

2010

Evidence of the Boyer Model of Scholarship in Counselor Education

David J. Tobin

Jessica L. Bordonaro

Melissa M. Schmidt

Diana Hulse

Follow this and additional works at: <https://repository.wcsu.edu/jcps>



Part of the [Other Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons](#), and the [Student Counseling and Personnel Services Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Tobin, D. J., Bordonaro, J. L., Schmidt, M. M., & Hulse, D. (2010). Evidence of the Boyer Model of Scholarship in Counselor Education. *The Journal of Counselor Preparation and Supervision*, 2(1). <http://dx.doi.org/10.7729/21.0111>

Evidence of the Boyer Model of Scholarship in Counselor Education

Abstract

This study delineated how the Boyer (1990) model of scholarship has been implemented in counselor education. The taxonomy of scholarship was delineated: Scholarship of Discovery, Scholarship of Teaching, Scholarship of Application, and Scholarship of Integration. The Journal of Counseling and Development and Counselor Education and Supervision were examined from 2000 to 2008. Examples of scholarship from each journal were identified. Evidence of the Boyer model in premier counseling journals suggests a consistency of approach between this model and scholarly activities in counselor education. An expanded view of scholarship may have positive implications for scholarly activity in graduate education and untenured faculty.

Evidence of the Boyer Model of Scholarship in Counselor Education

David J. Tobin, Jessica L. Bordonaro and Melissa M. Schmidt

This study delineated how the Boyer (1990) model of scholarship has been implemented in counselor education. The taxonomy of scholarship was delineated: Scholarship of Discovery, Scholarship of Teaching, Scholarship of Application, and Scholarship of Integration. The *Journal of Counseling and Development* and *Counselor Education and Supervision* were examined from 2000 to 2008. Examples of scholarship from each journal were identified. Evidence of the Boyer model in premier counseling journals suggests a consistency of approach between this model and scholarly activities in counselor education. An expanded view of scholarship may have positive implications for scholarly activity in graduate education and pretenured faculty.

The Boyer (1990) model of scholarship is generally endorsed by counselor educators (Davis, Levitt, McGlothlin, & Hill, 2006; Ramsey, Cavallaro, Kiselica, & Zila, 2002). Boyer (1990) provided a creative and expansive view of scholarly productivity. Scholarship was reconsidered and no longer viewed as synonymous with research, which was often narrow and harmful to universities, faculty, and students (Ramsey et al., 2002). Referred to as the Boyer model (1990), the broader definition includes the following forms of scholarship: discovery, integration, application, and teaching. This model has found increased support in higher education (Halpern et al., 1998; Rice, 1991).

A redefinition of scholarship may have implications for counselor educators. Ramsey et al. (2002) conducted a national survey of counselor educators and their involvement in scholarly activities. They surveyed perceived expectations related to promotion and tenure and stated that “decisions on recruitment, reappointment, tenure, salary, and promotion are all influenced by scholarly productivity” (p. 41). For this survey, they recognized the five forms of scholarship listed in the Boyer

model: 1) journal articles, 2) conference presentations, 3) other published works (e.g., books, monographs, chapters in books), 4) other written works (e.g., grants, training manuals, evaluation reports for external institutions/agencies), 5) scholarly works pertaining to teaching (e.g., new courses, new programs, student/program handbooks, interdisciplinary curricula). Ramsey et al. contended that counselor educators perceived traditional forms of scholarship such as journal articles and presentations to be most valuable for promotion and tenure within their institutions. They encouraged counselor educators to promote a broader view of scholarship.

An expanded view of scholarship may have implications for preparing graduate students to enter a career in academia. Research by Okech et al. (2006) suggested that doctoral research training may not adequately prepare counselor educators for the expectations of the profession. Others have suggested a need to stimulate greater interest in research among counselor education students (Royalty & Reising, 1986). Counselor educators have expressed a lack of student enthusiasm for research and suggested that interest in qualitative research may create a

better connection to academic research and move students from being consumers to producers of research (Reisietter, Korcuska, Yexley, Bonds, Nikles, & McHenry, 2004). Furthermore, a review of manuscripts submitted to *Counselor Education and Supervision* in the early 90s revealed that descriptive studies were the most popular form of counselor education research and comprised 80% of submissions (Fong & Malone, 1994). This implies a lack of sophistication about research design and a narrow view of scholarship.

