Sacred Heart University Scholar, Volume 3, Number 1

Recommended Citation

. "Sacred Heart University Scholar, Volume 3, Number 1." *Sacred Heart University Scholar*, vol. 3, no.1, 2019, https://digitalcommons.sacredheart.edu/shuscholar/vol3/iss1/8

Sacred Heart University Scholar
Volume 3, Number 1 (Fall 2019)

Table of Contents

The Naulahka: A Story of Cultural Representation

Eve Papa[1]

Abstract: This article addresses the issues of cultural theory and representation that arise in Rudyard Kipling and Wolcott Balestier's 1892 novel The Naulahka: A Story of West and East. *Kipling and Balestier's novel highlights cultural differences between America and India, and in doing so raises controversial points on acceptance and understanding (or lack thereof). Framed through the theme of service travel, the novel's characters navigate a new life riddled with culture shock in an attempt to find their own version of cultural compassion. Additionally, this article will reference the cultural theories of Stuart Hall to help understand representation of Indians in the text. In particular, Hall's encoding/decoding model argues for the subjectivity of cultural understanding in that interpretation of representation varies between individuals; therefore, the intentions of the authors might not be as clear as they seem. Thus the following questions arise: Does* The Naulahka *serve as an educational, informative discourse on the topic of cultural representation? Or is it just plain offensive?*

Key words: Naulahka, East/West, novel, culture, representation, Rudyard Kipling, Wolcott Balestier, Stuart Hall, encoder, decoder, message, communication, conflict, understanding, acceptance, metaphor, language, social issues, semiotics.

Since Rudyard Kipling and Wolcott Balestier's 1892 publication of *The Naulahka: A Story of West and East*, much has changed in the way of Indian representation and acceptance by the Western world. Kipling and Balestier's novel highlights the cultural differences between the Eastern and Western parts of the world but does so in a controversial manner; subsequently, the novel addresses larger issues of acceptance and understanding. To break down the presence and meaning of representation in the book, the cultural theories of Stuart Hall can serve as a helpful reference. An analysis of *The Naulahka* through Hall's encoding/decoding model argues for the subjectivity of cultural understanding in that interpretation of representation varies between each and every human being. In raising questions on cultural interpretations, the novel also brings to light multiple social issues.

    The Naulahka features a main character, Kate Sherriff, whose quest for personal enlightenment takes shape in the form of service travel. As she journeys to India to fulfill her "calling" of serving as a nurse for underprivileged Indian women, a complex image of the Westerner as superior arises. While depicted as a hero, she also serves as a pure, perfect character who is making many sacrifices to travel east. While in India, she is depicted as

---

bringing light to the otherwise dark world of Indian women; she, as an American, is the cure to their ailments. In a conversation with her boyfriend, Nicholas Tarvin, Kate describes her motives as the following: "'It's for that I've come… Because they are *not* like us… If they were clever, if they were wise, what could we do for them? It is because they are lost, stumbling, foolish creatures that they need us'" (107). The language Kate uses to describe her patients and her reasons for making such a voyage to India stereotypes her patients and categorizes them in a demeaning fashion. As these descriptions are used early in the novel, readers are put in a position to wonder about the reasons behind Kipling and Balestier's choice to create the character of Kate. Do they wish to depict a selfless woman who genuinely wishes to improve global health? Or do they wish to depict the Westerner as the "cure?"

An important discussion additionally rises with the actions of Tarvin himself. Although the novel's opening may indicate that the story is about Kate and her journey towards service, Tarvin's character quickly arrives to steal the show. On his search for the possibly mythical Naulahka necklace, he pushes his way into the picture as the main character and displays greedy motives. After hearing that Kate is leaving for India (and after her refusal to stay back in the States with him), Tarvin decides to follow her. The reason for this is not only because he wants to watch over her and "protect" her, but also because his search for the necklace will make or break the future of his beloved hometown of Topaz, Colorado. Tarvin is a recently elected congressman in Topaz, and he has been given the promise by the Three C's Railroad Company that if he can bring back the Naulahka for the wife of the company's president, then a railway will be installed in Topaz. And further, Tarvin will be the most cherished and successful man in his small-but-proud Western town.

Kate and Tarvin's interactions with each other and with the people around them can be viewed through the lens of Hall's cultural works. As a pioneer in the discipline of cultural studies, Hall provides a solid foundation for assessing any and all things representation. Cultural studies are, essentially, the scholarly research and debate on what culture is, how it affects us, and how we perceive it. In his 1997 article "The Work of Representation," Hall takes his extensive knowledge on the subject and uses it to break cultural representation down to its bare bones. Though much of Hall's theoretical work focuses on representation in the media, his ideas can just as easily be applied to literary texts. Hall begins this complex discussion by providing a couple of varied definitions of the term "representation": "Representation means using language to say something meaningful about, or to represent, the world meaningfully, to other people...Representation is the production of meaning through language" (Hall 15-16).

Hall then follows with a layout of various approaches to cultural representation. He breaks cultural representation into three categories of theory: reflective, intentional, and constructionist. Reflective representation argues that language reflects the truth; the meaning

3

already exists, and the words on a page are merely conveying that meaning. Intentional representation, on the other hand, is a depiction that is purposely produced by its creator to convey a specific message or belief. Rather than mirroring what already exists, intentional representation argues that language is used to create meaning. The third category of cultural representation, in comparison to the reflective and intentional approaches, carries a bit more of a substantive discussion. Constructionist representation, Hall maintains, involves an understanding of semiotics.

At its core, semiotics is the recognition that there is a difference between real concepts and the words and images that we use to describe them. The real concepts are "signified," and the words and images used for description are the "signifiers." A semiotic approach to cultural representation, therefore, relies heavily on the use and comprehension of language; this by default requires an understanding of "polysemy." A signifier can have more than one meaning; that is, different people can potentially interpret signs differently. Hall explains polysemy's relevance to cultural representation through "conceptual maps." Every individual on Earth operates with a slightly different "conceptual map," or background knowledge with which people interpret the world around them. While everyone's conceptual map is different, those within the same culture will find that theirs share many similarities:

> That is indeed what it means when we say we 'belong to the same culture.' Because we interpret the world in roughly similar ways, we are able to build up a shared culture of meanings and thus construct a social world which we inhabit together. That is why 'culture' is sometimes defined in terms of 'shared meanings or conceptual maps.' (see du Gay, Hall et al., 1997 cited in Hall 18)

People of a shared culture can most closely relate to each other because of their similar backgrounds. These similar backgrounds are the cause for how a conceptual map is developed, and thus, those with similar backgrounds will share similar maps.

With the understanding of cultural representation categories and their implications of personal interpretation, we can jump a bit back in time to Hall's 1973 paper "Encoding and Decoding in the Television Discourse" and 1980 paper "Encoding/Decoding." These works highlight his original theory on the encoding/decoding model of understanding television programming and interpretation, and they argue for the concept of an active viewer. The encoding/decoding model stems from the semiotic approach to cultural representation, in that it emphasizes again a relationship between the signifier and the signified. In this case, Hall breaks up television discourse into three components: the encoder, the discourse, and the decoder.

In this model, the "encoders" are television writers and producers, the "programme" is what is displayed on the screen, and the "decoders" are the viewers. The encoders select what sort of message or narrative they wish to portray in their work; their conceptual maps

4

heavily influence this. From there, the decoders view the work and interpret it in alignment with their own conceptual maps, and make a conscious decision on what to think of the material. It is also important to note that a relationship exists between the decoders and the encoders, in that in order for cultural representation and understanding to be ever-changing—and for everyone to be aware—a discussion on difference in conceptual maps must occur. In viewing television as such, Hall argues that its viewers are actively engaged and constantly interpreting (even if they are not aware that this is occurring). This thought challenges traditional idea that television viewers are passive and not capable of absorbing any cultural narratives; rather, they simply move on with their lives, no differently, when they step away from the television (or as it is sometimes called, "idiot box"). Ultimately, when looking at Hall's encoding/decoding model and theories on representation, one must understand that there is always a message, whether obvious or subtle, conscious or unconscious, that travels through the medium.

While it was written in the context of television and mass media, the beautiful thing about Hall's encoding/decoding model is that it can just as easily be applied to literature and other forms of communication. In this case, Hall's theories can be applied to *The Naulahka* quite well, in that they can help us understand the contrast between depictions of West and East. The novel highlights cultural representation on a few different levels: through use of language, social issues, and metaphor.

Language is crucial when conveying any cultural message. In *The Naulahka*, Kipling and Balestier's choice in language is something that will stick out to just about any modern-day reader. The words they use to describe Indian people include (to name a few): children, simple, creatures, things, and Orients. For example, when Kate explains to Tarvin her motives for journeying to India. She says: "'It's for that I've come...Because they are *not* like us...If they were clever, if they were wise, what could we do for them? It is because they are lost, stumbling, foolish creatures that they need us'" (107). Although much has changed in the way of cultural representation since the 1800s, the time period is not enough of an explanation as to the demeaning language we see here. If any reader is to be offended by the text, it is understandable because this miscommunication has to do with conceptual maps. There is much possibility here for there to be a difference in the encoders' message and the decoder's interpretation, and this is because everyone interprets language at least a bit differently. Moreover, the particular use of language in the novel brings up questions regarding the purpose of Kate's character and her work in India.

Kate and Tarvin's interactions with each other and with the people and setting around them indicate a larger metaphor pertaining to culture. Kate and Tarvin both express personal reasons for traveling to India—different, but personal. Tarvin's motives are much more apparent: he wants Kate and he wants the necklace. Kate's motives are a bit more hidden: she wants to help people so that she can receive emotional fulfillment. These goals

5

expressed by the characters can be compared, in a sense, to a search for common cultural ground. Throughout the novel, there are moments in which cultural understanding seems possible, and moments in which it does not. An example is reflected in the following passage, which describes Kate's disappointment when her patients abandon her hospital and her care:

> She had told Mrs. Estes so much of her hopes for the future, had dwelt so lovingly on all that she meant to teach these helpless creatures, had so constantly conferred with her about the help she had fancied herself to be daily bringing to them, that to own that her work had fallen to this ruin was unspeakably bitter. (285)

Here we see Kate experience sadness and even a bit of anger at the idea that the patients are not interested in complying with her goal of emotional fulfillment. This reflects not only personal interests with regard to Kate's goals, but also a larger idea that Kate is working hard to understand the people around her. She may be in the earlier stages of cultural understanding, but she is at least starting the process.

At times in the novel, both Kate and Tarvin's goals seem impossible, which translates into an impossibility of finding cultural understanding. In the end, however, Kate and Tarvin both give up their respective dreams in order to benefit the people and situations around them. This final decision to do a larger work of good reflects, to a degree, their final finding of cultural understanding before departing back to Topaz. However much the language and situations of the novel may at times seem ignorant, the message is ultimately hopeful in looking towards cultural progress. This is especially true of how the book concludes.

The language and metaphor expressed in the novel give way to larger social issues that Kate and Tarvin face. As we have seen, both characters' reasons for wanting to travel to India display greed to a certain extent. Kate's motives, in particular, involve deeper questions about the motives for service work. Kate claims that she wants to travel to India to help women, but the reason she wants to do so is for personal, emotional fulfillment. However, Kate never addresses whether this is the right reason for wanting to participate in global service. Additionally, she also never considers as to whether the women in India *want* her help. The following passage describes a situation in which some ill women do not wish to be treated by Kate: "There were many women…who refused her ministrations completely. They were not ill, they said, and the touch of the white woman meant pollution" (116-117). Although Kate wishes to treat all of these sick women, not all of them necessarily want her help. This, therefore, brings up a larger social issue of service work. Do people in areas that receive service work want the help? What are the criteria of determining whether service work in a particular area is a beneficial idea? And further, as we see in Kate's situation, is emotional fulfillment a legitimate reason for doing service?

The Naulahka does not provide answers to these heavy questions, but rather it contributes to the conversation. Kipling and Balestier provide language, metaphors, and

6

situations that allow readers to ponder, discuss, and evaluate real-life issues and events. As Kate Sherriff journeys to India to fulfill her "calling" of serving as a nurse for underprivileged Indian women, a complex image of the Westerner as superior arises. Opinions of Kate vary among the people of Rhatore, as some see her as a hero at times ("white fairy"), and others see her as pollution to their city. But regardless of how the women of India view her, Kate prefers to view herself as a pure, wholehearted American who is bringing light to the otherwise dark world of Indian women. She sees herself, more so than her medicine, as the cure to their ailments.

Change is impossible without new experiences, conversation, and debate. And in that sense, Kate and Tarvin's travels to a foreign land were the first steps in a much larger and more important journey.

Works Cited

Acosta, Alisa. *Representation, Meaning, and* Language. 5 April 2012.

Cultural Studies at George Mason University. *About Cultural Studies*,
   <https://culturalstudies.gmu.edu/about >

Cultural Studies UNC. *What is Cultural Studies?*
   <http://culturalstudies.web.unc.edu/resources-2/what-is-cultural-studies/>

Hall, Stuart. "Encoding and Decoding in the Television Discourse." (1973).

---. "Encoding, Decoding." *The Cultural Studies Reader* (1980).

---. "The Work of Representation." *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. London: SAGE Publications, 1997.

Hsu, Hua. *Stuart Hall and the Rise of Cultural Studies*. 17 July 2017.
   <https://www.newyorker.com/books/page-turner/stuart-hall-and-the-rise-of-cultural-studies>.

Kipling, Rudyard and Wolcott Balestier. *The Naulahka*. London: Macmillan and Co., 1892.

