bad is the physical branding that lives on her face; it is the red hand that slapped Georgiana across the cheek and marked her as imperfect, flawed, and possibly evil.

This theme of the short story directly portrays society's views and questions on disability. Is disability something that makes a person who they are, or is it a burden that should be removed if possible? Aylmer believes the latter—that Georgiana's birthmark brings her down and renders her a damaged individual. His obsession with removing it speaks to the part of society that believes disability to be a burden, an inconvenience, and essentially, a fluke in the system. He will stop at

nothing to make sure her birthmark is removed for the sake of her beauty, the comfort of those around her, and his personal convictions.

Aylmer's solution to erasing this "fluke" from their lives is to use his scientific research and resources. Though there is great danger involved in an experiment like this, he is convinced that the risk is worth the potential reward. As each day goes on and he delves further into his research, Aylmer's discontent with the small, red hand on his wife's cheek grows stronger and stronger. This dissatisfaction grows into loathing, and it comes to the point where he would rather see her die than see her live with what he views to be a disability. The reason he is so willing to put his wife in danger is because he believes that if it is impossible to remove such a blemish from her body, then her life is not worth living. Aylmer speaks for a societal desire of seeking perfection as he attempts to wipe out his wife's undesirable characteristic, which he believes stands in the way of her being a complete human. Ultimately, his obsession with creating the perfect woman in his wife kills her, and the discovery that perfection is unattainable and perhaps even an emotional illusion is profound.

Elizabeth R. Napier highlights and analyzes Aylmer's fixation on the removal of his wife's birthmark. Napier argues that Aylmer's character serves as a "separation artist" in the story, as in a man who is interested in playing God and separating entities that should not necessarily be separated. Beginning as a man who loves his wife for everything she is and is not, he fully appreciates her personality, beauty, and the birthmark on her cheek as characteristics that make her unique and lovable. His gradual scientific and eugenic obsession, which is almost nonexistent in the beginning, forces him into the fixation on separating his wife from her physical flaw. Napier contends:

He is guilty not only of Georgiana's death but – like Miles Coverdale and the Puritan society that condemned Hester Prynne – of a more abstract, spiritual crime: the violation of psychological integrity. Aylmer's attempt to "separate out" the single, unknown part of Georgiana's psyche indicates an ominous and tragic inability to deal with the complexity of being human. (Napier 34)

A major motif throughout the story is the attempt to separate opposites that live together, and the fundamental attempt of separation on Aylmer's part is to remove Georgiana from her disability. This "complexity of being human" that Napier describes is the situation that every person on Earth is dealt a certain hand, and to be human is to take life as it comes. Aylmer's refusal to accept Georgiana's circumstances is crucially depicted as unnatural and as disturbing the way her life and body are meant to be. In attempting to fix her, despite what God or the universe or whatever dictating force wants, Aylmer kills her, but not before destroying her psyche.

To further the lens through which this conflict of disability can be viewed: the theme of separation does not stop with Aylmer's desire to separate the birthmark from his wife. His hope, at a larger and more metaphoric scale, is to separate the previous societal views of enlightenment to the more recent (at the time of publication) views of romanticism. "The Birthmark", which was written during the romantic period, certainly displays the period's emphasis on individuality, emotions, and self-expression. Hawthorne's story focuses on the relationship between Aylmer and Georgiana, the debate as to what makes Georgiana a validated individual, and how Aylmer feels about all of this.

But Aylmer, who is in a certain sense a more traditional man, holds fast to the previous views of science and reason, in his attempt to remove the main characteristic that makes Georgiana *Georgiana*. He believes, in an older fashion, in his capacity to differentiate right from wrong through the use of science and logic, which aligns with the goals of the enlightenment.

Aylmer's dependence on logic, however, only gets him so far; science is not telling him nearly as much as he believes it is. It ultimately only gets him as far as this: the birthmark (which represents romanticism) needs to be removed because it makes Georgiana different; science (which represents reason) will solve this problem for his wife. As Aylmer drags Georgiana through his reasoned battle against an entire school of thought, he works tirelessly and endlessly towards a eugenic answer that will never come—all at the expense of individual expression.

Rosemarie Garland-Thomson's article "Eugenics" explains the historical and widespread existence of eugenics around the world. Eugenics can describe a wide range of societal practices, and Garland-Thomson breaks it up into two major categories: tribal and modern. The tribal category encompasses any methods of controlling the population through barbaric means, such as rape and murder. Nazi Germany's attempt to extinguish an entire race of people, for example, falls under the tribal grouping. However, the modern category describes the methods of scientifically controlling reproduction by choice. For example, the choice of pregnant mothers to have their unborn children tested for disease or to have their children's embryos handled to contain certain genes fall under the modern grouping. Garland-Thomson explains the contemporary presence of eugenics in terms of reproduction manipulation:

Understood as voluntary rather than imposed, the use of reproductive technology to sculpt individuals, families, and larger groups responds to cultural attitudes and ideologies about what kinds of people are valuable and desirable and what kinds are not. (Garland-Thomson 77)

This idea of humans having the power to dictate what kinds of genes and

characteristics should and should not exist among their species is a growing debate as science becomes more powerful. The concept of humans “playing God” now frequently comes into question, as the line for where to stop with genetic engineering is quite blurred. The discussion of eugenics, whether intended or not, involves the act of deciding what kinds of people and what kinds of traits are worthy of survival. The blurring of boundaries regarding manipulation of the human species raises a multitude of questions involving the use of science to “correct” society. Moreover, the debate of eugenics concerns the questions of whether humans should be able to control the genetic makeup of their species, what genes are worthy of survival, and to what extent this manipulation should be permitted.

Aylmer’s decision to remove the birthmark illustrates certain opinions in the debate of eugenics that argue for working to create a more perfect world of people. Individuals in a position of “perfection” who do not have disabilities themselves, such as Aylmer, may be more inclined than those who do have disabilities to argue that certain human characteristics must go. However, in the perspective of those with disabilities, certain characteristics could be argued as worth keeping among the human population. For example, in her autobiography, *Thinking in Pictures*, Temple Grandin, argues for the protection of autism in society with the belief that individuals with autism can contribute to society in certain ways that those without autism cannot. As she contends:

There are numerous interest groups run by people on the autism/Asperger spectrum and many of them are upset about attempts to eliminate autism... In an ideal world the scientist should find a method to prevent the most severe forms of autism but allow the milder forms to survive. (Grandin 122)

As an individual with autism herself, she explains in her book the unique mental processes of people with autism and offers insight as to how these processes are successful in providing society with ingenuity. She believes that if autism were to be wiped out entirely, a multitude of potential creative ideas could disappear with it. Grandin’s opinions on the preservation of the milder forms of her disability in society, with the argument that they contribute positively through unique and individual points of view, adds a key perspective to the debate of modern eugenics. Grandin’s argument serves as an example for disabled individuals who wish to defend their circumstances, and it goes against Aylmer’s desire to make the executive decision for his wife to remove her disability. There are two sides to every story, and it is equally important to pay attention to how people with disabilities feel on this topic.

The modern debate of eugenics is rooted in various opinions, perspectives, and views of how society should and should not be. As opposed to more historic, barbaric forms of human species manipulation, eugenics today seeks to control the

population through science and by a certain degree of choice. It is now easier than ever for parents to decide what genes their children's DNA will and will not hold. On the one hand, gene selection can be helpful in allowing a child to be healthy and to avoid being born with debilitating diseases. On the other hand, playing God can be a dangerous thing. Is it morally correct to be deciding which disabilities can survive and which cannot?

And although the genetic engineering of today is mostly limited to avoiding disease, who is to say that parents one day will not opt out of choosing their babies' physical traits, such as eye and hair color, height, and intelligence levels? And even when it comes to favoring certain genetic characteristics over others, is it right to "play God?" Is the human population speeding up evolution by deciding to do what it believes to be right? What if creating the perfect population could have grave repercussions?

It is impossible to discuss eugenics without delving into more and more questions. The opinions and arguments involved in the debate of this controversial topic are varied and multifaceted. The ultimate consensus, if there is any, is that science can be helpful in prolonging the human life and promoting wellness throughout the world. However, there needs to be an agreement on where to draw the line, and at what point the Aylmers of the world need to stop mixing their potions. This is the part where governments and lawmakers should step in and take action. As the members who make up a global society, humans of all abilities, need to come together to protect what is right for all parties involved. The ultimate question that the debates on eugenics need to answer in order to come to a potential conclusion—and that Hawthorne successfully raised before the debate even began—is: what constitutes a genetic characteristic that should be kept (if scientifically possible) from existing in the human species? And who gets the right to decide? Although the Aylmers of the world strive for utopian living and want every human to be perfect, what would a world without Georgianas be?

### **Works Cited**

- "Eugenic, adj. and n." *OED Online*, Oxford University Press, June 2017, [www.oed.com/view/Entry/64958](http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/64958). Accessed 12 December 2017.
- Garland-Thomson, Rosemarie. "Eugenics." *Keywords for Disability Studies*, edited by Rachel Adams et al., NYU Press, 2015, pp. 74–79.
- Grandin, Temple. *Thinking in Pictures: My Life with Autism*. New York: Vintage Books, 2006.
- Hawthorne, Nathaniel. "The Birthmark." 1843.

Napier, Elizabeth R. "Aylmer as 'Scheidekünstler': The Pattern of Union and Separation in Hawthorne's 'The Birthmark.'" *South Atlantic Bulletin*, vol. 41, no. 4, 1976, pp. 32–35.

## **Thinking Inclusion: Analysis of Grandin's Strategies for Including Students with Autism in the Classroom**

Julia Fama<sup>2</sup>

*Abstract: This article will focus on how to include students with autism in mainstream schools effectively. I draw on the anecdotal evidence shared by Temple Grandin in her autobiography, Thinking in Pictures: My Life with Autism. In the text, Grandin argues for: (1) the inclusion of students' fixations in the classroom, (2) the benefits of social interaction between students with autism and typically developing students, (3) the maintenance of structured activities, and (4) the importance of supportive college professors. I contend that while Thinking in Pictures proposes ideas for successful inclusion, it does not include a sufficient amount of research to support its arguments. That said, others in the field of education support and extend Grandin's claims.*

In her autobiography, *Thinking in Pictures: My Life with Autism*, Temple Grandin shares with readers her candid experience with autism. Readers can gain a clearer understanding as to what life is like for someone living with the disability. In addition to personal stories from her own life, her book contains factual information about autism. However, in the section on education, Grandin does not take the opportunity to write about the findings of professional educators. In this section, it is clear Grandin feels strongly about the inclusion of students with autism in mainstream schools, and she makes several suggestions as to how children with autism should be educated to ensure they receive the greatest possible opportunity to succeed: "When an educational program is successful the child will act less autistic" (Grandin 102). For Grandin, characteristics of a successful educational program include the use of students' fixations in the classroom, social interaction between students with autism and typically developing students, structured activities, and supportive professors. Although Grandin proposes ideas as to how to include students with autism in mainstream classrooms effectively based on her own experience, she fails to support her claims with adequate research. I argue that Grandin would have made a stronger case if she had included more evidence from professionals in the field of education in support of her ideas.