The purpose of our study was to examine how the Boyer model of scholarship has been implemented in counselor education. According to Bok (1986), "As a result, published research emerges as the common currency of academic achievement, a currency that can be weighed and evaluated across institutional and even national boundaries. It is, therefore, the chief determinant of status within the guild" (p. 77). Since journal articles remain most valuable for promotion, we delineated the taxonomy of scholarship and provided clear examples of published journal articles that meet these classifications. Ramsey et al. (2002) purported a redefinition of scholarship and a "broader spectrum of scholarly productivity measures are required to adequately reflect the uniqueness and diversity of interests within counselor education research" (p. 42). *Scholarship Reconsidered* (Boyer, 1990) represents a persuasive argument to recognize nontraditional forms of scholarship and delineate these in faculty promotion policies. Unfortunately, most of the references to the Boyer model and the taxonomy of scholarship have been theoretical or abstract conceptualizations. We believe that clear delineation of the Boyer model of scholarship in counselor education may help to promote scholarly productivity; especially valuable for pretenured faculty and graduate students. We were able to provide evidence in use of the Boyer model in counselor education. This article provides practical examples of the Boyer taxonomy of scholarship

evidenced in journal articles published within premier professional counseling and counselor education journals.

Scholarship Defined in Counselor Education

Premier counseling journals were examined from 2000 through 2008. The *Journal of Counseling and Development* and *Counselor Education and Supervision* were reviewed and distinct examples were selected that fit within the respective Boyer (1990) classifications: Scholarship of Discovery, Scholarship of Teaching, Scholarship of Application, and Scholarship of Integration. We delineated each classification and cited two representative examples from each journal. These journal articles were selected for their clear delineation of the classification. A summary of each article is included.

Scholarship of Discovery

The Scholarship of Discovery focuses on acquiring new forms of information through research studies. According to Boyer (1990), "Scholarly investigation in all of the disciplines, is at the very heart of academic life and the pursuit of knowledge must be assiduously cultivated and defended" (p. 18). The goal of scholarship is to confront what is yet to be discovered and contribute to human knowledge.

Cashwell, C.S., Shcherbakova, J., & Cashwell, T.H. (2003). Effect of client and counselor ethnicity on preference for counselor disclosure. Journal of Counseling and Development, 81, 196-201.

This article described how ethnicity impacted self-disclosure for both the client and counselor and included African American and Caucasian participants. Results indicated that ethnicity affected how information was disclosed in the counseling relationship (i.e., personal issues

and sexual issues). The article exemplified the Scholarship of Discovery because new information was acquired in regards to ethnicity and preferences for self-disclosure.

Jackson, A.P., & Scharman, J.S. (2002). Constructing family-friendly careers: Mother's experiences. Journal of Counseling and Development, 80, 180-187.

This study examined how counselors can better assist clients in blending work and family life. Twenty-six married mothers were interviewed who were employed in a family-friendly career, which is defined as working less than 30 hours per week and spending adequate time with their families. The Scholarship of Discovery was exemplified in this article; themes were uncovered such as partner/family decision making, work satisfaction, and pleasant stress.

Daniels, J.A., & Larson, L.M. (2001). The impact of performance feedback on counseling self- efficacy and counselor anxiety. Counselor Education and Supervision, 41, 120.

This study described the Scholarship of Discovery because new information was uncovered in regard to false performance feedback on counseling self-efficacy and counselor anxiety. Forty-five participants received bogus positive or negative feedback based on their performance. Results indicated that counseling self- efficacy was altered based on feedback given.

Hayes, E.G., Taub, G.E., Robinson III, E.H., Sivo, S.A. (2003). An empirical investigation of the efficacy of multimedia instruction in counseling skill and development. Counselor Education and Supervision, 42, 177-188.

Multimedia instruction was assessed regarding student's counseling skill development. Seventy- three participants (counselor education students) received ratings on pre- and posttest video counseling sessions. Results indicated no difference among the various types of instruction: high-tech multimedia, low-tech multimedia, and traditional instruction and is appropriate for inclusion in the Scholarship of Discovery.

Scholarship of Teaching

The Scholarship of Teaching entices and educates future scholars through teaching and the learning process. This scholarship is related to pedagogical practices and includes articles on supervision, the process of literature reviews, and how to access resources. The most important aspect of The Scholarship of Teaching is to acquire knowledge through strategies and interventions which may improve the education of students.