Affirming the Purpose of Affirmative Action:
Understanding a Policy of the Past to Move Toward a More Informed Future

Meagan Schantz[2]

Abstract: The application of affirmative action policies to university admissions is a topic of ongoing controversy. This article amines the debate through an interdisciplinary lens, drawing on the fields of history, law, and ethics. The first section provides historical background on affirmative action policies, tracing how they expanded from the employment sector into higher education. Next examined are legal challenges to affirmative action in admissions, with a focus on the pivotal 1978 Bakke case. The ethical implications of affirmative action are next considered, in particular the question of how affirmative action can be applied in a way that supports disenfranchised groups while avoiding discrimination against other groups. In the final part of the article, the argument is made that affirmative action remains valuable to promote inclusion and diversity in admissions, but adjustments must be made to minimize its negative consequences, especially as the demographics of American universities change.

Key words: Affirmative action, admissions, higher education, *Regents of the University of California v. Bakke*, stereotype threat hypothesis, Harvard University.

Affirmative action, a program started in the 1960s to address discrimination in employment, has always been controversial. Vigorous debate in the last several years has occurred over the application of affirmative action in higher education admissions. Recently, some of the country's most elite institutions, including Harvard University and Yale University, have been the targets of lawsuits and intense public scrutiny. This article examines the origin and evolution of the policy to better comprehend its current value. Overall, at the heart of its intended purpose, affirmative action is a critical and necessary policy; however, to maintain its true effectiveness, the policy needs to be refined to minimize some of its negative consequences.

The Development of Affirmative Action

Affirmative action in its earliest form can be traced to the post-Civil War era of Reconstruction, when Congress ratified an act that established the Bureau of Refugees, Freedmen and Abandoned Lands.[3] Referred to as the Freedmen's Bureau, this agency in the

---

[3] "Freedmen's Bureau," History, accessed November 10, 2018, https://www.history.com/topics/black-history/freedmens-bureau.

War Department sought to provide basic necessities to newly freed slaves and impoverished white Southerners.[4] According to Georgetown law professor Girardeau Spann, the establishment of the Freedmen's Bureau marked the earliest occurrence of affirmative action because special accommodations were guaranteed based solely on the belief that race would prevent individuals from receiving equal treatment and opportunities.[5]

The practice reemerged in 1954 with the *Brown vs. Board of Education of Topeka* decision rendered by the United States Supreme Court. The case questioned the legality of segregation within school systems. The Court unanimously held that "separate but equal educational facilities for racial minorities is inherently unequal."[6] On paper, the ruling seemed incredibly promising and, to a certain extent, it was. This landmark case ended segregation in schools and reversed the *Plessy* decision (the law of the land at the time)—a massive historical feat. However, it was not the panacea to all of the issues of discrimination in the country.

The Civil Rights Era was a period critical of the establishment and evolution of affirmative action. In 1961, President John F. Kennedy first coined the term "affirmative action." In Executive Order 10925, aimed at establishing equal employment opportunities, Kennedy stated: "The contractor will not discriminate against any employee or applicant. The contractor will take *affirmative action* to ensure that applicants are employed, and that employees are treated during employment, without regard to their race, creed, color, or national origin."[7] From there, the policy was further expanded to other sectors in which the federal government had leverage, such as the hiring of contractors—a portion of federal contracts had to go to minority-owned businesses—and funding for public education.

The response to affirmative action's growth varied greatly upon its introduction in the 1960s. According to Dennis Deslippe's *Protesting Affirmative Action: The Struggle Over Equality After the Civil Rights Revolution*, the degree of opposition varied depending on region and, in the case of employment, the industry in question. With regard to education, affirmative action was seen as "this strange madness."[8] At one point, 60 percent of faculty did not support modified admissions processes, including affirmative action.[9] Debate ensued over how affirmative action should be implemented and also if it should be implemented at all.

---

[4] Ibid.

[5] Spann, *The Law of Affirmative Action*, 4.

[6] "Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka," Oyez, accessed November 10, 2018, https://www.oyez.org/cases/1940-1955/347us483.

[7] "Executive Order 10925," EEOC, accessed November 10, 2018, https://www.eeoc.gov/eeoc/history/35th/thelaw/eo-10925.html; emphasis added.

[8] Dennis Deslippe, *Protesting Affirmative Action: The Struggle Over Equality After the Civil Rights Revolution* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012), 49.

[9] Deslippe, *Protesting Affirmative Action*, 50.

9

The Misconceptions and Reality of Affirmative Action

There are a number of misconceptions regarding affirmative action and how it is implemented in the context of educational admissions. Essentially, institutions receiving federal funding are required to document some form of affirmative action plan. This plan includes a focus on a number of candidate characteristics, including race, gender, age, and disability.[10] In the context of race, institutions typically draw upon Title IV of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, "Nondiscrimination Under Programs Receiving Federal Assistance Through the Department of Education."[11] This clause outlines that "race, color, or national origin" cannot play a role in the denial of individuals from receiving educational services or benefits. Furthermore, segregation and preferential treatment for one group over another is not allowed.[12]

Bearing that in mind, the question arises: how is affirmative action applied in the admissions process? The answer is that there is really no single way, but a variety of strategies which are used. Generally speaking, affirmative action begins with a school actively seeking out minority students (whether by race, gender, first generation status) and encouraging them to apply for various opportunities.[13] By aggressively presenting potential experiences to those who were most likely previously unaware, the belief is that the diversity of the incoming applicant pool will expand. From there, institutions build their own comprehensive plans in evaluating the applications they receive.

Perhaps one of the largest fallacies is that affirmative action is implemented as a "quota system," with each group in society designated a certain number of spots within the incoming class. While such systems did exist at one point, they were deemed unconstitutional in *Regents of the University of California v. Bakke*.[14] Following that decision, policies began to diverge, and institutions adopted programs that fit their location and educational values.

One manifestation of affirmative action is in a "comparative policy." A comparative policy evaluates students in marginalized groups and compares data to see which students have excelled academically or have served as a leader in their community.[15] These factors then play a role in the selection process, as it determines the most competitive candidates in the applicant pool. There is some debate surrounding the use of this system; yet the stated justification is that the most qualified students within these specific focus groups are being

---

[10] "Affirmative Action," Cornell Law School: Legal Information Institute, accessed November 10, 2018, https://www.law.cornell.edu/wex/affirmative_action.

[11] "Title IV," The United States Department of Justice, accessed November 10, 2018, https://www.justice.gov/crt/fcs/TitleVI-Overview.

[12] Ibid.

[13] Cornell, "Affirmative Action."

[14] Ibid.

[15] Valerie Strauss, "What you should know about race-based affirmative action and diversity in schools," *Washington Post*, July 3, 2018.

10

admitted, which reaffirms that merit is the guiding standard. Other methods of implementing affirmative action include percentage plans, specifically selecting candidates from underrepresented high schools, and decreasing the emphasis on standardized test scores in the hopes of encouraging more students from disadvantaged groups to apply.[16]

Due to local legal and political developments, some regions and institutions are exempt from affirmative action policies. In California, for instance, race-based selection processes are actually illegal. This statute developed as a result of California Proposition 209, which passed in 1996.[17] In regard to specific institutions, how does affirmative action factor into admissions at schools with specific values or student qualifications (e.g. single-sex schools)? Essentially, these schools are exempt from affirmative action plans, as long as there is an equivalent institution available for the "discriminated" group. For instance, an all-girls institution can operate so long as there are all-boys and mixed-gender institutions available with similar services and opportunities. This speaks more to education before college because all single-sex colleges are private.[18] This means that federal funding is not provided and, therefore, an affirmative action policy is not required.

The Debate

The debate surrounding affirmative action is multifaceted and, at times, can seem a bit convoluted. Those who support affirmative action base their justification on a number of concepts, including the significance of ensuring opportunities for disenfranchised groups and the overall benefits to society from diverse university classes. Supporters of affirmative action typically note that the program provides students with opportunities that would not have existed had the policy not been implemented. According to William Bowen and Derek Bok, authors of *The Shape of the River: Long-term Consequences of Considering Race in College Diversity Admissions*, graduation from "selective universities" provides students with opportunities "beyond the workplace" that would not have existed without their undergraduate experience.[19] These opportunities allow for more long-term success and furthermore, greater positive contributions to the community.

Elaborating on community contributions, proponents of the policy also argue that in ensuring more diversity in schools, racial attitudes improve. As students are exposed to

---

[16] Kristen M. Glasner, Christian A. Martell, and Julie R. Posselt, "Framing Diversity: Examining the Place of Race in Institutional Policy and Practice Post-Affirmative Action," *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* (2018).

[17] Patricia Hurtado, "The Future of College Admissions: Experts Weigh the Harvard Case," *Bloomberg*, November 12, 2018.

[18] "Guidelines regarding Single Sex Classes and Schools," U.S. Department of Education, accessed November 12, 2018, https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/t9-guidelines-ss.html.

[19] Bill Shaw, "Book Review," *Business Ethics Quarterly* (July 1, 2001), 2.

different backgrounds and cultures, it is believed that acceptance of racial and ethnic differences improves.[20]

The last major justification for affirmative action is the idea of compensating for past injustices. In other words, by providing increased opportunities now, previous discrimination will be erased or diminished. Though the power of this justification has weakened over time as the United States moves further away from the era of legal segregation, the compensation argument is still referenced as key support for affirmative action at times.[21]

Those who oppose affirmative action, on the other hand, frequently invoke worries about reduced meritocracy to portray their perspective. In regard to meritocracy, opponents of the policy argue that race as a preferential factor has the tendency to take attention away from an individual's academic credentials. Supporters of this theory argue that unqualified applicants take the places of qualified candidates simply due to their minority status.[22] Another major argument against affirmative action is the idea that race-conscious admissions perpetuate racism and stereotyping.[23]

As opinions surrounding the issue become less flexible, it is an open question on how a compromise position could be reached. In a study conducted by Matthew DeBell of Stanford University, the idea of progress was examined in relation to opinions regarding equality and affirmative action practices. At the start of the study, two separate groups consisting of all white individuals and all black individuals were asked to rate the progress made in five distinct policy areas over the last fifty years. Both groups tended to state that the other group was favored in the policy area in focus (*e.g.* government treatment). When further questioned on progress and equality, both groups asserted that they believed that equality was crucial, with minimal discrimination or interracial conflicts serving as the cornerstones of social policy. Yet despite agreement in that area, the study diverged when both groups were asked for their opinions regarding affirmative action and the current state of equality. For the group of white individuals, affirmative action was not viewed as a necessary policy because they believed that white-black equality was largely achieved. Conversely, the group of black individuals viewed affirmative action more positively, as they felt that there was still a long way for the country to reach equality.[24]

---

[20] Leah Shafer, "The Case for Affirmative Action," Graduate School of Education, Harvard University, accessed October 1, 2018, https://www.gse.harvard.edu/news/uk/18/07/case-affirmative-action.

[21] "Arguments for and Against Affirmative Action," Mount Holyoke, accessed October 18, 2018, https://www.mtholyoke.edu/~jesan20l/classweb/arguments.html.

[22] Mary J. Fischer and Douglas S. Massey, "The effects of affirmative action in higher education," *Social Science Research* 36, no. 2 (2007): 532-534.

[23] Ibid.

[24] Matthew DeBell, "Polarized Opinions on Racial Progress and Inequality: Measurement and Application to Affirmative Action Preferences," *Political Psychology* 38/3 (2017).

12

At the conclusion of the study, DeBell noted that the differences shown in the study exist not because of the view of progress. Instead, DeBell attributed much of the debate to the subjective perspectives on the notion of ideal equality. To each individual and social group, an ideal standard of equality exists. Essentially, how far society lies from that ideal point of equality influences individuals' views on social policy and advancement. In that sense, the subjective nature of ideal equality essentially keeps the debate ongoing because it is nearly impossible to agree on what is ideal, given the history, critical experiences, and cultures of the groups.

Policy and the Law

Supreme Court rulings have played a large role in the formation and evolution of affirmative action. When examining the influence of the Court, it is beneficial to study the evolution of the policy before, during, and after the 1978 *Bakke* decision. Such a perspective makes it easier to comprehend the initial purpose of the program as well as the Supreme Court's challenge to appropriately apply the policy in such a manner that would not advantage one group over another.

Pre-Bakke Decisions

Brown vs. Board of Education of Topeka (1954) turned the tides in favor of establishing an environment where a policy like affirmative action could potentially thrive. Following the *Brown* decision and into the 1960s, two cases emerged that further set the tone for a national discussion on affirmative action: *DeFunis v. Odegaard* (1974) and *United Jewish Organizations v. Carey* (1977). Though majority opinion decisions were not officially delivered in these two cases, illustrating the lack of a consensus, the opinions and deliberations released revealed much about the early circumstances of affirmative action.

The *DeFunis* case involved an early affirmative action-based plan that had been adopted by the University of Washington Law School. A white applicant who claimed that he was denied admission in favor of a "less-qualified minority applicant" raised the case, essentially challenging the institution's use of race-conscious admissions.[25] When the case reached the Supreme Court, it was dismissed, as the court argued that the plaintiff's forthcoming graduation from law school rendered the lawsuit "moot." According to Spann, the Supreme Court's decision "foreshadowed the fact that a majority of the Court would be unable to agree upon anything other than the contentiousness of the affirmative action issue."[26] Thus, nothing was truly resolved; however, the lack of a decision reflected the growing hesitation regarding race-conscious practices.

United Jewish Organizations v. Carey, a case which occurred nearly three years later, marked somewhat of a change but nonetheless still revealed mixed feelings on race-

---

[25] Spann, *The Law of Affirmative Action*, 14.
[26] Ibid.