Grandin argues it is important for teachers to acknowledge their students' fixations. To support her argument, Grandin draws on the psychiatrist, Leo Kanner, who writes:

---

<sup>2</sup> I would like to thank Professor Cara Kilgallen for her guidance and valuable support. Direct all correspondence to [julia.fama@outlook.com](mailto:julia.fama@outlook.com).

Many children with autism become fixated on various subjects. Some teachers make the mistake of trying to stamp out the fixation. Instead, they should broaden it and channel it into constructive activities. For example, if a child becomes infatuated with boats, then use boats to motivate him to read and do math. Leo Kanner stated that the path to success for some people with autism was to channel their fixation into a career. (Grandin 104)

Grandin asserts that teachers must utilize students' special interests as a tool to help them learn. Although Grandin cites Kanner as a reference for this idea, the argument Grandin references does not give details on how teachers could incorporate students' fixations in the classroom with other students. Instead, Kanner states that some individuals with autism have found success by creating a career around their fixation. While Kanner's findings may be accurate, Grandin does not reference any connection to teachers utilizing a student's fixation.

Rhea Paul addresses the issue of students with autism becoming fixated on a particular subject. Paul agrees with Grandin that teachers should not force the student to abandon their fixation. However, she does not believe that the teacher should simply use a student's fixation as a way to motivate the student to do their work. Instead, as an expert in the field, she believes that teachers should find a way to incorporate students' special interest into their classrooms. Teachers should figure out a way to relate it to the curriculum instead of encouraging the student to stray away from it. By doing so, they will help to keep the student engaged in the lesson and include them in with the rest of the class (Paul).

In addition, Grandin touches upon the importance of having supportive classmates. However, she does not back up her ideas with additional sources and excludes significant details:

I was enrolled in a normal kindergarten at a small elementary school. Each class had only twelve to fourteen pupils and an experienced teacher who knew how to put firm but fair limits on children to control behavior. The day before I entered kindergarten, Mother attended the class and explained to the other children that they needed to help me. This prevented teasing and created a better learning environment. (Grandin 101)

Grandin hints at the idea of social supports but does not explain the methods which can result in positive interactions. Instead, she describes how her mother encouraged her classmates to be supportive of her. Although the inclusion of this personal narrative can help to illustrate Grandin's experience with social supports, in order for readers to be convinced that social supports are effective, they must know the "how" and "why" behind them. Grandin might have included evidence that states the importance of social supports. In addition, Grandin should give examples of

teachers implementing these classroom practices in addition to the example of her mother. While parents play a vital role in the education of their child, teachers are the masters of their classrooms and are responsible for the majority of interactions that take place within them.

According to Paul, social supports are powerful ways for students with autism to learn and develop social skills that will help them throughout their lives. Therefore, Paul recommends enlisting the student's peers to help them gain these skills. Teachers should guide classmates to the understanding that working with children with autism can be "fun." She provides several examples for teachers. One way to implement social supports is through "buddy time," which is an effective way for younger students to work together. During buddy time, students alternate among partners with whom they "stay, play, and talk."

Furthermore, for older students, Paul recommends cooperative learning groups. Students in cooperative learning groups are given assignments to which each member has to contribute. These assignments allow students to work together as a group to figure out how to get the student with autism involved. She also advocates peer networks. This involves gathering approximately five students to serve as social supports for students with autism. Each day, each student is assigned to support the student with autism for 20 minutes. These 20 minutes may be during lunch, recess, etc. This activity is productive because it increases the social opportunities for the autistic child.

In addition to teachers encouraging group activities and social interaction amongst students, it is also important to maintain a structured classroom. Grandin addresses this concept in her text: "It is important for an autistic child to have structured activities both at home and at schools. Meals were always at the same time" (Grandin 101). Through her personal experiences, Grandin understands the value of having structured activities. However, her experience with dinner is not enough to persuade her readers on the value of structured activities. She does not provide any scenarios of structured activities in the classroom, nor does she explain why it is important for teachers to design structured activities for students with autism.

Both Paul and Friedlander supply their audience with several strategies to ensure a comfortable environment for students with autism. Paul calls this concept, "Making the environment understandable." She recommends teachers decorate the classroom with signs and posters so students with autism can easily see what is happening. In addition, she advocates visual schedules posted either given to the student with autism individually or displayed at the front of the room for the whole class to see. A visual schedule is one that maps out the class' entire agenda with pictures. According to Paul, the best types of visual schedules for students with

autism are ones that allow students to remove an activity after it has been completed. By removing the image of the activity, students with autism can visually confirm that the activity is over, so they no longer need to finish it.

Friedlander further explains the significance of the seemingly small act of removing an image from the visual schedule, which can help ease the uncertainty of time and transitions by providing notice in advance and giving the child a visual cue as to what comes next. Also, removing the image may increase their comfort level and help the child better internalize change. Finally, Friedlander argues, participation in switching the images helps the child to understand and accept the change (142).

Additionally, both professionals argue scheduling helps to predict when a child may experience difficulty throughout the day. They suggest teachers practice priming and rehearsing an activity prior to exposure. Having a trial will allow time for the student to adjust to the new situation. Friedlander includes the example of a student with autism adapting to a noisy cafeteria. Strategies for handling this situation include, eating comfort foods from home, assigning a seat for him to sit in, telling him exactly how much time he has to eat before he should clean up, and assigning him to a buddy that will serve as a model to help him understand lunchroom behaviors (Friedlander 142). Had Grandin included the advice given by Paul and Friedlander, her commentary on structured activities would have been more informative, rather than one strictly based on her personal experience.

In addition to discussing her K-12 experience, Grandin also discusses her experience as a student at a mainstream college. Grandin provides anecdotal evidence that addresses the importance of support from college professors:

Mr. Dion, the math teacher, spent hours with me after each class. Almost every day I went to his office and reviewed the entire day's lecture. I also had to spend hours with a tutor to get through French. For moral support there was Mrs. Eastbrook...When I got lonely or down in the dumps I went over to her house and she gave me much needed encouragement. (Grandin 106)

Grandin describes the immense support she received from her college professors. Furthermore, she credits them for getting her through college. Grandin's example creates a clear picture of how having a close relationship with her professors benefited her personally; however, it does not persuade readers to believe students with autism should have mentors. Grandin does not provide any research to explain the tremendous effect mentors can have on a college student with autism. Professional educators, Austin and Peña, provide research-based evidence which proves the benefits a college mentor has on a student with autism.

According to Austin and Peña's study, college faculty members, nominated for being exceptional mentors for students with autism, believe in forming meaningful relationships with such students. These relationships help students with autism to reach their full potential. Faculty members claim it is necessary to establish an environment in which the student with autism feels comfortable. It is more likely that the student will respond positively to feedback when they feel safe and welcomed in their environment (Austin and Peña 18). Furthermore, some students with autism do not feel that they are at the college level. Therefore, the faculty members of this study argue it is critical for college professors to nurture these students to ensure that they get to where they need to be (22).

Not only do Austin and Peña suggest professors be a mentor to students with autism, but they encourage professors to mentor their fellow faculty members as well (11). Since there is an increase in the number of students with autism attending college, they believe it is important for faculty development training to offer information on how to interact with students on the spectrum. Through these types of training, faculty members can develop the skills to work with students with autism and learn successful teaching strategies. In addition, each college should have faculty members who serve as mentors to other faculty members who may come to them with questions or concerns about teaching students with autism (Austin and Peña 11). Austin and Peña's study on exceptional college professors illustrates key points that were missed by Grandin in regards to educating individuals with autism at the college level.

Grandin would make a stronger case for the inclusion of students with autism in mainstream schools if she had incorporated statements from professional educators in her book *Thinking in Pictures: My Life with Autism*. Though the ideas proposed in the section on education are valid, the text does not explain them thoroughly enough. Personal narratives about autism have a major impact on society; they educate others and eliminate stereotypes. These types of stories are necessary for creating a change in the classroom. Adding factual evidence would not diminish Grandin's voice or the momentous impact her personal stories have on readers, but rather, make her case even more powerful.

## References

- Austin, Kimberly S. and Edlyn Vallejo Peña. "Exceptional Faculty Members Who Responsively Teach Students with Autism Spectrum Disorders." *Journal of Postsecondary Education and Disability*, vol. 30, no. 1, 01 Jan. 2017, pp. 17-32.
- Friedlander, Diana. "Sam Comes to School: Including Students with Autism in Your Classroom." *The Clearing House*, vol. 82, no. 3, 2009, pp. 141–144.
- Paul, Rhea. "Make it Work: Accommodating Students with Autism Spectrum Disorder in Mainstream Schools." Diversity Colloquium Series. Spotlight on Learners with Exceptionalities, 7 Nov. 2017, Trumbull, CT, Sacred Heart University at 101 Oakview Drive.
- Grandin, Temple. *Thinking in Pictures: My Life with Autism*. Expanded ed., Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group, 2008.

## **The Role of Institutions, Islamism, and Militaries in the Outcomes of the Arab Spring: The Cases of Tunisia, Egypt, and Syria**

Olivia Delmonico<sup>1</sup>

*Abstract. During the Arab Spring in 2011, much of the Middle Eastern world faced a series of uprisings demanding democracy and equality. Most of these attempts at revolution desperately failed, with some nations faring far worse than before. Some, however, remain more stable than others, with Tunisia being the sole full success. This article delves into the varying causes of the uprisings in Tunisia, Egypt, and Syria. These countries respectively represent the good, the bad, and the ugly outcomes of the Arab Spring.*

*Through a thorough analysis of other literature on the subject, I conclude that the success of modern Arab revolutions depends entirely on three factors: institutional disposition, involvement of the military, and the role of Islamism. In understanding the importance of these factors, the international community can learn how to effectively react to situations similar to that of 2011 and perhaps prevent horrific atrocities like that of Syria.*

### **Introduction**

What is now known as the Arab Spring consisted of a series of revolutions in the Arab world beginning in 2010. Though reasons for these revolutions vary from country to country, protestors in most cases were seeking to implement democracy, equality, and a stronger and more inclusive economy. Both violent and nonviolent protests occurred in at least twenty different territories, with major uprisings occurring in six nations: Tunisia, Libya, Egypt, Yemen, Syria, and Bahrain. With the majority of conflict slowing by 2013, it appeared that most protests of the so-called Arab Spring resulted in revolutionary failure due to being repressed by violent and often deadly governmental authorities. Both the successes and the failures of the Arab Spring are represented by the conflict and results that occurred in three countries: Tunisia, Egypt, and Syria. Respectively, these nations represent the good, the bad, and the ugly outcomes of the Arab Spring. In analyzing the rebellions and ensuing results of each country, it is clear that three factors are responsible for the achievements and deficiencies of each revolution: institutional disposition, use of military power, and role of Islamism.