Burnett, P.C., & Meacham, D. (2002). Learning journals as a counseling strategy. Journal of Counseling and Development, 80, 410-415.

The authors examined how learning journals can be used as a counseling strategy to enhance a therapist's style of counseling. This article is appropriate for the Scholarship of Teaching because knowledge is gained on how learning journals may lead to positive transformation in client outcomes. Recommendations for practice are further explored through the use of learning journals.

Huhra, R.L., Yamokoski-Maynhart, C.A., & Prieto, L.R. (2008). Reviewing videotape in supervision: A developmental approach. Journal of Counseling and Development, 86, 412-418.

This study supports the Scholarship of Teaching through a focus on supervision. Existing literature is reviewed on the use of videotape technology in supervision and the importance of feedback. Guidelines are offered on how to utilize videotape feedback to strengthen counseling skills. Future research is warranted in this area.

Higgins, J.A., & Dermer, S. (2001). The use of film in marriage and family counselor education. Counselor Education and Supervision, (40), 182-192.

This study fits the Scholarship of Teaching through the exploration and use of film in marriage and family counselor education curriculum. Films were used to support the development of counseling skills (i.e. perceptual, conceptual, and executive). Highlights for the use of film in counselor education, as well as strategies for classroom use are provided.

Akos, P., & Galassi, J.P. (2004). Training school counselors as developmental advocates. Counselor Education and Supervision, 43, 192-206.

This article described the importance of training school counselors to promote positive student development. Counselors were encouraged to be developmental advocates by providing an environment suitable for positive outcomes. This article fits the Scholarship of Teaching model since it emphasized the importance of acquiring knowledge to improve the educational outcomes of students. Information included developmental research and curricular examples that highlighted developmental advocacy.

Scholarship of Application

The Scholarship of Application seeks to address how knowledge can be applied to problems and issues in society. The purpose of this scholarship is to identify solutions for social problems. Boyer (1990) contends, "New intellectual understandings can arise out of the very act of application – whether in medical diagnosis, serving clients in psychotherapy, shaping public policy, creating architectural design, or working with the public schools" (p. 23). The Scholarship of Application goes beyond academia and integrates knowledge from one's field to the community.

Fletcher, T.B., & Hinkle, J.S. (2002). Adventure based counseling: An innovation in counseling. Journal of Counseling and Development, 80, 277-285.

This article exemplified for the Scholarship of Application because it provided an innovative way to help clients identify solutions for their problems. Adventure Based Counseling (ABC) offers a hands-on experience for clients that is physical in nature. ABC is beneficial because it helps clients transfer their gains to everyday situations and allows them to experience social, psychological, and spiritual benefits.

Curtis, R.C., & Juhnke, G.A. (2003). Counseling the client with prostate cancer. Journal of Counseling and Development, 81, 160-167.

This article described solutions for counselors dealing with clients diagnosed with prostate cancer and fits the Scholarship of Application model. Counselors with information necessary to direct counseling sessions and help clients resolve their issues. A diagnosis of prostate cancer may result in physical, emotional, and social change as well

as difficulties in interpersonal relationships.

Thomas, S.R. (2005). The school counselor alumni peer consultation group. Counselor Education and Supervision, 45, 16-29.

The Scholarship of Application model exemplified in this article as strategies for school counselors and counselor educators were identified. New school counselors often experience lack of support and isolation. The importance of partnership activities and collaboration was further explained.

Van Velsor, P.R., & Cox, D.L. (2000). Use of the collaborative drawing technique in school counseling practicum: An illustration of family systems. Counselor Education and Supervision, 40, 141-152.

This article provided an overview of brief family interventions and family assessment procedures. This fits the Scholarship of Application because it can be used in several community settings such as in the home and school. The Collaborative Drawing Technique (CDT) teaches counselors-in-training how to effectively work with families.

Scholarship of Integration

The basic premise of the Scholarship of Integration is to make connections across various disciplines to increase knowledge. This scholarship synthesizes, interprets, and connects various disciplines in order to enlighten and educate a variety of professionals. Examples include the combination of two disciplines such as medicine and counseling or sociology and research. Typically, constructs from other disciplines were integrated into counselor education.

Moore III, J.L. (2005). A call for greater collaboration between the counseling

psychology and school counseling professions. Journal of Counseling and Development, 83, 504-508.

The Scholarship of Integration is described in this article through the need for more collaboration between counseling psychologists and school counseling professionals. The article summarized difference in opinions on this subject and provided implications for the field of counseling psychology.