13

conscious policies. In this particular case, Hasidic Jews in a New York community felt their political voice was being suppressed after district reapportionment favored African-American voters. In the suit, the Jewish community challenged the constitutionality of the reapportionment action, which was proposed under the Voting Rights Act of 1965. Collectively, the Court decided that the constitutionality of the action could not be disputed; yet the justices could not reach a majority ruling on the status of race-conscious practices. Essentially, four justices argued that the plan was acceptable because it did not violate constitutional statute, despite the use of target quotas. Three justices argued that the reapportionment did not "burden white voters" and thus, despite a racial preference, did not weaken anyone's vote. The remaining two argued that since the plan did not purposely set out to burden white voters, its implementation was justified.[27] Essentially, this case further displayed the mixed opinions on affirmative action, though unlike the *DeFunis* case, its establishment was upheld.

The Bakke Decision

The 1978 *Regents of the University of California v. Bakke* case is, to date, the most monumental affirmative action case in the United States. Though the Court was divided in the two aforementioned cases, the opinions handed down had the effect of supporting the growth of race-conscious policies. This case, on the other hand, presented the first challenge to affirmative action and the implementation of race-conscious admissions.

The case challenged the admission practices of the University of California at Davis Medical School, which set aside 16 percent of the seats (16 out of 100) in the incoming class for minority students. Thirty-five-year-old Allan Bakke applied to the school twice and was rejected both times. Bakke questioned the legitimacy of the affirmative action program, as his qualifications exceeded those of the minority students accepted into the school.[28]

As with the other two cases, there was no single majority opinion released in the case. Yet, unlike the other cases, the general consensus held that a racial quota system was unconstitutional, although the use of affirmative action was still valid.[29] In a 5-4 decision, Justice Lewis Franklin Powell asserted that race could be considered as a factor in admissions if other factors were considered and so long as it was used on a "case-by-case basis."[30] This confirmed the use of race-based admissions practices. That said, in a 5-4 plurality decision also authored by Powell, it was found that "the Equal Protection Clause prohibits the university's specific race-based admissions program."[31] This meant that the

---

[27] Ibid.

[28] "Regents of the University of California v. Bakke," Oyez, accessed November 13, 2018, https://www.oyez.org/cases/1979/76-811.

[29] Ibid.

[30] "Regents of the University of California v. Bakke," Thirteen, accessed December 11, 2018, https://www.thirteen.org/wnet/supremecourt/rights/landmark_regents.html.

[31] Oyez, "Regents of the University of California v. Bakke."

14

quota system was unconstitutional. Though it confirmed the policy of affirmative action, it also restrained it for the first time in over a decade.

Post-Bakke Developments

Following the *Bakke* decision, a series of events and decisions refined the critical viewpoint of affirmative action. In the 1990s, several civil rights ballot initiatives sought to ban race as an evaluating factor in employment and education. Furthermore, the question of affirmative action began to flood state courts. In California and Michigan, the policy of race-conscious practices was successfully banned through Proposition 209 and *Schuette v. Coalition to Defend Affirmative Action*, respectively. In Colorado, attempts were made to restrict affirmative action through the 2008 proposal Amendment 46, which did not pass.[32]

The state of Texas has also played a key role in the evolution of affirmative action. Texas is known for opposing affirmative action practices, as seen in the *Hopwood v. Texas* case of 1996 and more recently, the 2013 *Fisher v. University of Texas* case. In both cases, affirmative action was challenged for allegedly awarding spots to less qualified individuals simply due to their race. Yet, most recently, it was determined that affirmative action could be applied on a limited scale.[33]

In 2018, the Harvard case was introduced in which Asian-American students argued that the Ivy League school was discriminating against them. This lawsuit has been key in inciting discussion about the policy, as critics have gone so far as to say that the policy should be removed in favor of a "race-blind" process in order to restore merit as the deciding factor in admissions decisions.[34]

Ethical Implications

Affirmative action undoubtedly poses points of contention, one of which is its social and ethical implications. Some of these implications are positive and beneficial, while others tend to be more negative and perhaps unintended. When balancing both sides, it can be difficult to determine if certain implications outweigh others; yet overall, the ethical implications seem to point towards the necessity of a regulatory system, so long as the system does not produce overbearing discriminatory consequences.

One the most prominent negative implications of affirmative action is the seemingly unintentional yet continued practice of racism and stereotyping in society. In 1999, Mary J. Fischer of the University of Connecticut and Douglas S. Massey of Princeton University conducted a study on the impact of affirmative action in two respects: if the policy indeed

---

[32] "The History of Affirmative Action in Education," Pearson, accessed October 18, 2018, https://www.pearsoned.com/history-of-affirmative-action-in-education/.
[33] Ibid.
[34] Katie Benner, "Justice Dept. Backs Suit Accusing Harvard of Discriminating Against Asian-American Applicants," *The New York Times*, August 30, 2018.

favors unqualified candidates (physical appearance vs. meritocracy), as well as if the policy creates a stigma of all minorities being inferior. In terms of qualifications, the study found that black students at "selective universities" were more likely to graduate than black students at "less selective universities." This shows that the individuals admitted at higher level or elite institutions excelled and thus clearly met the institution's qualifications. Furthermore, students with below average SAT scores upon entering college actually ended up outperforming some of their counterparts throughout their undergraduate career.[35] Thus, concerns about affirmative action leading to a proliferation of unqualified candidates are called into question by this study.

On the other hand, the study found some truth to the claim about promoting stigma. The study sought to examine if the degree to which an institution used affirmative action impacted minority students' success as well as the perception of minorities on campus by students in the majority. According to Fischer and Massey, this phenomenon is not a result of affirmative action as much as it is perpetuated by affirmative action, if white students feel that minority students are only at the school due to the lowering of academic standards, or if minority students perceive that the majority population views them as inferior.[36] The key to understanding this concept is recognizing that it is based on perception of classmates and peers.

The study also found that the more an institution relies on affirmative action practices, the more the sentiment is exacerbated.[37] To clarify, students do not know if their enrollments are the product of an affirmative action practice; it is more about the perception of them by the student body. Nonetheless, if that perception is negative, meaning that a significant number of white students believe that minority students were granted admission due to their race or ethnicity alone, then minority students will feel inferior. This is important to recognize because as stereotypes and racism are continued, they have the potential to impact a student's educational experience, including lower grades and a greater probability of leaving an institution. Though there is no complete solution, Fischer and Massey suggest that diversity of faculty and increased awareness of the problem could help to diminish the potential impact.[38]

Nevertheless, it is significant to note that the impact is considered to be "modest" on the institutional level.[39] It is also not the most significant factor in determining a student's success. Based on the available data, Fischer and Massey conclude that the benefits of affirmative action outweigh its negatives.

---

[35] Fischer and Massey, "The effects of affirmative action."
[36] Ibid.
[37] Ibid.
[38] Ibid.
[39] Ibid.

16

In a second analysis of the ethical implications, Leah Shafer of Harvard University presented the positive implications of affirmative action in a way that goes beyond Fischer and Massey. In her 2018 study of affirmative action, Shafer argued that the policy is necessary for ensuring diversity in both the educational and employment fields. In ensuring diversity in an educational setting, Shafer argues that professional leadership will become more diverse. This would allow for more cultural and race-based conversations to develop, thus having the capability to potentially improve individuals' acceptance of differences. Shafer breaks with Fischer and Massey with regard to the benefits for others. In a strict educational setting, Shafter argues that other classmates can benefit from diversity as they "have more positive racial attitudes toward racial minorities, they report greater cognitive capacities, [and] they even seem to participate more civically when they leave college."[40] Both could be true, however, depending on the policies and sentiment at different campuses.

While there are negative ethical implications of the program, both studies seem to show that affirmative action's impact is a net gain. Thus, in terms of the ethical perspective, there seems to be strong evidence in support of the practice.

Analysis

There have been a number of court cases that have contributed to affirmative action's evolution. As a result, the Supreme Court must navigate these legal precedents to determine if and how race will continue to play a role in the admissions process. A number of speculations have developed considering the consequences that may arise from any court decision. According to Jennifer Mnookin, the dean of the UCLA School of Law, the breakdown of affirmative action would lead to less diverse classes at various institutions. This line of thinking represents one camp that has developed as a result of this case. For Mnookin, there is a firsthand experience with California's Proposition 209, which essentially made it illegal to consider race or gender in the admissions and employment process. Though UCLA Law found some loopholes, Mnookin recognized that the initial impact of the 1996 ballot measure greatly reduced diversity within incoming classes. Thus, if the Supreme Court determines that "race-blind" admissions are preferential to that of affirmative action, there is the real possibility that diversity-related outcomes will suffer.[41]

In contrast to Mnookin's perspective, those who support race-blind admissions procedures, such as Roger Clegg of the Center for Equal Opportunity, argue that having a check on affirmative action will essentially only level the playing field again. According to Clegg, "It's clear that there's an enormously disproportionate number of Asian-American students with top credentials getting turned down, as opposed to other groups."[42] In

---

[40] Shafer.
[41] Hurtado.
[42] Ibid.

removing race from the admissions equation, individuals like Clegg or plaintiff Edward Blum argue that admissions will be founded on merit as opposed to other identifying factors.

In establishing race as a legitimate factor in admissions and employment, some of the historical and structural inequity was seemingly bridged. Providing greater opportunities for minority and previously marginalized groups has had an impact on education. Diversity in class settings enriches a student's learning experience, as they become exposed to different lifestyles and experiences. In addition, as some of the previous studies highlighted, racial attitudes can improve as students are exposed to different races and ethnicities.[43]

Yet a policy that aims to overcome discrimination also can ironically contribute to the very thing it is attempting to prevent. As race becomes a key factor in admissions decisions, it becomes questionable if other qualities and characteristics suffer. Furthermore, are particular races favored over another? As seen in the Harvard case, minority groups were seemingly pinned against each other, as Asian Americans argued that black and Hispanic applicants were favored despite lesser credentials in some cases.

In an ideal world, one could simply advocate for the moderate, middle of the road implementation; however, as outlined by DeBell in his study, the moderate or ideal position is extremely subjective. What constitutes moderate for one individual may be considered underwhelming or overwhelming to others. Thus, when evaluating something as contested as affirmative action, it is hard to pinpoint when costs outweigh the benefits and vice versa. That is not to say that the policy cannot be thoroughly scrutinized to attempt to find some sort of balance between the concerns at hand. Affirmative action is not a perfect program, as the number of Supreme Court challenges illustrates. Nevertheless, changes can be made to improve the policy in a way that will meet its goals.

For one thing, there could be attempts made to try and resolve the feeling of inferiority that could develop. As outlined in Fischer and Massey's study, this could potentially be achieved by increasing diversity amongst university faculty and increasing education and awareness regarding the importance of the policy in righting historic wrongs.[44] Additionally, policies could be altered to place more emphasis on holistic admissions standards. Furthermore, other studies have argued that affirmative action could take a different route, in terms of geography-based practices that may ensure similar results.[45] As long as discrimination exists, affirmative action has a purpose. Yet legislators and proponents need to do all they can do make sure that the policy is not making matters worse.

---

[43] Shafer.

[44] Fischer and Massey, "The effects of affirmative action."

[45] Sheryll Cashin, "Place not Race: Affirmative Action and the Geography of Educational Opportunity," *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* 47, no. 4 (2014), 951-958.

Conclusion

The idea for affirmative action dates back to the mid-19th century; however, effective affirmative action policies only took hold in the in mid-1960s. Initially, affirmative action sought to create basic fairness in employment and education by ensuring that discrimination against certain races and ethnicities would not occur. Yet as time progressed, the policy became more concerned with quotas, thus promoting diversity at the expense of fairness.

When examining the initial purpose, it is clear that the policy is necessary; however, when examining it from a modern standpoint, affirmative action should be refined to attempt to reduce any of the negative implications (*e.g.* discriminating one group over another). The program does not reach its full potential when it is denying opportunities to certain groups in favor of others. There are clear and evident benefits as well as glaring flaws. Moving forward, it is significant to work on strengthening those benefits and attempting to reduce the flaws.

Bibliography

"Affirmative Action." *Cornell Law School: Legal Information Institute*. Accessed November 10, 2018. https://www.law.cornell.edu/wex/affirmative_action.

"Affirmative Action Overview." National Conference of State Legislatures. http://www.ncsl.org/research/education/affirmative-action-overview.aspx.

"Affirmative Action: Statement of Affirmative Action Policy." *Society for Human Resource Management*, February 6, 2018. Accessed October 21, 2018. https://www.shrm.org/resourcesandtools/tools-and-samples/policies/pages/affirmativeactionstatementofaffirmativeactionpolicy.aspx.

"Arguments for and Against Affirmative Action." *Mount Holyoke*. Accessed October 18, 2018. https://www.mtholyoke.edu/~jesan20l/classweb/arguments.html.

Benner, Kate. "Justice Dept. Backs Suit Accusing Harvard of Discriminating Against Asian-American Applicants." *The New York Times*, August 30, 2018.

"Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka." *Oyez*. Accessed November 10, 2018. https://www.oyez.org/cases/1940-1955/347us483.

Cashin, Sheryll. "Place not Race: Affirmative Action and the Geography of Educational Opportunity." *University of Michigan Journal of Law Reform* 47, no. 4 (2014): 935-965.

DeBell, Matthew. "Polarized Opinions on Racial Progress and Inequality: Measurement and Application to Affirmative Action Preferences." *Political Psychology* 38, no. 3 (2017).

Deslippe, Dennis. *Protesting Affirmative Action: The Struggle Over Equality After the Civil Rights Revolution*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012.

"Executive Order 10925." *EEOC*. Accessed November 10, 2018. https://www.eeoc.gov/eeoc/history/35th/thelaw/eo-10925.html.

19

Fischer, Mary J. and Douglas S. Massey. "The effects of affirmative action in higher education." *Social Science Research* 36, no. 2 (2007).

Fish, Stanley. "The Nifty Nine Arguments Against Affirmative Action in Higher Education." *The Journal of Blacks in Higher Education,* no. 27 (2000).

Franklin, Delano R. and Samuel W. Zwickel. "Yale Joins Harvard as Target of Federal Probe into Alleged Discrimination Against Asian-Americans." *The Harvard Crimson*, September 27, 2018.