This article will answer the question of why Tunisia succeeded, Egypt somewhat failed, and Syria failed entirely. Unlike other studies that separately

---

<sup>1</sup> I'd like to thank Professor Akbulut-Gok for her help with research and editing. Direct all correspondence to [delmonico@mail.sacredheart.edu](mailto:delmonico@mail.sacredheart.edu).

address the issues and results of individual countries, this study will analyze three very different nations and the consequences of their revolutions. Tunisia and Egypt are frequently compared because they are often-cited cases in the literature on the Arab Spring, but Syria is often disregarded as a disaster. Many see Syria as a lost cause and consequently ignore the factors that led to Syria being considered a failure. These factors, however, were at play in each country experiencing a revolution and, thus, knowledge of the involvement of these elements in a horrific situation like Syria is important to preventing another. This paper will delve into the components that contributed to Syria's downfall, Egypt's middle ground failure, and Tunisia's success, including the roles of institutions, the military, and Islamism in each country. It will become apparent that the severity of each of these factors is responsible for the current situations occurring in the modern Arab world. In addressing these elements and their contributions toward the very different circumstances currently at play in the Middle East, the diplomatic community can begin a productive discussion on how to facilitate stability in these countries, as well as how to prevent atrocities from happening again.

### **Revolutions, Institutions, and Democracy**

Tariq Ali defines "revolution" as "a transfer of power from one social class (or even a layer) to another that leads to fundamental change."<sup>2</sup> By this definition, failed attempts to overthrow a government are not considered revolutions. As a result, the events of the Arab Spring in Syria constitute a failed attempt at a revolution. This is because Bashar Al-Assad remains in power. Tunisia and Egypt experienced success in forcing their respective governments out of power.

A revolution can be considered a failure when it does not result in the desired change that caused the revolution in the first place. This usually involves the overthrow of a government due to demand for democracy, followed by that government being replaced with a non-democratic regime. In explaining why revolutions often fail, Karl Fitzgerald writes, "Revolutions usually finish in confusion...because, after the smoke and confusion of battle, a hastily patched up government may have given little thought about what comes next."<sup>3</sup> He goes on to prove his point by criticizing the French Revolution of 1789, in which revolutionaries wished to break free from monarchy and end the mass control by the wealthy, land-owning elite. However, not long after the end of the revolution, Napoleon declared himself emperor and the land-owning elite still amassed power. Fitzgerald writes that

---

<sup>2</sup> Tariq Ali, "What is a revolution?" *Counterpunch*, September 4, 2013, <https://www.counterpunch.org/2013/09/04/what-is-a-revolution/>.

<sup>3</sup> Karl Fitzgerald, "Do Revolutions Work?" *Earthsharing*, October 25, 2011.

the French could have achieved their goals if they addressed land taxation in a formal, planned way. Yet in being so inundated with ideas of being free from the monarchy, the French let themselves revert to the same conditions under which they had suffered before.

Fitzgerald goes on to explain the similar faults in the Russian Revolution. Here, too, revolutionaries wished to depart from economic inequality and severe mistreatment by the government. The spread of communism was thought to be a cure for these problems, but the eventual leadership of Joseph Stalin only resulted in “massive assassinations and failed economic plans cost[ing] something like thirty million lives.”<sup>4</sup> In the cases of both France and Russia, the goals of their respective revolutions were never achieved; rather, each country ended up in a condition similar to, or worse than, how they began.

In *Do Revolutions Create Good Governments?* Eli Rosenberg seconds Fitzgerald’s sentiments. Revolutions, “don’t always lead to favorable...outcomes,” writes; “In fact, there’s a long and varied history of revolutions in the world producing leaders equally if not more repressive than those they deposed.”<sup>5</sup> Rosenberg references several failed revolutions, including that of Fidel Castro’s Cuba and Mao Zedong’s China. Both regimes began as communist revolutions and resulted in severe human rights abuses. In the former case, Castro imprisoned political opponents and censored the Cuban media. In the latter, Zedong established a method of land reform that consisted of beating wealthier peasants to death and giving their land to the less wealthy. Through this, the squashing of rebellions, creation of labor camps, famine, and other methods, Zedong is thought to have killed more people than Adolf Hitler. Indeed, according to researchers at Princeton University, Zedong is believed to have caused between forty and eighty million deaths.<sup>6</sup> Both Castro and Zedong, however, began their rule as revolutionaries with promises of ending inequality. In both cases, the institutions put in place and run by these individuals, including but not limited to the secret police and the military, caused more harm than good to their respective nations.

In an interview with National Public Radio in February of 2011, Simon Schauma of Columbia University affirms the idea put forth that revolutions pose the risk of failing and leaving a nation in worse condition than before. He states, “If you don’t redirect and harness all that popular energy strategically against the institutions of power, you end up, actually, sitting in your own prison...you become a kind of museum of failed revolutionary energy.”<sup>7</sup> Schauma confirms the idea put forth by

---

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

<sup>5</sup> Eli Rosenberg, “Do Revolutions Create Good Governments?” *The Atlantic*, January 28, 2011.

<sup>6</sup> Valerie Strauss, “How Many Died?” *Washington Post*, July 17, 1994.

<sup>7</sup> Neal Conan, “The Elements of a Successful Revolution,” NPR, February 07, 2011.

Fitzgerald and Rosenberg: a successful revolution requires meticulous planning. If this effort is not exerted, it is clear that revolutionaries run the risk of not only failing to affect the desired change, but also the risk of permanently damaging the nation they vowed to fix.

In the Libyan Revolution of the Arab Spring, revolutionaries potentially damaged the country beyond repair after their killing of then-President Muammar Gaddafi. Though transitional programs did exist in the immediate aftermath, revolutionaries were not prepared to deal with the rebuilding of a torn-apart nation. In *A Critical Analysis of the Security Crisis in a Post-Gaddafi Libya*, Olajide Akanji states, "The failure to develop a coherent post-war peace-building and reconstruction agenda has undermined the political process, and the peace, stability and development of the country."<sup>8</sup> In the case of Libya, the revolution seemed successful because a dictator was eliminated and a transitional government was put into place. However, the revolutionaries' failure to recognize the necessity of rebuilding a peaceful Libya after a civil war has caused the future of Libya to be less than ideal.

In the cases of post-conflict Cuba, China, and Libya, democracy struggles to survive in nations built on the oppression of their people. Some countries like these claim to have implemented democratic procedures, but the truth is often otherwise. As a result, democratic nations must find a way to measure whether democracy is truly being implemented. In *The Third Wave: Democratization in the Late Twentieth Century*, Samuel Huntington states that he supports what he calls a two-turnover test, meaning that a country must have had two peaceful transitions of power to be considered a true democracy.<sup>9</sup> While transitions are different from revolutions, their success in a revolutionary country can help measure whether a revolution in the name of democracy was successful. If there has been a revolution for democracy in any given country, according to Huntington, that revolution would be successful if the country subsequently passes the two-turnover test. If the country fails to pass this test, the revolution failed to instate a democratic process. Tunisia is the only nation that faced protests during the Arab Spring to have passed this test.

## Islamism

In analyzing countries that have passed this two-turnover test, Huntington questions whether democracy can exist in non-Western cultures, stating that democracy has its base in the West and that it is relatively new to other cultures. In understanding Huntington's position on culture having a role in whether democracy can take root

---

<sup>8</sup> Olajide Akanji, "A Critical Analysis of the Security Crisis in a Post-Gaddafi Libya," *Africa Insight* (2015): 2.

<sup>9</sup> Samuel Huntington, *The Third Wave: Democratization in the Late Twentieth Century* (University of Oklahoma Press, 1991).

anywhere, one must also understand the Western-culture thesis put forth by George Kennan: “Democracy, in short, is appropriate only for northwestern and perhaps central European countries and their settler-colony offshoots.”<sup>10</sup> In defending this thesis, Huntington puts forth that certain cultures are hostile to democracy, with the most notable being Islamic. He tells that, though principles in Islam like egalitarianism and individualism are congruent with democracy, Islam: “rejects any distinction between the religious community and the political community...Fundamentalism Islam demands that...[Islamic scholars] have a ‘decisive vote in articulating...all governmental policy.’”<sup>11</sup> According to Huntington, Islam’s demand of precedence directly contradicts the rules of democracy. It is for this reason that so many Muslim countries have had issues forming and keeping a democracy. This does not, however, mean that revolutions and democracy cannot work in any majority Muslim nation. Rather, it means that a country determined to form a democracy must give up any theocratic elements. Citizens of a democratic nation can follow whatever religion they wish, but the government and law cannot be inherently religious.

In understanding the difficulty in merging Western life, democracy, and Islam in today’s society, many are attempting to form boundaries between Islam as a religion and Islam as an ideology. Islam as an ideology would refer to its political uses, as well as its current use in terrorism. In *Islamism: Contested Perspectives on Political Islam*, writers Abbas Barzegar and Richard Martin put forth that the terms “Islam” and “Islamism” should be used to describe different ideas. While Islam would describe the religion, Islamism would be “defined broadly to include, without being limited to, the possible use of force,” Donald Emmerson argues.<sup>12</sup> The writers are attempting to portray Islam and extremist Islam as two different things, one being a religion and the other being an ideology. In doing so, they are contradicting Huntington’s view that Islam and democracy cannot coexist. Here, two different Islamic schools of thought are brought into consideration, with one being accepting of democracy and the other not. This is because Islam itself has no objection to democracy. However, when Islam is made political, extremist leaders often use fear to force a population into following a politically motivated agenda. This idea is present in places like Saudi Arabia, where the presence of a theocracy and religious police force allow for the government to oppress women through forced veiling and the need to be accompanied.

---

<sup>10</sup> Ibid, 23.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., 28.

<sup>12</sup> Donald K. Emmerson, “Inclusive Islamism: The Utility of Diversity,” Abbas Barzegar, *Islamism: Contested Perspectives on Political Islam* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009), 26.

Though Huntington does put forth that it seems as if Islam and democracy cannot function together, he does reference countries that were almost successful at allowing the two to coexist, like Turkey and Lebanon. These nations, through attempts to limit the involvement of religion in government, were close to having both Islam and democracy present. Despite this, democracy in both countries eventually gave way to military coups or the rise of extremist organizations. Through these examples, when compared to unsuccessfully democratic nations like Pakistan, it is clear that certain levels of Islam are more compatible with democracy than others. Those present in Turkey and Lebanon, for example, have a better chance of creating a hospitable environment for democracy than those existing in Pakistan. In understanding what creates these different schools of Islamic thought, it is necessary to examine the prominence of Islam in the political system.