Paradise, L.V., & Kirby, P.C. (2005). The treatment and prevention of depression: Implications for counseling and counselor training. Journal of Counseling and Development, 83, 116-119.

This article integrated the Scholarship of Discovery and Scholarship of Application. The authors discovered that psychotherapy approaches are as beneficial as pharmacological treatment. The article provided an analysis of psychopharmacology and presented implications on how outcome research can be applied to the counseling profession.

Granello, D.H. (2001). Promoting cognitive complexity in graduate written work: Using Bloom's taxonomy as a pedagogical tool to improve literature reviews. Counselor Education and Supervision, 40, 292-307.

The Scholarship of integration was described in this article. The article provides instructions on how to use Bloom's Taxonomy to organize and structure papers. Students can then apply learning to write at more cognitively advanced levels in graduate level courses.

Barbee, P.W., Scherer, D., & Combs, D.C. (2003). Prepracticum service-learning: Examining the relationships with counselor

self-efficacy and anxiety. Counselor Education and Supervision, 43, 108-119.

The Scholarship of integration was exemplified in this article as it describes the importance of prepracticum service-learning in a counselor education program. Prepracticum service-learning correlated strongly with student anxiety. On the contrary, the authors discovered that counseling course work and experience provided a stronger foundation than prepracticum service-learning.

Discussion

The purpose of this study was to examine how the Boyer (1990) model of scholarship has been implemented in counselor education. The taxonomy of scholarship was delineated: Scholarship of Discovery, Scholarship of Teaching, Scholarship of Application, and Scholarship of Integration. The *Journal of Counseling and Development* and *Counselor Education and Supervision* were examined from 2000 to 2008. There were many examples of journal articles within the Boyer classification. We were able to identify two distinct examples of specified scholarship from each journal. Evidence in use of the Boyer model in premier counseling journals suggests a consistency of approach between scholarship reconsidered and scholarly activities in counselor education. We noted it was difficult to locate articles on the Scholarship of Discovery, as well as the Scholarship of Integration in *Counselor Education and Supervision*. Few articles were found on the Scholarship of Integration and the Scholarship of Teaching in the *Journal of Counseling and Development*. The blurred boundaries inherent with the Scholarship of Integration made it challenging to identify a clear classification. We often engaged in reflective discussion to reach consensus on classification. It may prove interesting to illustrate the

classifications of articles found in other national and state level counseling journals.

An expanded view of scholarship may have positive implications for graduate education and mentoring pretenured faculty. According to Boyer (1990), "scholars are academics who conduct research, publish, and then perhaps convey their knowledge to students or apply what they have learned" (p. 15). Furthermore, the term "scholarship brings legitimacy to the full scope of academic work" (Boyer, p. 16). This reaffirms the contention by Ramsey et al. (2002) that a "broader spectrum of scholarly productivity is required to reflect the uniqueness and diversity of interests within counselor education research" (p. 42). Counselor education researchers have expressed a need to stimulate greater interest in research (Royalty & Reising, 1986), move students from being consumers to producers of research (Reisetter, Korcuska, Yexley, Bonds, Nikles, & McHenry, 2004), and better prepare counselor educators for the expectations of the profession (Okech, Astramovich, Johnson, Hoskins, & Rubel, 2006). Acknowledging and embracing an expansionistic view of scholarship may stimulate greater interest in scholarly activity as opposed to more narrowly defined research. Furthermore, our study reveals valuable contributions to the literature made in each of the classifications within the taxonomy of scholarship. It may be prudent to expose graduate research students as well as new faculty to the Boyer model.

A positive outcome of the Boyer model is that it promotes teaching and scholar activity into scholarly productivity. It is our observation that rethinking scholarship along with institutional support proves encouraging. A contribution of our study was to offer discipline specific examples of the Boyer model applied to published journal articles. Further investigation into the implementation of the Boyer model in counselor education is warranted. Along with increased recognition of the Boyer model, we advocate for

counselor educators and journal editors to develop guidelines on protocol for publishing within the classifications of scholarship reconsidered.

In summary, the Boyer model has been generally recognized in higher education. Evidence in use of this model was revealed in premier counseling journals. This evidence validates the contribution of scholarship reconsidered to scholarly productivity in counselor education.