"Freedmen's Bureau." *History*. Accessed November 10, 2018. https://www.history.com/topics/black-history/freedmens-bureau.

Glasner, Kristen M., Christian A. Martell, and Julie R. Posselt. "Framing Diversity: Examining the Place of Race in Institutional Policy and Practice Post-Affirmative Action." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* (2018).

"Guidelines regarding Single Sex Classes and Schools." *U.S. Department of Education*. Accessed November 12, 2018. https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/t9-guidelines-ss.html.

Hartocollis, Anemona. "Does Harvard Admissions Discriminate? The Lawsuit on Affirmative Action, Explained." *The New York Times*, October 15, 2018.

Hurtado, Patricia. "The Future of College Admissions: Experts Weigh the Harvard Case." *Bloomberg*. November 12, 2018.

Kamenetz, Anya. "Here's What's Going on With Affirmative Action and School Admissions." *NPR*, July 7, 2018.

Kellough, J. Edward. *Understanding Affirmative Action: Politics, Discrimination, and the Search for Justice*. Washington D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2006.

"Regents of the University of California v. Bakke." *Oyez*. Accessed November 13, 2018. https://www.oyez.org/cases/1979/76-811.

"Regents of the University of California v. Bakke." *Thirteen*. Accessed December 11, 2018. https://www.thirteen.org/wnet/supremecourt/rights/landmark_regents.html.

Shafer, Leah. "The Case for Affirmative Action." Harvard Graduate School of Education. Accessed October 1, 2018. https://www.gse.harvard.edu/news/uk/18/07/case-affirmative-action.

Shaw, Bill. "Book Review." *Business Ethics Quarterly* (July 1, 2001).

Spann, Girardeau A. *The Law of Affirmative Action: Twenty-five Years of Supreme Court Decisions on Race and Remedies*. New York: NYU Press, 2000.

Strauss, Valerie. "What you should know about race-based affirmative action and diversity in schools." *The Washington Post,* July 3, 2018.

"The History of Affirmative Action in Education." *Pearson*. Accessed October 18, 2018. https://www.pearsoned.com/history-of-affirmative-action-in-education/.

"Title IV." The United States Department of Justice. Accessed November 10, 2018. https://www.justice.gov/crt/fcs/TitleVI-Overview.

21

How Commercial Advertising Enforces Gender Stereotypes among Children and the Ways This Affects Them Psychologically
Abigail Frisoli[1]

Abstract: Some people believe that children of different sexes are born with completely separate preferences and mindsets which are permanent and predetermined. However, children are very influenced by their surroundings, which is often the main deciding factor which is predetermined by parents and caretakers from birth. Separating children by gender puts them into boxes, stunting their ability to make their own decisions and creating stereotypes. This segregation is painfully apparent in commercial advertising and is proven to have affected children psychologically in ways that can be detrimental.

Key words: Gender, stereotypes, children, commercials, advertising, psychological effects, toys, societal conditioning, product placement, advertisement analysis.

The things that people say about gender and the stereotypes that children are exposed to can affect their mindset and future interactions. Though some people may raise the notion that gender stereotypes are in some instances essential sex differences between genders, no child is born wholly with any prejudice or notion that one gender or race is different than another. These are things that they piece together from the social cues around them, which can be detrimental to their interactions with other people in the future. Difference in gender is something that is instilled in most children from an early age. For instance, with baby gender reveals, pink always means girl and blue always means boy because these are the colors that society has chosen to separate these two genders. As these children learn and grow, parents often make gendered choices about their children they may not even consciously realize that they are making. These choices include, but are not limited to, solely introducing a child to toys marketed towards one gender and referring to their sons as inquisitive while deeming their daughters as sensitive before these traits are even developed.

Small children are therefore learning at a young age that certain toys and behaviors are for certain genders, and they may never get exposure to those designated for the opposite gender. Taking this a step further, the toys that are geared towards boys often promote problem-solving and cognitive skills, while the toys that are marketed for young girls often teach girls the skills that they should learn if they were to be doing work around the house. Most children's commercial advertising is targeted towards specific genders and enforce fixed gender roles, divided between the hackneyed sweet, feminine girls and loud, rowdy

---

boys. When children's advertisements enforce the stereotypical separation of the male and female genders, it affects a child's ability to express himself or herself in a way that feels natural and can stunt a child's ability to make his or her own decisions, build relationships within the opposite gender, and to not become conditioned to all-inclusive forms of stereotyping. This division of the sexes at a young age also makes bullying among children an easier playing ground.

The Division of Sexes and Enforcement of Stereotypes through Toys

Instilment of the separation of genders begins at an early age. University of Kentucky professor and author of the book *Parenting Beyond Pink and Blue: How to Raise Your Kids Free of Gender Stereotypes*, Christina Spears Brown confirms that gender consciousness in choosing toys is nonexistent in babies and only presents itself once children begin to pick up social cues about the two genders, which she says happens during the ages of four to five. In fact, studies have found that, in the case of a group of 14-month-old baby boys and girls, the toy in highest demand among the boys was a tea set, which was played with for double the amount of playtime that a truck, train, and motorcycle parking kit received. In the girl babies, these three "boy-gendered" toys got equal to the playing time that dolls did, at 9 percent (Fine and Rush 775). Although at first glance there seems to be a clear divide between what is a toy for boys and what is a toy for girls, Brown explains: "All toys are gender neutral. What is not neutral is the way toys are marketed." This is where the divide begins.

There are clear differences in the appearance and function of toys based on gender. Toys intended for girls are often pink and either are geared to teach girls how to help girls learn how to embrace their role of taking care of others at a young age or are some kind of fantasy toy, such as a fairy princess or a pop star. Meanwhile, the toys marketed to boys often consist of problem-solving and brain stimulation, while some help boys try out various jobs, so that they can get an early idea of what they want to do with their life in the future. "Not surprisingly, the aisles designed for young girls are shockingly pink, focused on beauty, fashion and family role-play, while boys' aisles contain toys that are more centered around destruction, action and building," Jordyn Atkinson observes. "Commercials for stores such as Toys 'R' Us and Walmart depict each gender in different scenes playing separately with their relatively stereotypical toys, such as guns or baby dolls."

Furthermore, girls' toys are often sexualized in a way that boys' toys are not, and boys' toys often exude dominance in a way that girls' toys do not. Take girls' "dolls" and boys' "action figures," which are, in essence, the same type of product: figures that are meant to look like people and be played with as though the figures were people. In a study affiliated with Kenyon College, popular dolls and action figures were analyzed—in particular, the body proportions of these toys in reference to how they were gendered and

23

the degree to which these proportions were supplementary to what they referred to as "heterosexual success." In the study, a total of 72 popular dolls and 71 popular action figures were examined. It was found that 62 percent of dolls were given what was referred to as a "noticeably thin body," while 42.3 percent of action figures had what was classified as "noticeably muscular bodies." Additionally, it was found:

> more thin dolls were portrayed with more sex object features than less thin dolls, including revealing, tight clothing and high-heeled shoes; bodies positioned with a curved spine, bent knee, and head cant; and with a sexually appealing facial expression. More muscular male action figures were more likely than less muscular ones to be shown with hands in fists and with an angry, emotional expression, suggesting male dominance. (Boyd and Murnen 1)

Although dolls and action figures are the same type of toy, the bodies of dolls are built completely different than the bodies of the action figures, tailoring the dolls to fit what companies think that boys and girls should want to play with. Seemingly absent is the availability of toys to girls who are more dominant than submissive and the availability of toys to boys that are not in perfect shape and who are gentler in personality. Ken dolls do fit the gentler personality card, even though he is in perfect shape, giving unrealistic body expectations. These dolls are marketed strictly towards girls, however, so it is not common, or even likely, for a girl to ask for or receive a Ken. Additionally, Ken is designed for the sole purpose of being Barbie's boyfriend (Weaver 1), which would create the same issue in boys that we find in girls, who are being marketed toys that teach them to be the perfect future wife and mother.

It is true that for the most part, children gravitate to the toys of their specific gender, but this is all due to "societal conditioning" (Atkinson). It was found that parents who have sets of twins with one girl and one boy often described their children as thinking differently than one another even in infancy. These assumed differences are partially what encourage parents to choose specific toys for the two different genders. One parent described his twin girl and boy, saying: "He's just a different type of thinker, he likes puzzles and putting things together and taking things apart and she likes imaginary worlds. I think it is the natural gender specific tendency that girls are more creative and the boys are more on the logic, science" (Cubbage 45). While there are certainly differences in the way that male and female sex hormones affect brain development in infants it is nurture, much more than nature, that truly helps a child grow into his or her own during these most formative years. Additionally, if the chemical reactions were truly so different between girls and boys, then these children should still be exposed to all types of toys in order to grow the skills that they possess and build what they are lacking in order to develop into well-rounded individuals.

It is not as though children do not notice that certain toys, they think they might have fun playing with are only marketed as gender-specific. For instance, there was a viral video

24

that came out in 2011 where a young girl was going on a rant about how girls want to play with superheroes just as much as boys do and how boys can like princesses just as much as girls can, asking "Why does all the girls have to buy pink stuff and all the boys have to buy different color stuff?" (Fine and Rush 769).

The Power of Product Placement and Advertisements
Although there is no rule that states that girls cannot purchase a boy's toy and vice versa, it is very hard for them to get exposure to these toys. Boys' and girls' toys are often in separate aisles altogether, and it is easy for a child to tell which aisle is theirs because they are already picking up on social cues, such as the gendered colors of blue and pink, which define these segregated aisles. As Paechter observes, "a major UK supermarket chain has shelves labeled 'boys' toys' and 'girls' toys,' with the former holding a wide variety of playthings, particularly those that involve physical activity, including frisbees, water guns, waveboards, cycling helmets, bats, balls and other outdoor equipment, and the latter mainly displaying dolls, soft toys and craft sets" (66). Even parents who try to keep gender conformity to a minimum for their child may not even realize that their child does not have any exposure to the learning characteristics of the toys of the other gender because they are not aware that toys labeled for boys and girls teach such different things. These children also may not even realize that they may have an inkling for something out of the socially constructed realm of their gender because they have no exposure to these toys and therefore have no idea that they are even there. On the website of the organization Let Toys Be Toys, it reads: "Other buyers may simply be unaware of the restricted choices they are offered. They may not notice that science kits and construction toys are missing from the 'girls' section, or art & crafts and kitchen toys from the 'boys.' If they're never offered the chance, a child may never find out if they enjoy a certain toy or style of play." This site discusses also how children are looking for social clues as they learn about the world and are absorbing these messages on what society believes that girls and boys should prefer. It also again states how this could "turn children away from their true preferences," as these children have no idea what they are missing, or they do but ignore the toys that they truly want to play with because they feel as though it is the wrong choice, so they ignore the feeling. As a solution, Let Toys Be Toys tosses around the idea of retailers stocking toys by "theme and function" as opposed to by gender.

How stores are laid out is not the only problem. Commercial advertising on television is another big culprit when it comes to the gendering of toys. One study conducted by Saatçlier (1997) found that 40 percent of boys watch television for more than 3 hours, while 40 percent of girls watch television for only 2-3 hours (Şener, Gűven, and Boylu 22). In the 1970s, research showed that children under age eight could not distinguish between commercials and non-commercial TV programming. Children younger than four could not

25

distinguish between commercial advertising and reality. Nonetheless, children have far better brand recognition than adults, and children younger than three tend to have simple yet powerful responses to advertisements; there's a correlation between these children seeing other children enjoying their use of a toy and this leads to their want for the toy.

Children are a hugely marketable population. In 1995, children spent $15 billion dollars of their own money, $11 billion of which went to toys, games, clothes, candy, and snacks. When marketing their products, companies are aware that children are relentless and intense in bothering their parents to make a purchase and consider children to be "Trojan Horses" to sell their merchandise to families. According to a study carried out in England, a child watches around 140,000 advertisements until he turns into 18" (Şener, Gűven, and Boylu 22). This translates to a lot of products and media for children to ask for.

Advertisement Analysis

Although there are clearly some commercials out there that feature both genders and promote a toy as marketable to boys and girls, most commercials are separated among genders and have different traits depending on which gender it is appealing to. For example, boys' toy commercials use some of the same rhetoric. This includes words like power, hero, stealth, powerful, vehicle, blasting, and beat (Smith 1). These words have a lot of power and assertion behind them. Some of these words are also things that are more available to boys, such as the word "vehicle." It also includes language of what a young boy is expected to acquire as he becomes a man, such as the words "power" and "stealth." The rhetoric behind commercials geared towards girls are clearly very different. They feature words such as love, magic, babies, mommy, dress, friendship, style, glitter, and delicious (Smith 1). It is apparent that these words are more passive than the ones that appear in commercials geared towards the male gender. They suggest that girls play with things that involve activity inside of the home rather than outside, are more centered towards romance and learning compassionate skills, and are more bubbly and fantastical in comparison to the action-packed vocabulary one might find to describe a boy's toy (Smith 1). Although these descriptions may be accurate for the toy that they are promoting, it should not be used to choose the audience. According to *Children and Advertising: What Do They Think About Advertisements, How Are They Affected by Advertisements?* "Among girls, the most watched advertisement type is 'personal care advertisements' with a ration of 72.2%, whereas this ration is found to be 18.8% for boys. The majority of the boys (82.9%) stated 'car advertisements' as the most watched advertisement type" (Şener, Gűven, and Boylu 25). Young girls should also be allowed to have adventures and learn the rowdy skills that are encouraged in boys, and, in turn, boys should be allowed to show their compassionate and artistic side and not be discouraged from using toys such as EZ Bake Ovens and kitchen sets.