In understanding Islam's power in any given country, one must examine the different types of Islamic movements. *The World Almanac of Islamism* describes three different kinds of Islamic political movements: moderate movements, Salafi movements, and militant jihadism.<sup>13</sup> The first refers to movements with Islamic values that can blend in with a democratic society, while the second refers to movements that have the goal of forming a Caliphate, but only through education and nonviolence. While the first has room for the Western world, the second hopes to change the Western world or find a place in which Muslims can practice without the influence of the West. Militant jihadism, the extreme form, however, recommends the use of force to spread the message of Islam. These groups detest the existence of the Western world and often exist in the form of terrorist organizations like Al-Qaeda or the Islamic State. Different types of Islamism and Islamic political movements allow for varying levels of acceptance of democracy and revolutionary ideals and, thus, have an effect on whether or not phenomena like the Arab Spring would be successful.

### **Role of the Military**

In addition to institutions and religion, it is important to understand the role of the military when assessing the success of a revolution. Because many revolutions are stopped by force from the government, the military often has a large role in the outcome of revolutionary protest. In an interview with National Public Radio in February 2011, Neal Conan stated, "The idea that we in the United States have, that the purposes of armies are to fight and win wars, is not necessarily true in much of the world, where the purposes of armies are to keep the regime in power."<sup>14</sup> The idea

---

<sup>13</sup> American Foreign Policy Council, *The World Almanac of Islamism* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2014).

<sup>14</sup> Conan.

of the military in developing countries having much more power over citizens has a tremendous effect on the outcome of a revolution because when a dictator has an entire army on his side, he likely has access to more weapons and more people than revolutionaries do.

In *The Role of Armed Forces in the Arab Uprisings*, Derek Lutterbeck explains that nearly all Arab countries have military-based regimes. He goes on to say, however, that the role of each of these militaries varies significantly from one country to the next. The fact that most militaries are automatically on the side of the regime immediately makes any attempt at a revolution that much more difficult because, if need be, revolutionaries must now create an army large enough and skilled enough to fight a trained one. Lutterbeck writes, "While all Arab regimes facing challenges from pro-democracy movements have called upon their militaries to confront these popular uprisings, the armed forces have responded quite differently across the region, ranging from openness to, and even support for, protest movements to internal fracturing or firm support for the regime in power."<sup>15</sup> The importance of the military's position is crucial, as the military can often end an uprising in minutes if it is on the side of the government. On the other hand, if the military sides with the protesters, they can become seemingly invincible.

The importance of the military in revolutions is not unique to the Arab Spring. In *The French Revolution and the Role of Napoleon Bonaparte*, writer Haroun Alfarsi states that the revolution began as a coup d'état.<sup>16</sup> The military's decision to overthrow the government had much to do with the revolution actually taking leaders out of power. Had Napoleon not been commander in the army, he would likely not have had the power to truly cause change in France. His access to the military allowed for him to direct the revolution in any way he wished. The same success of ousting a leader using the military can be said of the Russian Revolution. On their own, citizens would not have had the power or the numbers to overthrow an entire regime and its army. Once a leader loses armed support, he or she often begins to lose the fight against revolutionaries as a whole. In analyzing the role of military forces in the Arab Spring, it will become clear that how the military was involved played a large role in whether the revolution turned into a massacre or a success story.

---

<sup>15</sup> Derek Lutterbeck, "The Role of Armed Forces in the Arab Uprisings," *Arab Uprisings and Armed Forces: Between Openness and Resistance*, Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces (2011), 5.

<sup>16</sup> Haroun Alfarsi, "The French Revolution and the Role of Napoleon Bonaparte," *Version Daily*, August 06, 2016; accessed March 1, 2018, <http://www.versiondaily.com/french-revolution-and-the-role-of-napoleon-bonaparte/>

## Findings

*Tunisia.* Tunisia achieved independence from France in 1956 and was declared a republic and succumbed to a military coup over thirty years later. Following the constitution, this coup made prime minister Zine El Abidine Ben Ali the president of the nation. Ben Ali's Tunisia was characterized by high unemployment, severe corruption, and repression of protests against the president. On December 17, 2010, a twenty-six-year old street vendor, Mohammed Bouazizi, lit himself on fire in protest of the corrupt government. When his fruit cart was confiscated by a female municipal officer, which had happened in the past, Bouazizi was unable to pay a bribe to keep the cart. Fuming, he went to the governor's office demanding his scales back and, when denied entrance, poured gasoline over himself and questioned, "How do you expect me to make a living?"<sup>17</sup> Bouazizi then dropped a match on himself, effectively starting a revolution.

Though Mohammed Bouazizi would not die until January 4, 2011, civil protests against the Ben Ali regime began shortly after the self-immolation. This reaction was not only in response to the suicide of the young vendor; it is widely perceived as a delayed reaction to WikiLeaks' publishing of several confidential documents depicting corruption and repression of citizens by Ben Ali's regime. The release's summary states, "The economic impact is clear, with Tunisian investors—fearing the long-arm of 'the [Ben Ali] Family'—forgoing new investments, keeping domestic investment rates low and unemployment high."<sup>18</sup> It continues, "Seemingly half of the Tunisian business community can claim a Ben Ali connection through marriage, and many of these relations are reported to have made the most of their lineage."<sup>19</sup> The Tunisian government soon blocked this release, as its citizens were always subjected to harsh censorship. However, the leak's impact remained known worldwide, as well as by many Tunisian citizens, and was published in European, American, and Arab newspapers. The summary concludes with, "The lack of transparency and accountability that characterize Tunisia's political system similarly plague the economy, damaging the investment climate and fueling a culture of corruption."<sup>20</sup> When Mohammed Bouazizi lit himself on fire, it was in response to both unemployment in the region and government corruption. Combined with the revelation of corruption in the country, the death of the young man was able to ignite a reaction in many Tunisian people.

---

<sup>17</sup> Rania Abouzeid, "Mohammed Bouazizi: The Man Who Set Himself and Tunisia On Fire," *Time*. January 21, 2011.

<sup>18</sup> WikiLeaks, Refs G, H. <https://wikileaks.ch/cable/2008/06/08TUNIS679.html>

<sup>19</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>20</sup> *Ibid.*

In the month following Bouazizi's death, protests over inflation, unemployment, and corruption spread throughout the nation. Nineteen percent of the Tunisian workforce was unemployed in 2011.<sup>21</sup> While some protests remained peaceful, all were met with attempts to break up the groups. On January 14, 2011, as protests continued, Ben Ali dissolved his government and declared a state of emergency. He later fled the country, ultimately arriving in Saudi Arabia. Parliamentary speaker Fouad Mebazaa was found to be the heir to the presidency and was given sixty days to organize elections. Even after the transition of power, protests continued, calling for the banning of Ben Ali's political party and the ousting of the transitional government put into place by his successors. The government eventually gave into these demands and, in October 2011, free elections were held in Tunisia. Former dissident and well-regarded human rights activist Moncef Marzouki being elected to the presidency marked the end of Ben Ali's hold on the nation. Today, Tunisia passes the "two-turnover test" for fledgling democracies put forth by Huntington, meaning that the country can be seen as a consolidated democracy due to its having had two peaceful transitions of power. The nation passed this test in October of 2014. Today, Tunisia is widely recognized as the only functioning Islamic democracy in the Middle East, as well as the only success of the Arab Spring.

In understanding that many revolutions of the Arab Spring resulted in dismal failures, Tunisia's success is very often questioned. In analyzing the revolutions in Tunisia, Egypt, and Syria, however, it is very clear that the roles of governmental institutions, Islamism, and the military are directly responsible for the countries' respective successes and failures. In the case of Tunisia, the government stepped down when it saw extreme uprisings. While its labor union worked to help both sides, its Islamist parties remain far from fundamentalist, and its military took a noble approach to the demonstrations. It is for these reasons that Tunisia remains the only success of the Arab Spring.

*Egypt.* The Egyptian revolution began on January 25, 2011. Protestors took to the streets to protest the rule of president Hosni Mubarak, demanding that he be taken out of power. Protestors from all walks of life all over Egypt were protesting the economic turmoil and lack of political freedoms in the country. This culminated in the form of demonstrations, marches, strikes, civil disobedience, and occupations. Youth groups online organized many of these events, which quickly drew thousands of attendees.

---

<sup>21</sup> Trading Economics, "Tunisian Unemployment Rate 2005-2018," <https://tradingeconomics.com/tunisia/unemployment-rate>

The rule of Mubarak began in 1981, when his predecessor was assassinated. His party maintained a one-party rule by implementing a continual state of emergency. Law under this state of emergency extended police powers, limits non-governmental activity, suspends constitutional rights, and permits several other human rights violations. Despite criticism, Mubarak asserted that this state of emergency was necessary to keep groups like the Muslim Brotherhood, which he labeled a terrorist group, suppressed. By warning against terrorism, Mubarak successfully prevented parliamentary elections from taking place, thus making any rule change nearly impossible. Had Mubarak stayed in power, his son would have inherited his rule.

Police brutality, including torture, was commonplace in Egypt. In the name of preventing terrorism, many activists were wrongfully imprisoned and left without the right to object to such imprisonment. In addition to the violation of rights and wrongful continuation of power, Egypt was plagued with widespread corruption throughout the rule of Mubarak. Many powerful businessmen were appointed to powerful government positions in exchange for their support. In late 2010, nearly forty percent of Egyptians lived on less than two United States dollars per day.<sup>22</sup> Unemployment in the nation was rampant, and most Egyptians felt failed by the government.

Following a call to action on social media, thousands of people arrived in major cities across Egypt on January 25, 2011. This continued for weeks while Mubarak maintained his position that he would not resign. Military presence in many cities was increased, while curfews were imposed and ignored. On February 10<sup>th</sup>, 2011, Mubarak announced that he would delegate some of his powers to his vice president, asserting that he would remain the head of state. The next day, the vice president announced Mubarak's resignation, leaving the rule of the country in the hands of the Supreme Council of the Armed Forces. Elections were eventually held, with the Muslim Brotherhood's Mohamed Morsi being named president.

Within a year of Mohamed Morsi's inauguration, protests against him began as well, due to his extremist Islamic views and his wish to usurp all power. He attempted to pass legislation that would allow him unlimited powers. Protests continued until his overthrow in 2013. Reeling from many issues, Egypt today remains unstable. Whether or not any of the actual goals of the revolution have been met is debatable. Fareed Zakaria states, "I recently asked a secular, liberal Egyptian from Cairo...whether the current regime feels like a return of the old order. 'Oh no,'

---

<sup>22</sup> Gokhan Akcesme, "Economic Motives Behind the 2011 Egyptian Revolution," *Calhoun: The NPS Institutional Archive* (2014).

he said, 'This one is far more brutal, repressive, and cynical than Mubarak's.'"<sup>23</sup> Despite the removal of both Mubarak and Morsi, Egypt is still not stable. It is, however, not the most horrific example of a revolution in the Arab Spring.