References

- Akos, P., & Galassi, J.P. (2004). Training school counselors as developmental advocates. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 43*, 192-206.
- Barbee, P.W., Scherer, D., & Combs, D.C. (2003). Prepracticum service-learning: Examining the relationships with counselor self-efficacy and anxiety. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 43*, 108-119.
- Bok, D. (1986). *Higher learning*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Boyer, E.L. (1990). *Scholarship reconsidered. Priorities of the professoriate*. Princeton, NJ: Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching.
- Burnett, P.C., & Meacham, D. (2002). Learning journals as a counseling strategy. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 80*, 410-415.
- Cashwell, C.S., Shcherbakova, J., & Cashwell, T.H. (2003). Effect of client and counselor ethnicity on preference for counselor disclosure. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 81*, 196-201.
- Curtis, R.C., & Juhnke, G.A. (2003). Counseling the client with prostate cancer. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 81*, 160-167.
- Daniels, J.A., & Larson, L.M. (2001). The impact of performance feedback on counseling self-efficacy and counselor anxiety. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 41*, 120.
- Davis, T.E., Levitt, D.H., McGlothlin, J.M., & Hill, N.R. (2006). Perceived expectations related to promotion and tenure: A national survey of CACREP program liaisons. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 46*, 146-156.
- Fletcher, T.B., & Hinkle, J.S. (2002). Adventure based counseling: An innovation in counseling. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 80*, 277-285.
- Fong, M.L., & Malone, C.M. (1994). Defeating ourselves: Common errors in counseling research. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 33*, 356-361.
- Granello, D.H. (2001). Promoting cognitive complexity in graduate written work: Using Bloom's taxonomy as a pedagogical tool to improve literature reviews. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 40*, 292-307.
- Halpern, D.F., Smothergill, D.W., Allen, M., Baker, S., Baum, C., Best, D., et al. (1998). Scholarship in psychology: A paradigm for the twenty-first century. *American Psychologist, 53*, 1292-1297.
- Hayes, E.G., Taub, G.E., Robinson III, E.H., Sivo, S.A. (2003). An empirical investigation of the efficacy of multimedia instruction in counseling skill and development. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 42*, 177-188.
- Higgins, J.A., & Dermer, S. (2001). The use of film in marriage and family counselor education. *Counselor Education and Supervision, (40)*, 182-192.
- Huhra, R.L., Yamokoski-Maynhart, C.A., & Prieto, L.R. (2008). Reviewing videotape in supervision: A developmental approach. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 86*, 412-418.
- Jackson, A.P., & Scharman, J.S. (2002). Constructing family-friendly careers: Mother's experiences. *Journal of*

- Counseling and Development*, 80, 180-187.
- Moore III, J.L. (2005). A call for greater collaboration between the counseling psychology and school counseling professions. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 83, 504-508.
- Okech, J.E.A., Astramovich, R.L., Johnson, M.M., Hoskins, W.J., & Rubel, D.J. (2006). Doctoral research training of counselor education faculty. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 46, 131-145.
- Paradise, L.V., & Kirby, P.C. (2005). The treatment and prevention of depression: Implications for counseling and counselor training. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 83, 116- 119.
- Ramsey, M., Cavallaro, M., Kiselica, M., & Zila, L. (2002). Scholarly productivity redefined in counselor education. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 42, 40-57.
- Reisetter, M., Korcuska, J.S., Yexley, M., Bonds, D., Nikles, H., & McHenry, W. (2004). Counselor educators: Affirming a research identity. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 44, 2-16.
- Rice, R.E. (1991). The new American scholar: Scholarship and the purposes of the university. *Metropolitan Universities*, 1, 7-18.
- Royalty, G.M., & Reising, G.N. (1986). The research training of counseling psychologists: What the professionals say. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 14, 49-60.
- Thomas, S.R. (2005). The school counselor alumni peer consultation group. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 45, 16-29.
- Van Velsor, P.R., & Cox, D.L. (2000). Use of the collaborative drawing technique in school counseling practicum: An illustration of family systems. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 40, 141-152.

Profiles

David J. Tobin, Ph.D. is an Assistant Professor and Director of the Community Counseling Program at Gannon University. Jessica Bordonaro M.S. and Melissa Schmidt M.S. are Family Based Mental Health Therapists at the Dr. Gertrude A. Barber National Institute, Erie, PA. They were former Graduate Assistants in the Community Counseling Program, Gannon University.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.7729/21.0111>