26

In a "Barbie Folding Pretty House" commercial from the 1990s, features of the house are shown off that stereotypically it was assumed most girls should like—for instance, the kitchen and the bathroom. The word family is mentioned in this commercial, and it can be assumed that the reason a girl would receive this dollhouse is so that she can learn the skills to take care of her future family and to get her excited about this role. The house consists of only two colors: pink and white, Barbie's signature. The color pink is something that is most often associated with girls. It has a delicate connotation and is representative of love. This color is also associated with the notion of being sweet and cute, or charming and romantic. Pink items that are often associated with these terms are candy, gum, and roses (Bourn Creative Project). The color white is representative of purity and innocence, something that is not only expected of young girls, but oftentimes carries over as an expectation for women all the way up through young adulthood. This color also represents cleanliness (Bourn Creative Project). This concept of cleanliness draws a parallel with the multitude of boys' toys that encourage going out and getting dirty. There are only girls featured within the commercial until the very end. Only Barbie and her sisters are shown inside of the house, only girls are playing with the house and the dolls, and only girls are singing the song that plays throughout the commercial, describing the house in detail. The only time that consumers get a glimpse of a man throughout the entire commercial is when a Ken doll is shown at the very end, grilling outside. This is one of the few household activities that, stereotypically, men are supposed to be involved in and excited about. Ken is wearing the color blue, which is most commonly used to represent the male gender as opposed to the girls' pink (Bourn Creative Project). Blue is something that symbolizes freedom, imagination, intelligence, and confidence, all of which most parents stereotypically, as previously discussed, would expect their young sons to have, and would expect to find in their daughter's choice of spouse because these are traits that are assumed to not be present within the daughter herself.

In comparison, one could look at a Hot Wheels commercial from the 1990s. There is one boy playing with the cars in this commercial. He is dressed in black, which blends him in with the background, and his body is completely covered besides his eyes, as he is even wearing a mask. This shows how with boys there is much less of a focus on their appearance than with girls, and that their appearance is not needed to sell a product like so often is the way with females. The color black symbolizes power, strength, authority, rebellion, and aggression (Bourn Creative Project), all of which are traits that, stereotypically, are absolutely expected to exist within young boys. The script of the commercial includes many of the common and expected terminology we have discussed. For instance, the product being sold is Hot Wheels Top Speed Ultra Pipe Fight, and the word fight is recurring throughout the commercial, stressing the fact that it is more exciting

27

if the cars were to smash together, even though in real life this would be extremely dangerous.

Psychological Effects

The concept of making children conform to specific stereotypes also can provide ammunition for bullying among children as well because they eventually may learn that girls and boys have specific guidelines to follow. According to Jo Paoletti, the author of *Pink and Blue: Telling the Boys and Girls of America*: "What marketing does is create symbols that people can use to bully people. It's almost like having a recipe and saying these are the ingredients for masculinity and femininity, and if you vary from the recipe, you can get bullied" (Let Toys Be Toys) When children observe other children not conforming to what everyone else is, it can make them appear as outcasts. Because this is so frowned upon among adults, children take these social cues, as they use the adults that they look up to in order to figure out how they should function within society. It is due to these notions that children learn that if someone is not conforming there is something wrong with them, and this is one of the reasons that brings children to getting bullied. Additionally, as these children grow older, it is not that they grow wiser and more accepting. What starts out as a small difference that is noted by a not yet fully educated child begins to turn into adult prejudice. As Carrie Goldman, the author of the award-winning book *Bullied: What Every Parent, Teacher, and Kid Needs to Know About Ending the Cycle of Fear* puts it: "Bullying behaviors occur on a continuum, and as children grow older, they move along to more serious aggressions. What starts as a color—pink, in this case—singles a child out as a target, and the aggression is based in both misogyny and homophobia, which go hand-in-hand" (cited in Let Toys Be Toys).

This bullying does not only have to occur specifically among children. Adults, such as older siblings, family members, and even teachers may join in this bullying because these are the people who teach children the social norms and they expect people to conform to these often even more than children do. Paechter, the author of *Being Boys, Being Girls: Learning Masculinities and Femininites,* writes that "Adults in early years settings also contribute to children's constructions of masculinity and femininity though their implicit and explicit understandings of what is 'natural' behavior in young children" (65). This can cause some internal struggles when children begin to learn their romantic preferences, as romantic and sexual attraction is something that is socially tied to masculinity and femininity. Paetcher takes note that, between the teachers that fellow author Woodward worked with, there were multiple different "approaches to expressions of sexual and romantic attachment between boys and girls: 'Staff distinctly discouraged amorous relationships between pairs of boys, less so between girls and boys, and hardly at all between girls, revealing here, possibly unconsciously, a public homophobic attitude

towards the boys while perhaps seeing the girls' behavior in a non-sexual or sexually passive way'" (Paechter). There are deeply rooted stereotypes that can affect how adults view the way in which children should be interacting with one another. Girls and boys are expected to be flirtatious with one another, so a close relationship between genders is to be anticipated. It is not considered against the path, however, for girls to be extremely close with one another because that is simply considered to be how girls interact within their friendships. When it comes to boys being extremely close with one another, however, the stereotype is that this is too feminine for them to be behaving in such a way and that for boys to be close with one another means that they may develop a romantic relationship with one another and is something that is, even subconsciously, often frowned upon.

Parents often form part of their identity from their children and expect these children to live up to their expectations of what they would want either themselves or their ideal child to be. Therefore, oftentimes parents can get frustrated when their children do not live up to everything that they would expect from them. For example, a dad who dreamed of being a professional football player may get frustrated if he son does not share the same passion for the sport, and may get even more frustrated when he realizes that his son is more interested into something more "feminine," such as gymnastics. Similarly, mothers might expect their daughters to only help around the house and not want to form any kind of future for themselves, when the daughter may actually have a passion for engineering. These expectations begin at infancy. For example, parents reported that they were worried that their baby boys were underweight and not their baby girls, even when body mass index was the same for both genders (Cubbage 38). It is interesting to see how even as children grow older, they are still expected to grow into these roles. It is because of influential factors such as these that adults should be advised not to get too involved in children's self-discovery. "A central tenet of early childhood education is that young children learn best through self-directed experimental free play, with minimal adult intervention," Gray writes. "The dominant developmental discourses in early childhood education consequently suggest that practitioners should not interfere in children's free play" (22). If someone is behind a child at all times with his or her already formed and developed opinions and upbringings, then it will be near impossible for children to learn and make decisions and judgments on their own that are purely based on what they feel and not on what they believe other people think that they should feel.

Conclusion

Commercial advertising is a huge culprit in enforcing gender stereotypes among children. In order to fit into society, it is often expected of girls and boys to act in specific ways that are completely separate from the other gender. This prevents children from being able to form and express his or her own opinions and encourages stereotyping and bullying.

29

Promoting equal playing fields among both genders does not mean that if a girl likes princesses and the color pink that they should not be allowed to embrace their inner frills, just as it similarly means that if a boy is really into trucks that he is not allowed to get dirty. As Carrie Goldman, the author of the award-winning book *Bullied: What Every Parent, Teacher, and Kid Needs to Know About Ending the Cycle of Fear* put it: "Gender equality does not mean stripping the girliness from frilly girls or the masculinity from rough-and-tumble boys. A better tactic would be to encourage our girls and boys to do more cross-gender play without putting down their girly or masculine learnings" (Let Toys Be Toys). What gender equality is actually about is the banishing of stereotypes. To tell a girl that she is too feminine and that she should try to become more cross-gendered and well-rounded is still feeding into the problem. The point of educating people on giving children more gender equal childhoods is simply so that they can experience all that life has to offer them and so that they can make their own decisions about who they are rather than having their preferences predetermined before they are even born.

One brand that successfully pulls off a multi-gender commercial for children is Hess. Although Hess makes toy trucks, the brand's products are advertised towards children of both the male and female gender, defying the construct that only boys should and would want to play with toy trucks. In Hess's 2015 Christmas commercial, the Hess truck comes out, and a scene with Santa and a firefighter is shown. The commercial next cuts to two children, a boy and a girl, inside of the living room of a home, a very gender-neutral room. Bedrooms often can be portrayed as gendered, for instance a boy's room might have blue tones while a girl's room may be painted pink. By having the children in the commercial play in the living room, a room where all people of all genders and all ages find themselves utilizing, it shows that Hess trucks can be enjoyed by virtually anyone. The living room has very neutral tones and a simple Christmas tree. The boy is wearing a green shirt, probably to match the Hess theme, with a gray sweater over it; the girl is wearing a Christmas sweater dress with many Christmas colors such as blue, red and white.

There is no defining factor that specifically targets one gender over another in this commercial. At the end of the advertisement, the Hess truck choir that sings Hess's theme song is featured, with an even amount of girls and boys, all in green and white firefighter uniforms holding the Hess fire truck that the commercial is for. Since there is no gender bias in this commercial, no girl child has to feel weird for wanting a toy truck for Christmas and no boy has to feel weird if he wants to play trucks with a girl. It evens the playing field, which is exactly what children need in order to form their own preferences.

Works Cited

Ali, Moondore, and Mark Blades. "Do Very Young Children Understand Persuasive Intent in Advertisements?" Advertising to Children. Edited by Mark Blades, Caroline Oates, Fran Blumberg, and Barrie Gunter.

Anderson-Nathe, Ben. "Book Review: Being Boys, Being Girls: Learning Masculinities and Femininities." Affilia, vol. 27, no. 1, 2012, 115–116.

Atkinson, Jordyn. "Marketing 'girls' toys vs. 'boys' toys confers sexist gender roles to young children." *The Trail*. Dec. 12, 2014, http://trail.pugetsound.edu/?p=11724.

"Best Classic Hot Wheels Commercials." YouTube, YouTube, 7 Feb. 2017, youtu.be/zvtxnqbp99Q.

Boyd, Hope, and Sarah K. Murnen. "Thin and Sexy vs. Muscular and Dominant: Prevalence of Gendered Body Ideals in Popular Dolls and Action Figures." *Body Image*, vol. 21, 2017, 90–96.

"Bullying: The Role of Gender-Based Marketing." *Let Toys Be Toys*, 4 Oct. 2013, lettoysbetoys.org.uk/bullying-the-role-of-gender-based-marketing/.

Cubbage, April Dawn. "Parent Talk: How Parents Discursively Construct, Co-Construct and Re-Do Gender Expectations and Practices in Their Young Children." University of California. 29 Aug. 2016.

Dinella, Lisa M., et al. "Children's Gender-Typed Toy Interests: Does Propulsion Matter?" *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, vol. 46, no. 5, 2016, 1295–1305.

Fine, Cordelia, and Emma Rush. "'Why Does All the Girls Have to Buy Pink Stuff?' The Ethics and Science of the Gendered Toy Marketing Debate." *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 149, no. 4, 2016, 769–784.

Gray, Colette. "Children at Play. Learning Gender in the Early Years." *International Journal of Early Years Education*, vol. 19, no. 2, 2011, 181–183.

"Hess Toy Truck Christmas Commercial 2015." *YouTube*, YouTube, 21 Dec. 2015, youtu.be/qbWO3z50Ogs.

Klinger, Lori J., et al. "Children's Perceptions of Aggressive and Gender-Specific Content in Toy Commercials." *Social Behavior and Personality: An International Journal*, vol. 29, no. 1, 2001, 11–20.

"Marketing 'Girls' Toys vs. 'Boys' Toys Confers Sexist Gender Roles to Young Children." *The Trail*, 11 Dec. 2014, trail.pugetsound.edu/?p=11724.

Oksman, Olga. "Are Gendered Toys Harming Childhood Development?" *The Guardian*, Guardian News and Media, 28 May 2016.

Smith, Crystal. *Achilles Effect: What Pop Culture Is Teaching Young Boys about Masculinity*. IUniverse, 2011.

"Strategy Design Development." *Bourn Creative*, www.bourncreative.com/.

Timeline. "The History of Gendered Children's Toy Marketing – Timeline." *Timeline*, Timeline, 17 Feb. 2018, timeline.com/history-of-gendered-children-toy-marketing-girls-boys-video-23e4eb822323.

Todd, Brenda K., et al. "Preferences for 'Gender-Typed' Toys in Boys and Girls Aged 9 to 32 Months." *Infant and Child Development*, vol. 26, no. 3, 2016.

Weaver, Caity. "Yes, We Ken." *Gentlemen's Quarterly*, July 2017.

"Who Says You Can't Play with Dolls and Race Cars?" *Moriah Mayhew*, Moriah Mayhew, blogs.longwood.edu/merchantsofcool/2012/04/26/how-commercials-show-gender-stereotypes/

"Why It Matters." *Let Toys Be Toys*. 11 May 2016, lettoysbetoys.org.uk/why-it-matters/.

Pressure to be Perfect
Genevieve Nitzsche

Abstract: Eating disorders have become more prevalent in recent years, as societal standards have gotten harsher. Typically, when non-athletes think about the type of people who develop eating disorders, they may not consider athletes to be among those that are most affected. However, in sports such as wrestling and aesthetic sports, like gymnastics and figure skating, the emphasis of image and the pressure from coaches can be extremely harmful to athletes' mental health. This article discusses specific statistics of the incidence of eating disorders in various sports, but mainly focuses on figure skating, gymnastics, and wrestling. The claim that the main driving force of eating disorders in these athletes is their coach's comments is disputed. Rather, these disorders are caused by an internal struggle that is enhanced due to societal expectations and standards. In the future, health professionals, as well as the general public, should put more of an emphasis on acceptance of different body types and the prevention of eating disorders with the intention of saving many individuals from suffering.

Keywords: Eating disorders, body image, figure skating, gymnastics, wrestling.