Egypt's institutions and Islamism allowed the revolution to fail. A rich network of mosques and corrupt businessmen in Egypt allowed for extremist parties to have the resources necessary to broadcast views to the everyday Egyptian. Despite having an authoritarian taken out of power, Egyptians were unable to move forward simply because an Islamist extremist party stepped into rule easily. The sense of Islamism in Egypt portrayed through the Muslim Brotherhood is extremist and came to power by exploiting the views of everyday, non-extremist Egyptians. Despite the failure of the revolution, however, Egypt does not represent the most horrific aftermath of the Arab Spring in the way that countries like Syria, Yemen, and Libya do. This is mainly due to the military's role in the revolution. In Egypt, the military took the side of the protestors, thus saving the nation from thousands of civilian deaths.

*Syria.* Protests began in Damascus, Syria on March 15, 2011 over demands for democracy and the release of political prisoners. Along with inspiration from other Arab Spring protests, this followed the arrest of a thirteen-year-old boy for drawing anti-governmental graffiti.<sup>24</sup> The Syrian government responded to these protests by firing into crowds. For months, protests continued with the government continuing to inflict violence on its own people. In July, several defected military officers announced the formation of the Free Syrian Army, an opposition force with the goal of taking al-Assad out of power.

Despite attempts by the United Nations to facilitate peace in Syria, conflict continued to the level of a full-fledged civil war. Islamist groups, like the Islamic State, soon entered the conflict with the hopes of gaining territory and power. The hold of important areas like the Shaar oil field by Islamist groups led to more and more conflict. As the civil war intensified, other world powers began to contribute to the war. Many Western countries, after knowledge of Assad's use of chemical weapons spread through the United Nations, took the side of rebel groups. Russia and Iran, on the other hand, backed al-Assad. With so many well-equipped world powers on either side of the conflict, violence increased.

At the end of 2017, the Islamic State in Syria was said to have been defeated by Syrian, Russian, and American forces. Despite this, the conflict in Syria continues to escalate. On April 7, 2018, a chemical attack was carried out on the city of

---

<sup>23</sup> Fareed Zakaria, "Why Democracy Took Root in Tunisia and Not Egypt," *Washington Post*, October 20, 2014.

<sup>24</sup> Kareem Fahim, "A Faceless Teenage Refugee Who Helped Ignite Syria's War," *New York Times*, February 8, 2013.

Douma, killing seventy people and injuring at least five hundred. The Syrian government denied any involvement in this attack. The United Nations Security Council, due to opposing views from Russia and the United States, could not adopt any resolution regarding inquiry into the attack. Following this, the United States, United Kingdom, and France carried out airstrikes against Syrian government targets, mostly thought to be bases for chemical weapons.

The protests in Syria began peacefully with citizens demanding democracy and the release of political prisoners. As the government continued to fight with the protestors, however, these demands eventually changed to the calling for al-Assad to step down. The president refused to do so, forcing the conflict to escalate. Today, many groups are involved in Syria's civil war, which has created an international refugee crisis. The oppressive governmental institutions of Syria, the presence of extremist Islamic groups, and the role of the military in crushing civilian uprisings ensured that the Syrian revolution would not be successful. Rather, these factors forced Syria into a full-fledged civil war.

### **Institutions**

*Tunisia.* President Zine El Abidine Ben Ali ruled Tunisia while embracing all of the power and luxuries that come with corruption. He attempted to suppress protests, and did so successfully, for many years. The leader wished to continue with this process throughout the 2010-2011 protests, even implying so in a television address on December 28, 2011, in which he put forth that the protests were unacceptable and would be met with the utmost "firmness of the law."<sup>25</sup> Ben Ali wished to crush any opponents and, when it appeared that he could not do so, he tried to discredit them.

Though the leader did denounce the motives of many protestors by deeming them violent, the president did seemingly attempt, or put forth the image that he was attempting, to understand the demands of those uprising. In an attempt to quell the unrest, Ben Ali visited Mohammed Bouazizi in the hospital in late December. The very next day, he removed his communications secretary to replace him with the minister for youth and sport. In the following weeks, the distraught leader promised the creation of 300,000 jobs and an emergency program to "Create jobs and provide 'means of subsistence' for youths that have been out of work for long periods."<sup>26</sup> Though many accuse Ben Ali's promises as a mere façade, his outward willingness to recognize the problems causing the protests was significantly helpful in Tunisia's eventual recognition and solution-building for said problems. This recognition gave

---

<sup>25</sup> Bilal Randeree, "Tunisian President Warns Protesters," *Al Jazeera*, January 03, 2011.

<sup>26</sup> "Tunisian President Removes Ministers After Protests," *Al Arabiya*, December 29, 2010.

credit to the protesters and the issues that they wished to address, while also acknowledging the government's role in solving these problems.

The rule of Ben Ali and his party was characterized as being completely corrupted. For this reason, it was not likely that the country could evolve with this ruler or his party in power. The timing of Ben Ali's decision to step down allowed Tunisia to have time to rebuild without massive atrocities. With protests beginning on December 18, 2010 and the president resigning on January 14, 2011, the revolution lasted a total of three weeks and six days. Ben Ali's resignation, though it may have been in vain, ensured that the Tunisian protestors were not simply violently crushed; they received the result that they wanted without facing mass extermination like the protestors in Syria were forced to endure.

Following Ben Ali's ousting, prime minister Mohamed Ghannouchi was briefly president. Courts then decided that parliamentary speaker Fouad Mebazaa was the rightful heir of the position. Both men attempted to establish a transitional government. Protests, however, did not stop, as the Tunisian people wished to have a government free from Ben Ali's party. Under the Tunisian Constitution, Mebazaa was given sixty days to put elections together. With the election of former dissident Moncef Marzouki months later, the reign of Ben Ali's party came to an end.

Governmental forces in Tunisia, particularly those related to Ben Ali, were known as corrupt and oppressive. Despite these traits being prevalent throughout the Arab World, Tunisia remains the only country to successfully escape from these forces and enter democracy. This is because these corrupt leaders, while they briefly did attempt to suppress the rebellion, eventually gave in to the demands of the Tunisian people. Ben Ali saw no way to control his country and left, while Mebazaa simply respected the rules put forth in his constitution. The mild nature of these dictatorial institutions allowed for Tunisia to embrace the revolution and its aftermath.

In addition to somewhat moderate authoritative governments, Tunisians in the time of the revolution had the privilege of having a national trade union center as powerful as the Tunisian General Labor Union (UGTT). The trade union became part of the National Dialogue Quartet, a group made up of UGTT, The Tunisian Human Rights League, the Tunisian Confederation of Industry, Trade, and Handicrafts, and the Tunisian Order of Lawyers. Together, these groups worked to address the national discord that followed the revolution.<sup>27</sup> According to Stanford historian Joel Beinin, the UGTT is "the single most important reason that Tunisia is a democracy today."<sup>28</sup>

---

<sup>27</sup> "The Nobel Peace Prize for 2015," Nobelprize.org, October 10, 2015.

<sup>28</sup> Safwan Masri, "Workers and Soldiers: The Role of Institutions in Tunisia's and Egypt's Revolutions," *Modalities of Revolt*, October 24, 2017,

The importance of trade unions in Tunisia can be traced back to the 1920s, which is to thank for Tunisia's robust civil society, another factor to which the nation's success can be attributed.<sup>29</sup> With well over half a million members dispersed throughout the country, UGTT has power and influence over many Tunisian people. With its original goals having to do with employment and the uprising's cry out for job opportunities, it is not surprising that the trade union was involved in the revolution. Mohamed-Salah Omri states, "The fit between the revolution and UGTT was almost natural since the main demands of the rising masses, namely jobs, national dignity, and freedom had been on the agenda of the union all along."<sup>30</sup>

The presence of UGTT helped facilitate the revolution through its being a common factor among Tunisians from different areas of the country. Large protests were held in front of UGTT centers. At these centers, protesters were able to articulate their demands and do so peacefully and with credibility. Without UGTT, it is very likely that the movements following Mohammed Bouazizi's self-immolation would have never spread as quickly and effectively as they did.

While the trade union was helpful to the revolution itself, it was particularly useful as a mediator in post-revolution disputes. Most politicians trusted UGTT to have such a job and also respected its ability to voice its opinion while doing so. Omri writes, "UGTT's role was crucial in the framing debate, steering decision-making in the chaotic period, starting the Council for the Protection of the Revolution, and serving as a meeting place of all the parties at a time when parties were either small, insignificant politically, or formed recently."<sup>31</sup> Following the mediations, the civil society made up of members of UGTT worked to piece the country back together. When Ben Ali left a power vacuum in Tunisia, the trade union was able to step in and turn a chaotic revolution into a democratic transition. Without the role of UGTT in the revolution, the rebel cause would have had trouble both articulating itself and reaching different areas, while new parties would have struggled to make themselves known. This could have left a void to be filled with extremists were it not for the civil society that took hold of the nation. Without the UGTT, Tunisia may have never ended up being the only success of the Arab Spring.

---

<http://blogs.law.columbia.edu/uprising1313/safwan-masri-workers-and-soldiers-the-role-of-institutions-in-tunisias-and-egypts-revolutions/>

<sup>29</sup> Ibid.

<sup>30</sup> Mohamed-Salah Omri, "No Ordinary Trade Union: The Role of UGTT in the Tunisian Path to Revolution and Transition,"

[http://www.academia.edu/19291239/No\\_Ordinary\\_Union\\_The\\_role\\_of\\_UGTT\\_in\\_the\\_Tunisian\\_path\\_to\\_revolution\\_and\\_transition](http://www.academia.edu/19291239/No_Ordinary_Union_The_role_of_UGTT_in_the_Tunisian_path_to_revolution_and_transition)

<sup>31</sup> Ibid., 23.

*Egypt.* While Tunisia could thank its major trade union and the civil society formed by it for help throughout the revolution, Egypt could not do the same. Economic grievances and workers' demands played just as important a role in Egypt's revolution as they did in Tunisia, but workers in Egypt were not given a network in which to voice their concerns. The Egyptian Trade Union Federation (ETUF) had previously been rendered "politically impotent" by the Mubarak regime and, thus, had only supported one strike through decades of protest.<sup>32</sup> Both before and during the revolution, Egyptians saw the union as corrupt and as a symbol of the regime. The union was seen as a tool for corrupt political control. For this reason, ETUF had no place in the demand for democracy and equality.

While protestors in Egypt were being worked against by their very own trade unions, they were also being targeted by the State Security Investigations Service (SSIS), an internal security agency. Prior to and throughout the revolution, the agency was protested against for their role in the torture, kidnapping, and murder of anyone that questioned the government. At one point, protestors broke into the SSIS headquarters and attempted to steal documents with information that they believed to contain evidence of the crimes committed by the agency.<sup>33</sup> As protestors continued to defy the agency, they also continued to disappear. By March 2011, the SSIS was blamed for over 1,200 disappearances.<sup>34</sup> The role of the SSIS did prevent the Egyptian Revolution from being very successful, as it ensured that many protestors of the regime would disappear, creating fear among all Egyptian people.

*Syria.* When protests became too much for the Tunisian and Egyptian presidents to handle, they chose to step down. This did not, however, occur in Syria. Bashar al-Assad, despite calls for him to resign from his own people and from several other world powers, remains the president of Syria. This is representative of the corruption, addiction to power, and overall pride not only of the president, but in Syria's political institutions as a whole. The failure of Syria's political institutions to enforce accountability and protect the people of Syria is a major cause of the escalated situation currently happening there.

Freedom House rates Syria's electoral process as zero out of twelve, meaning that there is no legitimacy to the process electing officials to power.<sup>35</sup> Despite the

---

<sup>32</sup> Safwan Masri, "Workers and Soldiers: The Role of Institutions in Tunisia's and Egypt's Revolutions," *Modalities of Revolt*, October 24, 2017.

<sup>33</sup> Carlstrom, Gregg. "A Step Toward Prosecutions?" *Al Jazeera*. March 06, 2011. |

<sup>34</sup> El Sirgany, Sarah. "Unknown Fates for Hundreds of Egyptians Missing Since Revolution." *CNN*. October 10, 2012.

<sup>35</sup> "Syria," Freedom House, 2017; <https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-world/2017/syria>. Freedom House bases its ratings on how well any given nation complies with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

ongoing civil war, elections were held in Syria in 2012, with Assad having an opponent for the first time. Syria claimed having nearly seventy-five percent voter turnout, with the president receiving nearly ninety-percent of the votes.<sup>36</sup> Much of the Western world viewed this election as a farce, considering more than a fifth of the voting population is thought to have been displaced due to the civil war.

There are several other governmental institutions, other than electoral processes, that lack accountability, fairness, and transparency. This is especially true of the police force and prison systems of Syria. Even before the armed conflict began in 2011, any person attempting to question the legitimacy of the government could face imprisonment or death.<sup>37</sup> A main reason for the initial protests was the people's demand for the release of political prisoners. Many resolved to take to the streets after the arrest of a young boy for drawing anti-government graffiti.

Syria's electoral processes and other governmental institutions were created in a way that allowed the government to amass and abuse power with little to no consequence. If Syria had more effective political institutions put in place, like regulated free and fair elections, corruption like that of al-Assad would not have been spread so easily with no accountability. The lack of balance in the Syrian government allowed for a dictatorship to take hold.

The institution of sect in Syria has also contributed to conflict in the nation, almost ensuring clashes. The religion of Islam has two main sects: Sunni and Shia. Followers of each type disagree over the caliph that is said to be the successor of Prophet Muhammad.<sup>38</sup> Though this conflict has existed for centuries, it remains the cause of many violent clashes, including attacks by Sunni Islamist groups like the Islamic State on Shia Muslims. Alawites are considered a sect within the Shia sect.

Conflict between the Syrian population and the government over religion began in 1973, when Bashar al-Assad's father and predecessor, an Alawite, put forth in a new constitution that the president of Syria does not necessarily have to be a Muslim.<sup>39</sup> This caused nationwide outrage, but especially infuriated Sunni terrorist groups like the Muslim Brotherhood. Despite a series of armed revolts, the government survived. Today, al-Assad, also an Alawite, claims that his government is secular but takes a firm stance against Sunni Muslims, due to factions like the Muslim Brotherhood. Sunni Muslims make up nearly three-quarters of Syria's population, making Assad's favoritism for other sects incredibly ostracizing for a very large percentage of the population. Despite Alawites making up less than ten percent of Syria's population, Assad's supposedly secular government has favored them. This

---

<sup>36</sup> Ibid.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid.

<sup>38</sup> John Harney. "How Do Sunni and Shia Islam Differ?" *The New York Times*, January 3, 2016.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid.

minority was once ostracized by Sunni Muslims, making the majority of the population incredibly frustrated by Assad's preferential treatment, which includes the appointment of Assad-supporting Alawites to military officer and other governmental positions.<sup>40</sup> The anger and disenfranchisement of Sunni Muslims over the minority-ruled government has led many to attempt to overthrow the government through rebel forces, including extremist groups like the Islamic State. This sectarian conflict has greatly contributed to the start of the Syrian Civil War. It has also led to Shia countries like Iran being involved on the side of the government. The institution of sect in Syria has not only ensured conflict; it has allowed for many different factions to become involved in the war.

### **Islamism**

*Tunisia.* In Tunisia, as it is with much of the Arab world, Islam is a deciding factor when it comes to laws, the government, and human rights. People often blame the theocratic nature of Saudi Arabia's government for its frequent human rights violations. It is not surprising that Islam is a topic of conversation when questioning why Tunisia remains a moderate success. According to Fareed Zakaria, the question of why Tunisia succeeded while Egypt failed is a simple one. He states, "The most common [answer] is that Tunisia's Islamists were just better than Egypt's."<sup>41</sup>

The main Islamist political party in Tunisia is Ennahda, a movement originally inspired by the Iranian Revolution and the Egyptian Muslim Brotherhood. Zakaria goes on to tell why Ennahda is one of the most modern Islamist parties in the world, stating, "Ennahda has not tried to institute sharia, has declared its respect for Tunisia's progressive laws on women's rights, and voluntarily ceded power this year to a technocratic, national unity government when faced with popular protests."<sup>42</sup> The willingness of this political party to participate in democracy has made it much different than its Egyptian counterpart, as Ennahda is a political party that can function in a human rights-conscious democracy, while the Muslim Brotherhood is unable to do so.

Though Ennahda has existed since 1981, its modern connotation refers to its involvement in the 2011 revolution. In the wake of the revolution, leaders of the party were seen attempting to find a place in the new country by meeting with prime ministers and taking part in demonstrations. At this time, the party urged Tunisians that it did not intend on making Tunisia a theocracy. Rather, it wanted to join in its

---

<sup>40</sup> Fabrice Balanche, *Sectarianism in Syria's Civil War*, The Washington Institute for Near East Policy, 2018.

<sup>41</sup> Fareed Zakaria, "Why Democracy Took Root in Tunisia and Not Egypt," *Washington Post*, October 20, 2014.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibid.*

new democracy. In addressing the fears of many Tunisians, spokesman Samir Dilou stated: "Our party is not a religious party. We are a modern party against the background of an Islamic worldview...We do not want a theocracy. We want a democratic state shaped by the idea of freedom, and people should decide for themselves how to live."<sup>43</sup> From the beginning of Ennahda's involvement in the aftermath of the Tunisian revolution, it declared itself less authoritarian than any other Islamist party in the Arab world. Because of this, it was able to acquire support among many Tunisians who had rebelled in the name of seeking a free and fair government.

Many authoritarian Islamist parties will often make promises of democracy and then abandon those ideas when they come to power. Ennahda was elected due to its platform, but did not let go of its principles after this. When the government run by Ennahda officials was criticized due to poor economic performance and lack of control among fundamental Islamist groups, it agreed to step down in favor of a technocratic government that would help to facilitate free and fair elections, as well as draft a new constitution. Ennahda's willingness to step aside was unprecedented for Islamist parties in the Arab world, as much of them often refuse to do so and respond with violence. This commitment to democracy shows that the party is truly the most modern Islamist party to have any place in the Arab Spring. If the leaders of Ennahda did not possess the humility necessary to let the people dictate their own government, Tunisia could have faced yet another major conflict.

The commitment of Ennahda and its supporters to democratic principles was further demonstrated when the party did not put forward or endorse any candidate in the November 2014 presidential election. Because of this party's willingness to accept defeat and, thus, its commitment to the people of Tunisia, the nation has successfully completed free and fair elections *with* the involvement of an Islamist party. In many nations in the Arab world, religious parties and fair elections simply cannot coexist due to the hunger for power possessed by most religious leaders. In the case of Ennahda, Tunisia was able to move past a potential major conflict thanks to the party's willingness to do what was best for the country.

*Egypt.* The rich network of mosques and Islamic associations in Egypt made it incredibly easy for parties like the Muslim Brotherhood to reach the everyday Egyptian through advertisements, demonstrations, and other means. In *Counting Islam*, Tarek Masoud states, "Islamists were able to defeat secular parties...because they could piggyback on the country's rich Islamic...to reach everyday citizens.

---

<sup>43</sup> Larbi Sadiki, "Why Is Tunisia's Ennahda Ditching Political Islam?" *Al Jazeera*, May 24, 2016.

Secular parties [couldn't]...so they turned to the army."<sup>44</sup> Islamist propaganda in Egypt supported the election of an extremist authoritarian just after the ousting of another authoritarian. The lack of resources for secular parties left them disenfranchised and pushed these parties to overthrow their Islamic counterparts with the help of the military.

Similar to the case of Tunisia, the Islamist party won the first election after the revolution. However, the Muslim Brotherhood was not comparable to Tunisia's Ennahda. While the latter supported secularism, democracy, and the wishes of the Tunisian people, the former switched its views as soon as it came to power. President Morsi almost immediately became more authoritative than Mubarak had been. The Muslim Brotherhood had been looking to come into power for decades and was able to do so when Mubarak left a power vacuum in Egypt. The presence of political Islam in the nation doomed Egypt from the start, as this politically motivated, wide-reaching organization was given nearly unlimited access to all resources necessary to run a campaign and become elected. Had more moderate parties, like Tunisia's Ennahda, had the capabilities that their extremist counterparts possessed, it is likely that an extremist would have never been elected, thus leaving room for a moderate party like Ennahda.

*Syria.* Islamism also had a large role in Syria's unrest. Islamists remain on several sides of the conflict, including that of the Islamic State and the rebel groups. A Syrian faction of the Muslim Brotherhood has asserted itself in the fight against al-Assad.<sup>45</sup> Despite its claim to not have a very large amount of influence in the fight, the faction is said to have control of at least one quarter of the Free Syrian Army through its funding.<sup>46</sup> This does allow for the Brotherhood to have a considerable amount of say in the actions of the militia. However, spokesmen for the group have said that they do not plan on undermining democracy, nor do they wish to play a large role in the future of Syrian government.<sup>47</sup>

On the other side of the spectrum remain Islamist groups like the Islamic State that hope to utilize a power vacuum left in Syria to institute an Islamic caliphate. The al-Nusra Front, a faction of Syrian rebels, has the same goal of creating a caliphate for Sunni Muslims. Together, The Islamic State and the al-Nusra Front have claimed hundreds of terrorist attacks. The involvement of these extremist groups has considerably added to the violence and death toll of Syria. The presence of these

---

<sup>44</sup> Tarek Masoud, *Counting Islam* (April 28, 2014).

<sup>45</sup> Liz Sly, "Syria's Muslim Brotherhood is Gaining Influence Over Anti-Assad Revolt," *Washington Post*, May 12, 2012.

<sup>46</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>47</sup> *Ibid.*

groups has also led many world powers, like Russia, to support Bashar al-Assad despite his alleged human rights violations. This is because it is believed that if Assad is taken out of power, Islamist groups will take advantage of the situation to form a caliphate in Syria.