There are hundreds of different body types, and while some may be more ideal for executing different stunts, with hard work and perseverance, anyone can accomplish anything, regardless of their body type. This body type stereotype is one of the many reasons athletes develop eating disorders. Eating disorders are very prevalent in many different sports, not just in gymnastics. Wrestlers, for example, have to maintain a certain weight to stay in the same weight class. This sometimes requires losing ten or more pounds in a very short amount of time. While this weight is not necessarily due to increased body fat, many wrestlers stop eating for a day or more in order to meet their criteria. These actions can quickly lead to having a negative body image in general and can adversely affect the lives of athletes.

Many times, these thoughts are not caused by an internal force, but rather by the treatment the athletes receive from their coaches and peers. If an athlete is not meeting the criteria for the ideal body composition, coaches may give her or him harder workouts during practice. While these workouts are not necessarily physically harmful, they separate the athlete from the rest of the team, which can lead to a negative self-image.

In recent years, however, there has been a shift throughout the athletic community in attempts to raise awareness for mental illness and eating disorders. The prevalence of eating disorders has decreased overall as a result, but there are still stereotypes that exist about the typical body of an athlete, which still may lead to eating disorders. Although other

factors such as coaching play a role in the levels of eating disorders in both males and females, the desire to fit the stereotypical body shape in certain sports serve as main driving factors.

As of 2016, it was estimated by the National Institute of Health (NIH) that roughly 10 million women and 1 million men suffer from some form of an eating disorder in the United States alone ("Eating Disorders"). However, these numbers may not be entirely accurate due to the stigma and ambiguity surrounding eating disorders as a whole. It is believed that the prevalence of eating disorders is higher in individuals who are athletes versus those who are not.

An eating disorder is defined as "a group of conditions marked by abnormal eating habits that reduce the quality of a person's physical or mental health" ("Ask Dr. Rob about eating disorders"). This definition includes a variety of conditions. Anorexia nervosa is the most commonly known, followed by bulimia. Anorexia nervosa is a condition in which an individual loses their appetite and, if treatment is not sought out, ends in starvation. Bulimia is another very prevalent disorder. Typically binge eating is also associated with bulimia. The individual will eat copious amounts of food and then purge, or vomit, to get rid of the food they ingested. Less commonly known disorders exist as well, including orthorexia, or an obsession with "healthy" or "proper" eating.

Research has found that the prevalence of eating disorders in sports varies depending on the category in which the sport belongs (Giel 555). There are six different categories of sports: technical sports, endurance sports, aesthetic sports, weight dependent sports, ball games, and power sports. Each individual sport is listed below the category title it falls into. For example, boxing, weightlifting, judo, taekwondo, and wrestling (freestyle) are considered weight-dependent sports. Giel surveyed athletes of different sport categories regarding body weight, BMI, the presence of typical eating disorder symptoms such as positive body image, negative body concept, constant dieting, and use of compensatory behaviors (555). As a whole, the women involved in the study had a greater percentage of individuals who perceived themselves negatively, constant dieting, and use of compensatory behaviors. Aesthetic sports had 15.2% of underweight individuals and zero overweight individuals. This category also had the highest percentage of individuals with a negative body concept (13.6%) and constant dieters (13.0%). Weight-dependent sports were a close second in the constant dieting category with 12.4 percent. This category also had the highest rate of use of compensatory behaviors with 78.4 percent.

These statistics reveal a great deal about the culture of different sports. The aesthetic sports, such as gymnastics and figure skating, have a higher incidence of risk factors for eating disorders. Not only do these athletes need to be light in order to prevent injury, they also are constantly judged on their appearance, both on and off the rink. Another study conducted by a group of scientists from BioMed International confirms the fact that the

34

incidence of eating disorders is higher in aesthetic sports: "female athletes from leanness sports (such as dancers and gymnasts) reported higher levels of body dissatisfaction than athletes engaged in nonleanness sports (*e.g.*, ball sports), regardless of participation level" ("Body Image of Highly Trained Female Athletes Engaged in Different Types of Sport"). Regardless of the dedication and involvement level of the athlete, there is still higher incidence of negative body image as compared to non-aesthetic sports. Weight dependent sports, such as wrestling and taekwondo, however, have higher incidences of compensatory behaviors, such as vomiting or taking laxatives because they need to maintain a certain weight to stay in their respective weight classes.

Many of the athletes of these sports have constant battles with their weight, which can cause toxic thoughts and actions. According to a journal published by the NCAA, risk factors for eating disorders include:

> Sport body stereotypes and belief that losing weight will increase sport performance, pressure (real or perceived) from coaches or others to lose weight, observed eating and exercise behaviors of teammates and competitors, revealing uniforms, similarity between "good athlete" traits and symptoms of disordered eating, [and] presumption of health based on good performance. (Brown 26)

While a coach's perception is mentioned, most of these risk factors involve stereotypes or societal influences, such as the presumption of health based on performance and revealing uniforms. If these ideals did not exist in society, the incidence of eating disorders may not be as prominent in the athletic world today.

Figure Skating

Figure skating is a sport that requires great amounts of strength and balance, as well as grace. As opposed to gymnastics, figure skaters do not typically have what some may call "bulky" bodies. While these athletes have lots of muscle, it is not usually as visible as those in gymnasts. For this reason, many skaters struggle with their body image. They are expected to be tall and lean with a very low body mass index. Having a higher body mass not only makes their appearance less graceful to some, but it also makes it more difficult for them to execute certain maneuvers. In some instances, coaches may notice an athlete struggling and may suggest that she or he should lose a few pounds. Yet this rationale can have a negative effect on the mental health of these athletes and may have destructive physical consequences.

We can see one example of this toxic coach-athlete relationship in the career of Japanese figure skater Akiko Suzuki. Suzuki had been struggling with her jumps and was desperate for a way to better her performances when her coach suggested she lose a few pounds to lighten the strain on her body. However, she lost more than a few pounds very quickly. Her coach was not the only factor for her weight loss. When interviewed, she

35

said: "There were all these younger skaters coming along with good proportions, and I started wishing for longer legs. I got a real complex" ("Figure skating: Eating disorders dull skating's luster as awareness grows"). Suzuki felt pressure to be like the other, younger skaters, but since she could not change her height or the length of her legs, she tried to change her weight. She lost roughly one-third of her body weight in two months and soon after was diagnosed with anorexia nervosa. This severe weight was detrimental to her career and her health. Eventually, she sought out treatment and was able to compete in the 2006 and 2010 Olympic games. Prior to these games, however, it took her a year to be able to execute a jump, due to her low muscle tone and lack of nutrition.

Anorexia nervosa is not the only eating disorder found in figure skaters. Bulimia is also very relevant. The book *Little Girls in Pretty Boxes* by Joan Ryan discusses in detail the relevance of bulimia and other eating disorders, as well as the role of body image in these athletes. Ryan quotes one skating coach saying, "[i]mage… is everything" (Ryan 97). She goes on to say: "[o]ff-ice training often includes 'mirror time,' when skaters practice the facial expressions they'll use in their programs. In skating no aesthetic detail goes unnoticed, on or off the ice" (Ryan 97). The pressure placed on these athletes constantly to look their best is very toxic. It becomes an obsession and, for many of them, turns into a persistent battle between their body and mind.

Ryan also details the story of Susie Wynne, a competitive skater, and her battle with bulimia. Wynne's coach had suggested she lose a few pounds after forcing her to weigh herself in front of him. He decided it was too high for his liking; the result was that she: "stopped eating, threw up, took laxatives, tried everything… She was losing control. Food became the focus of her life off the ice… She would eat an entire pizza in a sitting, then vomit" (Ryan 98,99). One of her coaches was later quoted saying: "'[figure skating] is a whole image sport. It's bullshit" (Ryan 99). Wynne was desperate to be perfect because of the nature of figure skating. While her initial desire to lose weight was due to a comment made by her coach, it quickly turned into an internal drive caused by the pressure of society to fit the "mold" of a figure skater's body.

Gymnastics

Like figure skating, gymnastics is considered an aesthetic sport. Many gymnasts struggle with the same pressures not only from their coaches, but also from the stereotypes associated with their sport. When someone does not quite fit the mold of the ideal body, they may receive hate or criticism from their coaches and peers. Unlike figure skating, gymnastics is a sport more focused on the amount of power an individual has. While figure skaters still need to be very strong to be able to perform their skills, they are less known for their bulky appearance. Gymnasts typically have very prominent muscles and a slightly different body type. Even if a figure skater does not look exactly like everyone else, as long

36

as she or he is able to execute the skills required, advance is possible. In gymnastics, however, coaches often keep athletes back from progressing to the next level because of body type. While the gymnastics world is becoming more accommodating and open to a variety of body types, figure skating is starting to accept these body types more as well.

In her autobiography, Olympic gymnast Jennifer Sey details her struggle with eating disorders, harsh coaches, her Olympic dreams, and her parent's influence throughout her career. From the beginning, she struggled with her self-confidence saying, "[m]y entire childhood was plagued by thoughts of subparness…and I withdrew into a state of self-hatred and shame. Ironically, growing competence usually amplified the self-criticism, my guard against complacency" (Sey 91). She had a constant internal battle because she never felt like she was good enough. Gymnastics was her one passion, and she tells about how she would have done anything to be successful. She attended many different training camps and competitions in hopes of becoming an Olympian.

Her coaches at home were usually supportive of her; however, one particular coach was not. His name was Gary Goodson. Sey describes how many of the athletes feared him because of the intensity of his training. He was always very up front with his opinions and "[h]e wanted wind up dolls that could spring their taut bodies into the air performing unprecedented flips and twists" (Sey 89). He had very unrealistic expectations for the athletes in his gym and would treat anyone who did not fit his ideal mold differently. When he worked with Jennifer after she had attended an elite competition in San Francisco, he called her "Dough Girl, as [she] lacked the muscular physique of his favorite" (Sey 89). Sey was very talented at this time, but because she did not have the exact body type this particular coach wanted, she was treated terribly. This lead her down a dangerous path. While Goodson's intentions may not have been to ruin her dreams, he successfully crushed them. Sey, however, does not blame Goodson. She says: "[i]t was me. I was my own tormenter" (92). Her previous internal battles with her self worth had previously existed, her coach just enlarged them. These internal struggles were mostly caused by her tendency to compare herself to the standard gymnast body and what the rest of society thought Olympic gymnasts should look like.

Sey eventually developed an eating disorder and became very sick. Luckily for her, she received treatment and ended up in the Olympics. Many gymnasts, however, are not as lucky. Had the stereotypes and pressure from society's ideals of perfection not existed, Sey's coach may not have said the things he did, and she may not have had such a rough road to success.

37

Wrestling

When many people think about eating disorders in sports, they usually associate predominantly female, graceful sports like the aforementioned gymnastics and figure skating. Many do not think about weight cutting, predominately male sports, such as wrestling. There is, however, a very high incidence of compensatory behaviors and constant dieting in these sports. In figure skating and gymnastics, the stereotypical figure is very slender. In wrestling and more male dominated sports "a 'muscular ideal' has been central to research among men… researchers have argued that the increased objectification of men in Western society has led to an ideal male figure that is both highly muscular and also very lean" (Ahlich).

Research has found that the objectification and ideal that men need to be muscular and have little body fat is detrimental to the mental health of men. In sports like wrestling, not only are these athletes being held at these standards in society, they also have to maintain a certain weight to remain in their competition class. Many times, these athletes have to drop significant amounts of weight in a very short amount of time. This requirement can lead to extremely unhealthy behaviors, such as purging and not eating for a few days. Sometimes, the desire to lose weight does not stop just to maintain their weight class. If the individual has a negative body image to begin with, they may continue these unhealthy behaviors outside of when they are "required" to. Their negative body image is usually due to their internal comparison of themselves to others, and if they are not as muscular or "good-looking" as others, they may take harmful action to fix it.

Conclusion

Today's society places a strong emphasis on appearances. The consequences of this emphasis are not good for the mental health of those who succumb to the pressure of fitting the stereotypes. These individuals may partake in harmful actions due to mental illness from diseases such as depression and eating disorders.

Athletes, especially those in aesthetic and weight cutting sports, feel this pressure and succumb to it very often. Their coaches may have an influence initially, but the continuation and manifestation of the disease are usually caused by an internal conflict.

Works Cited

Ahlich, Rica, et al. "Supplemental Material for Body Talk, Athletic Identity, and Eating Disorder Symptoms in Men." *Psychology of Men & Masculinity* (2018).

Brown, Gary T, editor. *Mind, Body, and Sport Understanding and Supporting Student-Athlete Mental Wellness*. NCAA, 2014.

"Eating Disorders." *National Institute of Mental Health*, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, www.nimh.nih.gov/health/statistics/eating-disorders.shtml.

Giel, Katrin Elisabeth, et al. "Eating Disorder Pathology in Elite Adolescent Athletes." *The International Journal of Eating Disorders*, vol. 49, no. 6, June 2016, 553–562.

Harvard Health Publishing. "Ask Dr. Rob about Eating Disorders." Harvard Health Blog, Harvard Health Publishing, www.health.harvard.edu/mind-and-mood/ask-dr-rob-about-eating-disorders.

Lies, Elaine. "Figureskating: Eating Disorders Dull Skating's Luster as Awareness." Reuters, Thomson Reuters, 4 Jan. 2018.

Ryan, Joan, and Jamie Dantzscher. *Little Girls in Pretty Boxes: The Making and Breaking of Elite Gymnasts and Figure Skaters*. Warner Books, 1996.

Sey, Jennifer. *Chalked Up: My Life in Elite Gymnastics*. Harper, 2009.