Islamism has added a great deal of influence to the situation in Syria. While some groups have used it merely politically, others have used it violently. If the diplomatic community is to address the situation in Syria, it will have to understand the ideological factors motivating several of the groups involved.

### **The Role of the Military**

*Tunisia.* In many cases of revolution, the military plays an important role in the success or failure of the existing government. In most nations, the military is controlled entirely by the head of government and, thus, can often act against civilians when given orders to do so. In Tunisia, the military played a drastic role in the success of the Tunisian people, as it rejected orders to attack civilian protest and instead protected the revolution. Had the Tunisian military used force against protestors, it is likely that the revolution would have never progressed to the exile of the former president.

During and even before president Ben Ali, the military's role was a modest one; it did not make political decisions and was even banned from joining the ruling political party. The military had never attempted a coup, something that is quite common in many North African countries, and mainly focused on border defense. According to Zoltan Barany in *Comparing the Arab Revolts: The Role of the Military*: "Ben Ali's Tunisia was a police state. As in many other sultanistic regimes, it was a place where the regular military found itself overshadowed by far larger, more amply funded, and more politically influential security agencies run by the Interior Ministry."<sup>48</sup> In order to keep the military generally happy, Ben Ali sent several of his military officers to the United States for training. There, many were exposed to the standards of civil-military relations in a democracy like the United States. By the time of the Arab Spring, the military had little to no stake in the government and, thus, had no reason to go against civilians in favor of the regime.

The independence of the military was portrayed when protests against President Ben Ali became too much for the Presidential Guard and his gangs to handle, the leader ordered General Rachid Ammar, the army chief of staff, to deploy troops "in support of the regime's security detachments."<sup>49</sup> General Ammar refused

---

<sup>48</sup> Zoltan Barany, "Comparing the Arab Revolts: The Role of the Military," *Journal of Democracy*, October 2011.

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, 31.

this order and soon placed his troops in between governmental forces and protesting civilians, effectively saving the Tunisian revolution. The army's refusing to fire upon protestors directly contributed to the success of the Tunisian revolution. Had the army taken the side of Ben Ali, it, along with the nation's other security forces, would have violently crushed protestors and perhaps crushed the entire revolution. Without the support of the military, democracy in Tunisia would not have been possible.

*Egypt.* In analyzing the role of institutions and Islamism in the Egyptian Revolution, it seems unclear why the country did not end up in as abysmal a situation as Syria. This idea, however, becomes clear when one looks at the role of the military throughout the revolution. Though the military did not explicitly side with protestors the way that of Tunisia did, it did not side with the regime either. The military did not play an active role in the beginning of the revolution. Rather, it opted out of firing at protestors and stopping them from filling Tahrir Square. However, when Mubarak unleashed extensive violence on protestors on February 2, the regime lost all credibility and soldiers quickly took the side of the protestors.

The siding of the military with the protestors can be blamed on several factors, including the extensive reliance by the regime on police forces and the fact that Egypt's conscripted military was so involved with society that many soldiers would have likely refused to fire upon protestors.<sup>50</sup> Similar to the Tunisian military, their Egyptian counterpart did not find itself incredibly loyal to the regime, nor did it find it just to fire on civilians. The refusal of the military to give in to the demands of Mubarak saved countless civilian lives. This, along with the allowing of protestors to enter prominent spaces like Tahrir Square, ensured that the protests and revolution would live on. Were it not for the military's decision to not side with the regime, Mubarak could have easily squashed any uprising, ensuring that democracy would never come to Egypt. Despite the amicable nature of the military, however, the Egyptian Revolution still faced problems elsewhere and, thus, would not live to be as successful as its Tunisian counterpart.

*Syria.* The military has played a considerably important role in the current situation of Syria. While the military in Tunisia and Egypt refused to fire upon protestors, that of Syria did and continues to inflict violence upon civilians. The Syrian military has acted as a police force for the president and has "cracked down on the popular uprising, without a splintering of the armed forces."<sup>51</sup> Rather than out of devotion to the president, many defectors of the Syrian military have cited fear as a reason that

---

<sup>50</sup> Barany.

<sup>51</sup> Lutterbeck, 45.

troops choose to obey orders and fire at civilians, stating “soldiers who refused to shoot protesters were themselves executed by their superiors.”<sup>52</sup> Through the use of fear, the Syrian government has formed a grip on its military, ensuring that the trained group stays on the side of the president.

In addition to fear tactics, much of the military chooses to stay on the side of Assad because both he and the military are made up of Alawites, a sect of Shia Muslims.<sup>53</sup> Most protesters, however, are Sunni Muslims. The tension between sects, no matter how miniscule, has been a contributing factor in the military’s decision to side with the government. The Syrian government’s position as a ruling minority ensures that leaders like Assad are fearful of losing power, for they understand that if they do lose power, they will be punished for their actions. This is reminiscent of point put forth by international relations theorist Reinhold Niebuhr that states that political life will constantly swing between tyranny and anarchy.<sup>54</sup> According to this theory, those who come to power are so afraid of the anarchy that will follow a revolution that they must cling to power as long as they can. This has ensured that Assad and the minority military will fight the attempted revolution as hard as they can, or else face retribution.

In addition to the military’s role in dismantling a revolution in Syria, defectors of the Syrian military have also played a large part in ensuring that conflict continues to escalate. Defectors from the Syrian military founded the Free Syrian Army, one of the main rebel groups in the nation. The Free Syrian Army has made large contributions to the fights against both Islamist parties and the Syrian government. This force, however, may not have been founded if it were not for those who decided to leave the Syrian military and work against it.

The military’s decision to side with Bashar al-Assad and inflict violence upon protesters has, without a doubt, made the Syrian protests among the most deadly of the Arab Spring. If it were not for this decision, Assad may have stepped down in the same way the presidents of Tunisia and Egypt did. However, those who did defect from the military are the ones that continue to battle the Syrian regime over the rights of the Syrian people. The military, its decisions, and its defectors have all played an incredibly important role in leading Syria to its civil war.

## Conclusion

Through the case studies of Tunisia, Egypt, and Syria, it is apparent that the factors contributing to the success or failure of their respective revolutions boil down to three

---

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 48.

<sup>53</sup> Zoltan.

<sup>54</sup> David Lesch, *The Middle East and the United States* (New York, NY: Routledge: 2012).

elements: institutional disposition, the presence of Islamism, and the role of the military. Tunisia's robust civil society, its moderate Islamists, and its depoliticized, autocratic military all helped to form the nation's democracy as the only successful result of the Arab Spring. Egypt, however, was saved from catastrophe only by the military's conscious decision to stand with protesters. In the case of Syria, however, institutional corruption, extremist Islamists, and an oppressive military with strong allegiance to the Assad regime have contributed to the nation becoming a war zone.

If the diplomatic community is to address the failing nature of states like Syria, it must not only understand why Syria failed; it must examine the factors that led countries like Tunisia to success. In understanding the factors resulting in the successes and failure of the Arab Spring, the international community can learn more about the causes, effects, and factors of the modern revolution. By understanding these factors, the diplomatic community can attempt to prevent situations like Syria from occurring again through international policy enforcement regarding oppressive governments and military systems. Similarly, when a revolution is taking place, the international community can attempt to facilitate actions like those that were taken in Tunisia, including the involvement of institutions like trade unions and the government's acknowledgement of issues and willingness to listen.

Due to the failing nature of many countries in the Arab world following the Arab Spring, it is not likely that the fight for democracy in the Middle East is over. Protests, attempted revolutions, and oppressive government involvement are likely to occur again. With the knowledge of what causes successes like Tunisia and failures like Syria, the diplomatic community can begin to learn how to react swiftly and strategically.

## **A Partnership Between Nursing Faculty, Students, and Urban Community Centers to Provide Vision Screenings for Low-income Immigrant Women: An Experiential Case Study**

Rose C. O'Halloran, Kerry A. Milner, and Kim Foito

*Abstract: Given the current health care climate, it is critical for nurse educators to provide learning opportunities for students to collaborate with leaders in the community to provide much-needed services to vulnerable populations. We developed, implemented, and evaluated a process for vision screenings and referrals to a local eye center for low-income, immigrant women over three years in an urban setting in the United States. This is a report on the program, including the challenges faced by the faculty and lessons learned by the nursing students.*

**Keywords:** Access to healthcare, community-based nursing, nursing education, public health nursing education, screening, vision.

### **Background**

Vision loss can negatively impact a person's ability to work, drive, and learn (Pottie et al., 2011). The American Academy of Ophthalmology recommends a complete eye exam by a physician once during the second decade of life, twice during the third decade of life, and more frequent exams if one wears contact lens, has a family history of diabetes, eye infection or injury ("Eye Exams 101 - American Academy of Ophthalmology," 2012). Access to vision screening in developing countries is usually limited (Pottie et al., 2011). Vision impairment is much higher in developing countries because of poverty and lack of access to quality, affordable health services (Jaggernath et al., 2014). Moreover, undocumented immigrants from developing countries that enter the United States have limited health care options ("Undocumented Immigrants Face Limited Health Care Options | Huffington Post," 2014, January 28) and are a vulnerable population placing them at greater risk for poor health and lack of access to health care (Fitzgerald, Myers & Clark, 2016). Certain eye diseases and common impairments can be detected during vision screenings. Therefore, recent immigrants to the United States should receive vision screenings as part of their evidence-based care.

### **Practice Problem**

Mercy Learning Center (MLC) and Caroline House are two non-profit centers in urban Bridgeport, Connecticut designed to meet the unique needs of women in this community. There are over 1,000 low-income immigrant women enrolled in basic literacy and life skills training programs in these centers. Some aspire to prepare for the United States citizenship exam and earn a high school equivalency diploma. Many of the women are empowered to

build a better life for themselves and their families. Educators at these centers have found that some clients struggle with the coursework because of vision problems. Thus, a partnership was formed between community leaders, nursing faculty, and students in leadership roles within the Connecticut Student Nurses Association (CSNA) to provide a much-needed vision screening service to this vulnerable population.

### **Development of the Academic-Practice Partnership**

An academic-practice partnership allows for mutual goal setting, sharing of knowledge, and meeting of needs of both partners (Flores, Hickenlooper, & Saxton, 2013). The partnership described in this section was an informal academic-practice partnership that began in 2014.

The partnership began with a nursing faculty member who served on the MLC Board of Directors. The faculty board member facilitated a meeting between the undergraduate health assessment faculty and MLC administrators, where the administrators expressed the need for vision screenings based on classroom observations and the group decided to pilot a vision-screening project. The undergraduate health assessment faculty agreed to coordinate and oversee the screenings with the nursing students and MLC staff.

The lead nursing faculty member, who was also an advisor to CSNA, was aware that the CSNA president was interested in community service projects that improved women's health and that she was receptive to helping with recruitment of students for participation in these activities. CSNA's membership includes nursing students from all over Connecticut, and part of their mission is to engage its members in networking and community service. The CSNA president assisted with recruitment by reaching out to members in the organization, which resulted in participation of students from two local baccalaureate-nursing programs.