Sexual Assault of United States Olympic Athletes:
Gymnastics, Taekwondo, and Swimming
Chloe Meenan

Abstract: The distribution of power in American Olympic sports has made room for the development of a culture of sexual assault. This culture has continued to grow and the organizations in authority have not done enough to put a stop to the abuse. First, I will address the troubles that victims have when sharing their stories, due to the distribution of power within the organizations, namely in gymnastics, taekwondo, and swimming. I focus on the Me Too Movement and the influence that social media has had in making strides towards raising awareness about sexual assault. I will explore the specifics of the abuse within each sport and the women who shared their stories to prevent similar things from happening to others. I also focus on how each coach abused his power and used their position to manipulate the athletes, while using the rules of each sport to their advantage. I spend some time discussing the corruption and neglect of the organizations to put a stop to the abuse immediately. My aim is to educate the reader on both the severity of the culture of sexual assault and the importance of taking a stand against the abusers and the organizations that let it happen.

Keywords: Sexual assault, Olympic sports, gymnastics, taekwondo, swimming.

Olympic athletes are some of the strongest athletes in the world, not only for their physical ability but also for their mental fortitude. Many athletes have been sexually abused by their coaches or physicians, the people who they put the most trust in. In gymnastics, taekwondo, and swimming, there were many cases of coach-inflicted sexual assault on United States Olympic athletes. And in many cases, the organizations themselves allowed the abuse to occur.

In 2017, the Me Too movement was sparked by a tweet from an actress, Alyssa Milano, who aimed to give victims of sexual abuse a voice. This opened the gates to women all over the world sharing their stories about sexual abuse and these individuals became known as "The Silence Breakers." Some United States Olympians were among the many women who shared their own stories of sexual abuse. Most famously, the women of the USA's Gymnastics Teams from 2012 and 2016 spoke out about their teams' osteopathic physician Larry Nassar, who had been sexually abusing the athletes for years, even after athletes brought the issues to USA Gymnastics. The Me Too Movement was powerful enough to bring about changes in the legal system, developing laws to protect victims and put their attackers behind bars. The distribution of power in American Olympic sports has

allowed a culture of sexual assault to arise without proper measures taken to protect our athletes and bring their attackers to justice.

The Problems that Victims Face

Victims of sexual assault usually do not come forward for years, even decades, after the abuse. Victims may feel ashamed or doubtful that their stories will be believed. They often feel powerless and do not think that their situation will get any better, so they fight against the trauma in silence. Victims are even less likely to report, when the attacker has a position of power, which is why many jurisdictions are seeking to extend the statute of limitations for such cases, especially those involving minors (Fuchs 74). The system seems more designed to protect the sport and the people in power than in protecting victims or dispensing with justice (Fuchs 47). Nancy Hogshead-Makar, a gold medalist in swimming said, "there's this implicit understanding that coaches can find their romantic or sexual partner from within the athletes they coach" (Starr). These relationships have been prohibited since 2013, but the U.S Olympic Committee had to pressure USA swimming to adopt this rule (Starr). This is an example of how USA Swimming made little to no effort to stop or prevent the abuse within their organization.

The Me Too Movement and Women's Empowerment

The Me Too Movement spread like wildfire after Alyssa Milano tweeted, "If you've been sexually harassed or assaulted write 'me too' as a reply to this tweet" (@Alyssa_Milano). Within 24 hours, the post received thousands of replies and inspired women and men around the world to share their personal stories. The movement provided victims with a way to break the silence and take back some of the power that was stolen from them by their attackers. "In the weeks after Milano's tweet, the "MeToo movement—which the activist Tarana Burke created more than a decade earlier—became a widespread battle cry for those seeking to show that sexual harassment is not an isolated incident, and nor is sexual assault rare," journalist Mary Pflum wrote. "The results are far-reaching—dozens of powerful men accused, many of them toppled, a handful criminally charged" (Pflum). This movement made it possible to put a stop to these predators and bring awareness to a problem that has been going on for way too long.

Another way that the media played an important role in raising awareness was through music. Maroon 5's song, "Girls like you ft. Cardi B" featured the Olympians Chloe Kim, Alex Morgan, and Aly Raisman, a powerful force in the Me Too movement. The video came out during a time where the world was ready for powerful female role models and features women who are making a stand for female empowerment (Maroon 5). This revival of the women's rights movement is exactly what the world needed, especially at a time where sexual assault was growing.

41

Gymnastics

Over 150 victims directly addressed Lawrence G. Nassar in court, with Nassar telling the judge from the Ingham County courtroom that it was difficult for him to hear their statements. The women included gymnasts, dancers, rowers, runners, softball players, soccer players, volleyball players, a swimmer, and a skater. Most of his accusers were minors when the assaults occurred.

As the hearing progressed, more and women decided to tell their stories. There was a pattern of abuse for over 20 years (Hauser). Gymnasts from the USA Olympic Gymnastics teams of 2012 and 2016 were included in the 150 survivors that testified against Nassar. Simone Biles, McKayla Maroney, Gabby Douglas, Aly Raisman, Madison Kocian, Kyla Ross, Jordyn Wieber, and Jamie Dantzscher are among Nassar's accusers. Jordan Wieber, an Olympic medalist, explained: "I thought that training for the Olympics would be the hardest thing I would ever have to do. But, in fact, the hardest thing I would ever do is process that 'I am a victim of Larry Nassar.'" McKayla Maroney, a two-time Olympic medalist said, "I had a dream to go to the Olympics, and the things that I had to endure to get there were unnecessary and disgusting." One of the most powerful testimonies came from Aly Raisman, a six-time Olympic medalist who said "Let this sentence strike fear in anyone who thinks it is O.K. to hurt another person. Abusers, your time is up. The survivors are here, standing tall, and we are not going anywhere."

Nassar used his title and the respect he gained for treating the athletes to hide the abuse. Some claimed that Nassar abused them at the Karolyi Ranch, which is located outside of Huston. They also have said that he abused them at international competitions and around the globe, even at the Olympics. There were many instances where parents had been in the room with their children while they were being assaulted, but they did not realize. They trusted that Nassar was helping their daughters and never thought he would abuse them. Not all of Nassar's abuse stemmed from a doctor-patient power imbalance, but he was a shockingly brazen public predator, who ended up getting sentenced 40 to 175 years for his crimes.

Taekwondo

Taekwondo focuses on jumping and spinning kicks and features strict discipline and a regimented hierarchy; athletes address their coach as "master" or "sir." Questioning any instruction is not done. According to the 1999 book, *Taekwondo: The State of the Art*: "It does not matter whether what the instructor asks is possible, or whether a student feels like doing that particular drill or not. In response to a command, the only proper response is 'Yes, sir' or 'Yes, ma'am'...Absolute respect takes on the form of something deeper—a willingness to obey" (Fuchs 70). This distribution clearly makes room for the abuse of the

42

trust and respect that the athletes give their coaches, without hesitation. Steven and Jean Lopez severely abused their power as some of the best taekwondo coaches in assaulting many of the athletes they worked with. As Jeremy Fuchs and Lauren Green put it in their *Sports Illustrated* article: "Jean's and Steven's winning image hid a dark truth: They used their power and influence—enhanced by the sport's code of obedience—to systematically rape and abuse women and underage girls" (Fuchs and Green 71). The brothers left the women so hurt that they were forced to leave their sport that they once had loved so much.

Gaby Joslin and Heidi Gilbert were USA Taekwondo Olympians that were abused by the brothers and broke the silence by telling their stories. Before the German Open, Jean told Joslin to lose 20 pounds, so she could compete as a bantam weight of 122 pounds. She didn't question him, following the codes of the sport. He informed her than he would not be traveling to Germany and instead, Steven was going to go. Joslin greeted him in an elevator and, "Then, according to a complaint filed later in federal court, Joslin says that Steven didn't answer but grabbed her hips, pushed her against the wall and told her, 'You feel great as a bantam.'" Joslin felt alarmed, but she felt that she could not confront him if she wanted him to help her make the United States' Olympic team. She left the elevator and did not tell anybody about the incident for 12 years.

Joslin wrote Steven a letter explaining her concerns and wanted to build a constructive athlete-coach relationship. After she handed Steven the letter, he came into her room and as she alleges in a lawsuit, he put on a pornographic movie and raped her. After the incident, Joslin went home and decided not to return to taekwondo. There were other such instances of the two men using their positions as coaches to take advantage of women and taking away from them the sport that they loved.

Swimming

Olympic swimmer Ariana Kukors accused Sean Hutchinson of sexually assaulting her when she was 16-years old. Hutchinson gained power with his position as assistant coach on the 2008 Olympic swim team in Beijing. He was also the head coach of the 2009 U.S. team at the world championships. Hutchinson resigned after allegations that he was in an improper sexual relationship with one of his swimmers were raised. "In a news release, Bob Allard, Kukors' attorney and an outspoken critic of Olympic sports organizations' handling of sex abuse prevention, accused USA Swimming of failing to act on suspicions of abuse" (Hobson). Kukors expressed that Hutchinson started grooming her for a sexual relationship when she was just 13-years old.

Sarah Ehekircher accused her swim coach, Scott McFarland, of sexual misconduct over two decades ago. She claims that he first assaulted her when she was 17-years old on a trip to California, while he claims they had a consensual relationship when she was 18-years old. USA Swimming did not discipline him after a hearing in 2010. Hutchinson used

43

his position of power to manipulate a little girl, but that little girl grew into a strong woman who would no longer stand to be abused.

Corruption and Cover-Ups

McKayla Maroney reached a $1.25 million confidential statement with USA Gymnastics around 2016 to remain silent about Larry Nassar sexually assaulting her (Marquez). USA Gymnastics is responsible for setting the rules, policies, organizing clubs, promoting the sport, developing athletes, training coaches, and running as many as 4,000 events every year all over the country.

Before the 2020 Olympics in Tokyo, USA Gymnastics needs to elect an entirely new board, find a training center, get new sponsors, select national teams that will qualify to compete, and comply with any investigations related to Nassar. Recently, USA Gymnastics filed for Chapter 11 bankruptcy to ensure their survival. John Manly, an attorney that is representing more than 150 women who accused Nassar of sexual misconduct, explained that: "We have depositions and request for other discovery and subpoenas lined up to get at the meat of what they knew and when they knew it [about the sexual abuse]. Bankruptcy stops that because there is an automatic stay on litigation" (Park). In filing for Chapter 11 bankruptcy, USA Gymnastics is delaying the U.S. Olympic Committee from revoking their status as the governing body for gymnastics at the Olympic level.

After multiple sexual assault allegations in Olympic Sports, Safe Sport was created by the U.S. Olympic Committee. The Protecting Young Victims from Sexual Abuse and Safe Sport Authorization Act was passed to "improve policies to protect athletes from sexual abuse, make reporting safer and easier for victims, and extend the statute of limitations for these abused children" (Urie). At first it seemed like it was serving its purpose because: "Since its establishment, SafeSport has levied 345 sanctions to people across 50 organizations. Some sports have had no suspensions or bans. Taekwondo has had 12; gymnastics, which has had 57 coaches or athletes disciplined, has the most of any sport. Track and field has had 43, swimming 31 and hockey 30" (Fuchs 74). Jean's name was removed from the list and his accusers were furious. Gilbert expressed how the system had failed her and the other women who spoke out about the abuse by their coach, even though a permanent ban had been placed on him.

In 2010, USA Swimming became aware of the rumored relationship between Hutchinson and Ariana. They took no action to protect her or any of the other swimmers. The worst part of this lack of urgency in protecting the female athletes is that the organizations were so quick to hire lawyers to protect themselves and their image. Time and time again these organizations were filled with corruption and overrun by cover-ups.

Steps to Take to Correct the Issues

Aly Raisman shared her reaction to some of the organizations attempts at reforming the organization tweeting: "My teammates & I reported Nassar's abuse to USAG in 2015. We now know USOC & lawyers at Faegre Baker Daniels (Mary Bono's firm) were also told then, yet Nassar continued to abuse children for 13 months!? Why hire someone associated with the firm that helped cover up our abuse?" (@Aly_Raisman).

Although USA Gymnastics has taken steps to ratify the problems, it may be beneficial if an entirely new organization oversees them. Additionally, the sponsors for these sports should not support any of the organizations until they replace any employee that did not actively work to stop the abuse.

The question of whether having more women in the coaching ranks would help prevent sexual assault of athletes has also been raised. There are not many female swim coaches at the elite level. There are a relatively equal amount of women coaches, but they work disproportionately with the younger players (Starr). It is clear that the organizations must adopt a new and comprehensive strategy. But they first need to admit that these women had in fact been assaulted, and they did nothing to stop it.

Conclusion

Instead of focusing on image and winning, organized sports should be worried about protecting athletes. The corruption runs deep within USA Gymnastics, USA Taekwondo, and USA Swimming. It has taken way too long for the abuse to even be recognized, but social media has helped to make drastic improvements in how the culture is viewed.

It is evident that there are some glaring issues that the United States Olympic Committee needs to fix immediately. Especially with the 2020 Tokyo Olympics quickly approaching, the organization needs to consider a fresh start.

Works Cited

"Ariana Kukors, Olympic Swimmer, Accuses Coach Sean Hutchison of Sexual Abuse." *Washingtonpost.Com*, 2018.

"As USA Swimming Grapples with Sexual Abuse, Athletes Cite Lack of Female Coaches." *Morning Edition.* July 4, 2018.

Fuchs, Jeremy, and Lauren Green. "Fighting Back." *Sports Illustrated*, vol.129, no. 6, Sept. 2018, 68   .

Hogshead-Makar, Nancy. "Addressing Sexual Abuse in Club and Olympic Sports." *Athletic Business*, vol. 42, no. 1, Jan. 2018, 26-27.

"Larry Nassar, USA Gymnastics, World Sport Chicago & International Federation of Gymnastics Sued for Sexual Assault of Gymnast During Chicago Competition in Civil Rights Suit." *PR Newswire*, 2018.

Maroon 5, director. *Maroon 5- Girls Like You Ft. Cardi B*. *YouTube*, YouTube, 30 May 2018, www.youtube.com/watch?v=aJOTlE1K90k.

Milano, Alyssa (@Alyssa_Milano). "If you've been sexually harassed or assaulted write 'me too' as a reply to this tweet." 15 October 2017, 1:21 p.m. Tweet.

Morton, Haley O. "License to Abuse: Confronting Coach-Inflicted Sexual Assault in American Olympic Sports." *William & Mary Journal of Women & the Law*, vol. 23, no. 1, Fall 2016, 141-171.

Park, Alice. "Why USA Gymnastics' Bankruptcy Will Delay Abuse Survivors' Search for the Truth." *Time*, 6 December 2018.

Pflum, Mary. "A Year Ago, Alyssa Milano Started a Conversation about #MeToo. These Women Replied." *NBCNews.com*, NBCUniversal News Group, 15 Oct. 2018, www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/year-ago-alyssa-milano-started-conversation-about-metoo-these-women-n920246.

Raisman, Alexandra (@Aly_Raisman). 15 October 2018, 1:01 p.m. Tweet.

Starr, Alexandra. "Former USA Taekwondo Coach Banned from The Sport for Sexual Misconduct." *NPR*, NPR, 4 Apr. 2018, www.npr.org/2018/04/04/599112428/former-usa-taekwondo-coach-banned-from-the-sport-for-sexual-misconduct.

Urie, Mary. "Sexual Exploitation in the Sports Industry: An Abuse of Power." *National Center on Sexual Exploitation*, 16 Feb. 2016, endsexualexploitation.org/articles/sexual-exploitation-sports-industry-abuse-power/.

"U.S. Olympic Sexual Abuse Investigation." *States News Service*, 2018.

The Value of a Sports Franchise:
The Influence of Coaches, Fans, and Players
Montgomery Gray

This article examines existing data to consider the factors that go into the valuation of a sports franchise. Rather than assuming a narrow monetary calculation, I argue for a broader perspective that includes the often incalculable influence of coaches, fans, and players.

Key words: Sports franchises, sports teams, sports, economics.

For all the attention it devotes to professional sports, the United States has not devised an accurate means of measuring a team's value. Is value simply determined by net profit? Is it simply that a winning team has inherently more value than a team with a losing record? Or what other factors might be involved? This article aims to answer those questions. Perhaps the most common approach is to focus on profitability, or the simple monetary value of a franchise. The true value also consists in the quality of the coaches, the fan base, and the players associated with the team. In that sense, even though a team may have the worst record in a league, there total value could be much greater.

Coaches
With a steady rise in popularity of basketball, for example, the importance of coaches to teams has grown tremendously. This can be seen through the increase in salaries to many coaches at both the professional and intercollegiate levels ("College coaches,'" 2017). The compensation for coaches has increased to reflect how influential they are to the players and to the bottom line.

The importance of basketball coaches to a team is revealed in surveys and testimonials. A survey conducted by Stacy A. Forsythe, a graduate student at Western Kentucky University at the time, interviewed multiple collegiate athletes who went through coaching changes. One of these athletes competed on their college women's basketball team for two years before experiencing a coaching change (Coach A was replaced by Coach B) after a bad season. With the change from Coach A to Coach B, the next season was a complete success for the team as they even advanced to the NCAA tournaments. The informant also discusses her "trust in the new head coach to develop a successful program," as well as "Coach B's ability to bring everyone up to speed" (Forsythe, 2015).

A change in coaches is a tremendous burden on a team, but when the coach is strong and influential, it can lead to major success. The team began to decline and was losing value, until the new coach came in and was able to turn it around. Coach B remained strong and through an ability to influence players was able to reverse the team's direction.

How exactly does a coach inspire a losing team? *Facing the Giants* is a 2006 film that follows the true story of a football coach, Grant Taylor, who pulls his team together to help redeem the season. After six seasons of posting a losing season and beginning the seven 0-3, Taylor evaluated his coaching style and was able to inspire his team to not lose another game. The Eagles, Taylor's team, advanced to the state championships and would go on to clinch the title.

At one point in the film, one of players believes that there was no chance that the team could win the state championship, so Taylor has him do a death crawl, while one of his teammates sits on his back and is blind-folded. Taylor does not give the player a certain distance to travel, just to give all he can throughout the whole crawl. Taylor was there yelling to keep going and that the player only had a little left to go, and by the end of it, the player was able to make it all the way to the other end zone. The player never believed that he could have made it that far and thought that he only made it halfway across the field. The inspiration that Taylor has on to his players allows him to get his best effort from them, making the team more competitive but also more valuable.

Inspiring twenty or more players as they prepare for one of the most physically challenging sports is a very difficult task. A hockey coach must string together the perfect words for a five to ten-minute speech before each period that keeps his players energized and focus on their goals. The inspiration that they bring to their players will determine if the team will come out with a victory.

Herb Brooks was one of the best at inspiring his team to leave everything they have on the ice. He is best known for coaching the 1980 gold medal-winning U.S. Olympics men's ice hockey team. The team started as twenty individuals, many who played against each other at rival colleges, who were talented but could not work together. With Brooks at the helm, the team became a family and went to defy the odds and defeat the dominant U.S.S.R. at the Olympic Games. Documented in a book and a movie, Brooks pre-game speech has become one of the most notable moments in sports history. With a silence within the locker room, Brooks delivers his speech that was only written on a scrap of yellow paper. Three short sentences stuck out the most: "You were born to be a player. You were meant to be here. This moment is yours" (Coffey, 2005). His words mattered. The inspiration he was able to provide to his players allowed them to take down what was the best team in the world.

Without a strong coach, the 1980's U.S. Men's Ice Hockey team would not have had the success that they did. The influence of Brooks on the team made them effective and competitive in ways they would not otherwise have been.

Fans

Coaches of sports teams influence players through their knowledge and inspiration, but the fans give players something more to play for. The pride of the city can also keep players focused and dedicated to the task of winning. Fans can also have an impact on the monetary value of a sports team by attending games and buying merchandise.

A prime example of this comes from when the Charlotte Hornets relocated and later became the New Orleans Pelicans. The relocation was prompted from the little support the team had in Charlotte, but in New Orleans, the team only grew. The valuation of the team has almost tripled in recent years which, "can primarily be attributed to new ownership investing in trades for superstar athletes and obtaining superstar athletes through the NBA draft, which in turn increased the overall competitiveness of the franchise and increased fan interest" (Rozier, 2018). The Pelicans were struggling with fan support, but once they moved and were able to grow their support, the value of the team increased. The number of fans has a direct relationship on the overall value of a franchise.

It is clear to see the support that football fans have for their teams on game days. They are fully committed to their team and influence the team's value significantly. One team that it can clearly see be impactful on is the Dallas Cowboys. In 2009, the Cowboys opened their new stadium and saw their local revenue, "increase from $280 million to $420 million due to the team's ability to sell personal seat licenses" (Abreu and Spradley, 2016). The new stadium consisted of numerous club and luxury seats that many fans purchased. Commitment to their team led many fans to spend anywhere between $150,00-$900,000 on these seats, which leads to their team being valued higher than others.

Another important part of the Cowboys' increased revenue came from the sale of apparel. Even if a fan cannot be at every game, he or she can still show their support by buying merchandise. The Cowboys capitalized on this as, "the Cowboys' 25% increase in worth from 2015 was fueled by their ability to control local revenue from merchandise sold apart from the NFL's licensing agreement" (Abreu and Spradley, 2016). Support of fans also inspires teams to strive to do better to prove that they deserve the support. The overall influence of the fans through the purchase of seats and merchandise increases the monetary value of the franchise and leads to better outcomes, especially for a team's home games.

The purchase of merchandise is also a heavy influence on a hockey team's monetary value. For example, during the Pittsburgh Penguins versus Arizona Coyotes game in December of 2017. The Coyotes were the home team which typically allows for an advantage in support from the fans, but after a dominant season before, the Penguins had the complete support of the fans in the stadium. Within the seats of the arena was a sea of black and gold, the Penguins colors, and cheers that only supported the Penguins. As time was ticking down with a tied game, the roars from the fans gave inspiration to the Penguins as they came out and scored with only two minutes remaining in the game. This strong fan

49

base allowed for the Penguins to come out victorious in the contest as the fans influenced them to play better. Going into the arena with the backing of the people only inspires a team to prove themselves to be better, thus raising the value of the franchise.

Players

The influence of coaches and fans can have a direct or indirect influence on the value of a team, but players also have an important role to play.

Yao Ming is one player who brought extreme monetary value to his team as he was the first prominently Chinese player in the National Basketball Association (NBA). When he was drafted in 2002, there was not that strong of an international interest in the league, but adding him to the lineup caught the attention of the Chinese sports markets. The NBA was able to begin their expansion into China through Yao Ming, which has allowed for a strong basis as, "relations within social media, television broadcast, and the overall NBA brand continues to expand tremendously within international sports markets" (Rozier 2018). Without the addition of international players, many teams would not have the outreach or the brand that they do.

Moreover, players have an immense impact on the competitive success of teams, even if it is just one player. In football, there are numerous instances when an injured player has caused his team to become less competitive. A prime example of this is the 2008 NFL season when the New England Patriots lost star quarterback Tom Brady in the first week. The team ended up going 11-5 and did not qualify for the playoffs, which is the only time they have not been in the playoffs since drafting Tom Brady. It was the Miami Dolphins who won the division that year, while playing with a healthy roster. As Bill Barnes argues:

> The New England Patriots' fall was driven by the season-ending injury to quarterback Tom Brady in Week 1. And the Dolphins, who won the division in the final week, received 16-game seasons from Pennington, who had played only one other full season in his nine-year career, and Brown, who played his first in four seasons.

Losing a single player can change the outcome for a team. Tom Brady plays a key role in his team's competitive success on the field, and he inspires the players around him. Without him, the Patriots are not the same team and do not have the same value.

Along with bringing competitive success, a player can also bring financial success for his or her team. In addition to what a star player can do to win games, a popular player can attract fans to buy tickets and spend money on concessions and merchandise. An example of on such player is Sidney Crosby for the Pittsburgh Penguins. The Penguins were struggling with their fan base and needed to find a way to say competitively and financially successful. They soon drafted Crosby, along with other stars, in hopes that he could make a large impact for the team, which he did. It was quite clear to see that, "after the draft the

50

revenue started increasing...the team saw financial success" (McGinnis 2013). Crosby and the Penguins would go on to win the Stanley Cup in 2009.

In the interim, Crosby was able to bring his team financial success as everyone wanted to watch him play and buy merchandise with his number. Even if a team is struggling financially or competitively in hockey, one player could change that and bring a dynasty of greatness with them.

Counter-argument

Illustrating the countless instances in which coaches, fans, and players affect the valuation of a franchise is not to say that net worth has no impact. The net worth of a team is significant, but it not the only factor. Consider the top 11 highest-valued National Hockey League (NHL) teams below, which shows the New York Rangers with the highest value.

	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
New York Rangers	507	750	850	1,100	1,200	1,250	1,500
Toronto Maple Leafs	521	1,000	1,150	1,300	1,150	1,100	1,400
Montreal Canadiens	445	575	775	1,000	1,175	1,200	1,250
Chicago Blackhawks	306	350	625	825	925	925	1,000
Boston Bruins	325	348	600	750	750	800	890
Los Angeles Kings	232	276	450	580	580	600	750
Philadelphia Flyers	290	336	500	625	660	720	740
Vancouver Canucks	300	342	700	800	745	700	730
Detroit Red Wings	336	346	470	570	600	625	700
Pittsburgh Penguins	264	288	480	565	560	570	650
Washington Capitals	225	250	414	500	565	570	625

Figure 1: Ice Hockey: NHL Team Valuations (Forbes) (in mil. of $ - add 000,000)

Looking exclusively at net worth is a good way to view how a team is doing financially, but it is not a reflection of a team's true value. This chart is only based off net worth and does not reflect the competitional value that teams have. Note that the Pittsburgh Penguins, which recently won the multiple championships, are ranked only 10th.

Monetary value alone causes people to rank teams poorly, as it does not reflect the overall value of a franchise. Knowing how much a team makes is very important, especially insofar as it captures other elements of a team's potential value, but it is not a complete or accurate picture.

51

Conclusion

It is true that any sport can sometimes be as much about profit as it is about winning. But those are not mutually exclusive goals; nor are they one and the same. To be successful and sustainable, every team needs to have both aspects to get a full view of their value because basing the value from just one does not truly reflect the team.

The influence from coaches and fans on the player helps the team grow in both aspects so to find the true value of a team, one must look at the coaches, fans, and players as they produce successes throughout a season.

References

Abreu, M, & Spradley, B. (2016). The National Football League's Brand and Stadium Opportunities. *The Sport Journal*, 20, http://thesportjournal.org/article/the-national-football-leagues-brand-and-stadium-opportunities/

Barnwell, B. "Some N.F.L. Injuries May Hurt More Than Others." *New York Times*, Sept. 12, 2009.

Coffey, W. (2005). The boys of winter the untold story of a coach, a dream, and the 1980 U.S. Olympic hockey team. New York: Crown.

"College coaches' salaries increase despite threat of new tax." *USA Today*. December 13. 2017.

Forsythe, S. (2015, Summer). The Impact of a Head Coaching Change on Intercollegiate Student-Athletes, https://digitalcommons.wku.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1085&context=diss

Ice Hockey: NHL Team Valuations (Forbes). (2016), http://www.sportsmarketanalytics.com/researchrc.aspx?ResCode=nhltef1

Kendrick, A. (Director). (2006). Facing the Giants [Motion picture]. United States of America: Sherwood Pictures.

McGinnis, R. (2013, Fall). Value of an NHL Player, https://fisherpub.sjfc.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1068&context=sport_undergrad

Rozier, J. (2018, June 14). Organizational Expansion within Professional Sports, https://thesportjournal.org/article/organizational-expansion-within-professional-sports/.