The academic-practice partnership was expanded in 2015 to include Caroline House. This occurred when a staff member of Caroline House saw a news clip featuring the vision screening at MLC and made a request to CSNA for nursing students to conduct a vision screening at their site.

### **Project Purpose**

The purpose of this project was for nursing students to develop partnerships with community agencies to provide vision screenings to a vulnerable population in the Bridgeport area. A secondary project aim was for students to learn how to disseminate the results at a regional or national conference and in a publication.

### **Methods**

**Participants.** All women who attended the MLC or Caroline House basic literacy and life skill training programs had access to the vision screenings; however, the total number of

women who were notified about the screening dates and times over the three years is unknown. Women who attended MLC in September 2014, 2015, or 2016 up to the annual screening days in October 2014, 2015, and 2016, as well as those women who attend the Caroline House in September 2015 up to the screening day in October 2015, were notified of the screening dates and times by the volunteer or outreach coordinator at each center, either verbally or via posted signs. Translators were used for the verbal advertisements. The dates and times were selected by each center in order to reach the most clients. Childcare was available for women with young infants and children. A total of 187 women from MLC and Caroline House self-selected to attend the screenings over the three years.

**Implementation.** The academic-practice partnership between the undergraduate health assessment faculty and MLC gave faculty and students access to immigrant women with self-identified health concerns that students could care for and make referrals for more specialized care as needed.

The next step in the implementation process began with the faculty seeking help from the CSNA Board of Directors to find nursing students who would be interested in leading vision screenings at MLC. Thirteen nursing students from two universities agreed to lead the screenings.

MLC had limited resources to pay for eye doctor appointments for the women found to have abnormal vision screenings. Therefore, the nursing students leading the vision screenings explained the project and MLC's limited financial resources to the Connecticut Nurses' Association, which connected them with the Needs Clearinghouse, a nonprofit organization that supports charities by networking donors with people in need. For this project, the donor was the Bridgeport Lions Club, which provided vouchers for the free eye exams and eyewear at a local LensCrafters®. LensCrafters® is a large optical chain that sells prescription eyewear and has independent optometrists on-site. A specific LensCrafters® for this project was selected because the optometrist was bilingual and the location was geographically close and accessible by public transportation.

Sophomore, junior, and senior nursing students from two different baccalaureate programs in Connecticut served as the vision screeners. Due to curriculum variations, the undergraduate health assessment faculty conducted just-in-time training for all student participants. Just-in-time training, also known as on-demand learning, gives learners the information they need at the time it is needed (Hartley, 2000). This training included an introduction to basic vision assessments, an overview of the evaluation criteria, and utilized a demonstration/return demonstration pedagogy. Upon completion of just-in-time training, students performed the vision screenings autonomously in pairs with a faculty member verified the results. Final decisions regarding referral were made by the faculty.

Clients at MLC and Caroline House were encouraged to speak English to support their literacy education goals. Translators and a bilingual social worker were accessible at both centers during the screenings.

The dates and times for the vision screenings were identified by MLC based on the hours of operation, program client availability, and available space. Because MLC's basic literacy and life-skill training program begins every September, the volunteer coordinator recommended annual October screenings to allow the clients to self-identify vision deficits after several weeks of instruction. Lunch breaks were identified as an ideal time of day to capture the most clients for the screenings. A sign-up sheet was generated and verified by the volunteer coordinator to ensure the clients self-identified or faculty-recognized as impaired. These same processes were used at Caroline House for the single screening held in October 2015.

The criteria for referral to the optometrist were developed in collaboration with advanced practice nursing faculty and followed the American Academy of Ophthalmology's guidelines ("Vision Screening: Program Models," 2015). Women found to have one or both eyes with deficits of greater than or equal to 20/50, a vision discrepancy of 2 lines or more on the Snellen eye chart (Peters, 1961), Rosenbaum chart (Horton, 1997), or any one abnormality such as cataracts or astigmatism, were reported to the social worker at MLC or Caroline House. The social worker explained the referral process to the client, arranged for an appointment, and discussed transportation options. Nursing faculty completed paper referrals, which included assessment results and faculty contact information if the optometrist needed more information.

The directors at MLC and Caroline House tracked the project data of women screened, women referred for eye exams, and women seen by the optometrist. After each screening, a debriefing session was conducted to allow nursing students time to share their reflections with faculty and other students who participated in the screenings. Debriefing is an effective strategy for formative feedback in experiential learning (Cant & Cooper, 2011). Lessons learned by the nursing students were obtained from these debriefings.

**Evaluation.** Frequencies were used to describe the number of women screened, women referred for eye exam, and women seen by the optometrist for the annual screenings at MLC and the single screening at Caroline House.

**Results.** Between 2014 and 2016, one Fairfield University and 12 Sacred Heart University nursing students in their sophomore, junior or senior years, along with health assessment faculty from Sacred Heart University held vision screenings annually at MLC and a single vision screening at the Caroline House. One hundred eighty-seven women were screened over the three years of which 25% (n=47) were referred to an optometrist, and of these women, 21% (n=40) were seen by an optometrist. Table 1 displays the number of women screened, referred, and seen by optometrist per site per year.

Table 1

*Women Screened, Referred, and Seen by Eye Care Provider by Site and Year*

	Mercy Learning Center (2014) <i>f</i>	Mercy Learning Center (2015) <i>f</i>	The Caroline House (2015) <i>f</i>	Mercy Learning Center (2016) <i>f</i>	Total  <i>f</i>
Women Screened	77	64	33	13	187
Women Referred	13	16	11	7	47
Women Seen by Optometrist	10	12	11	7	40

### Discussion

Nearly 200 immigrant women received vision screenings over the three years. A total of 47 women were referred to an optometrist with 40 of these women complying with the recommendation for a comprehensive exam. Nursing students who participated in this project were able to see their impact on health care access when a service is delivered in the communities where immigrant populations reside. The project design was in alignment with recommendations from a systematic review that prenatal care for immigrants take place in convenient locations to improve access and address the needs that are important to this population (Higginbottom *et al.*, 2015).

Although not the primary purpose of this project, students learned how to disseminate practice-based evidence in traditional forms. Evaluation criteria for dissemination were met by the students submitting an abstract for presentation to a national nursing conference and a manuscript to a journal. Nurses have a professional and ethical responsibility to share and disseminate practice-based evidence (Milner, 2016) thus, this project provided a foundation for future dissemination.

### Lessons Learned by Nursing Students

The undergraduate nursing students learned several valuable lessons during this project. Initially, the students held fundraisers to pay for the eye exams and glasses. These fundraisers did not raise the funds necessary to sponsor all the women in need. This prompted the CSNA

officers to network with the Connecticut Nurses' Association who was able to connect the students with the Needs Clearing House. The students learned about the power of networking and the importance of having reliable and sustainable funding sources.

Another lesson learned involved the time and effort required to communicate with non-English speaking patients. Many of the women who came for the vision screenings had limited English proficiency. Some were illiterate in their native language. Because the women at MLC and Caroline House represent more than 50 countries of origin, translators were not always available. Therefore, frequent repetition, simple explanations, and use of nonverbal communication skills such as hand gestures, pointing, and pictures were key. Some women vocalized eye chart results alternating between languages. Screeners familiar with the Spanish and/or French alphabets were able to validate results quicker than those who did not. As a result, the time required to screen each woman varied considerably.

Another lesson learned was the importance of advocating for vulnerable populations in the community. A large emphasis is placed on transitions in care in the United States health system. Awareness of the needs of the greater community of the health system where a nurse is employed is paramount for improving quality care and patient outcomes. Moreover, improved access to quality care for the achievement of health equity is a Healthy People 2020 goal ("Access to Health Services | Healthy People 2020") that nursing students can help to advance.

Students were initially satisfied with completing the screenings and giving the women a referral to LensCrafter®. Under faculty guidance, students were encouraged to expand their thinking about the project evaluation. The idea for tracking how many women had seen an optometrist at LensCrafter® came from a faculty-led brainstorming session.

### **Challenges Faced by Nursing Faculty**

Time and resources were the biggest challenges for faculty. Vision screening scheduling had to comply with the preset time blocks at MLC and Caroline House. Times and days were not always conducive to nursing students and faculty schedules, which limited the number of volunteers available to conduct the screenings. Since most of the women screened had limited English proficiency, the lunch hour was often too small of a window of time to complete the screenings for the number of women preregistered. The varied length of time needed for screenings proved to be a challenge. MLC did not want any of the clients missing instructional time, so some screenings occurred on an additional day.

Unfortunately, only one faculty member who was the advisor for CSNA and instructor for health assessment agreed to be the point person for the entire experience. Having more than one faculty member participating in the screenings would have reduced the time required to verify screening results.

Faculty had to cull additional resources for women who did not meet the criteria for referral to LensCrafter® but had signs of mild myopia that could be corrected with over the counter non-prescription reading glasses. A faculty member with the assistance of students, collected eyewear donations from a local church. These women selected their own reading glasses and then immediately screened to ensure that the magnification strength was appropriate.

### **Conclusions**

Sophomore-, junior-, and senior-level nursing students were able to work together to identify and successfully address a healthcare need in the community. Students learned valuable lessons on the benefit of networking, the needs of charitable organizations, and the opportunities that can arise from donor contributions. Students also learned the value and impact of providing care in the community to immigrant women.

## References

- “Eye Exams 101,” American Academy of Ophthalmology, May 25, 2012, Retrieved October 5, 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.aaopt.org/eye-health/tips-prevention/eye-exams-101>.
- Flores, D., Hickenlooper, G., & Saxton, R. (2013). An Academic Practice Partnership: Helping New Registered Nurses to Advance Quality and Patient Safety. *Online Journal of Issues in Nursing* 18(3), 3.
- Higginbottom, G. M. A., et al. (2015). Immigrant women’s experiences of maternity-care services in Canada: a systematic review using a narrative synthesis. *Systematic Reviews* 4, 13.
- Jaggernath, J., et al. (2014). *Poverty and Eye Health* 06(14), 1849–1860.
- Melnyk, B. (2016). Disseminating Evidence by Turning Presentations into Publications: Key Strategies for Success. *Worldviews on Evidence-Based Nursing* 13(4), 259–260.
- Milner, K. A. (2016). Sharing Your Knowledge: Getting Your Idea Published. *Journal of Infusion Nursing* 39(5), 297–305.
- Nevarez Griselda, “Undocumented Immigrants Face Limited Health Care Options,” *Huffington Post*, January 28, 2014. Retrieved from [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/01/28/undocumented-immigrants-health-care\\_n\\_4679348.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/01/28/undocumented-immigrants-health-care_n_4679348.html).
- Pottie, K., Greenaway, et al. (2011). Evidence-based clinical guidelines for immigrants and refugees. *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 183(12), E824–E925.